# The Oxidizing Capacity of the Earth's Atmosphere: Probable Past and Future Changes

Anne M. Thompson

The principal oxidants in the lower atmosphere are ozone  $(O_3)$  and two by-products of  $O_3$  photodissociation, the hydroxyl radical (OH) and hydrogen peroxide  $(H_2O_2)$ . A number of critical atmospheric chemical problems depend on the earth's "oxidizing capacity," which is essentially the global burden of these oxidants. There is limited direct evidence for changes in the earth's oxidizing capacity since recent preindustrial times when, because of industrial and population growth, increasing amounts of  $O_3$  precursor trace gases (carbon monoxide, nitrogen oxides, and hydrocarbons) have been released into the atmosphere. The concentrations of  $O_3$  and possibly  $H_2O_2$  have increased over large regions. Models predict that tropospheric  $O_3$  will increase ~0.3 to 1% per year over the next 50 years with both positive and negative trends possible for OH and  $H_2O_2$ . Models and the observational network for oxidants are improving, but validation of global models is still at an early stage.

The earth's atmosphere is an oxidizing atmosphere. The principal oxidants are  $O_3$ , the OH radical, and  $H_2O_2$ . Each of these constituents reacts chemically with different species and plays an important role in the atmosphere. The concentration of  $O_3$  is used to assess regional air quality (1). Concentrations of  $O_3$  range from a few parts per billion by volume (ppbv) in less polluted areas to more than 100 ppbv in areas polluted by industrial activity or burning of biomass. Much of the current interest in global distributions of tropospheric  $O_3$ stems from the effectiveness of mid- to upper tropospheric  $O_3$  as a greenhouse gas (2).

The OH radical has been referred to as the "tropospheric vacuum cleaner" (3) because it reacts with hundreds of gases, both natural and anthropogenic. It controls the buildup of pollutants, including the hydrogenated chlorofluorocarbons now being adopted as substitutes for the pure chlorofluorocarbons. This suggests that it is desirable to maintain healthy atmospheric concentrations of this oxidant. On the other hand, higher concentrations of OH lead to more rapid formation of acids that deposit on the earth's surface directly or in precipitation. Nitrogen and sulfur oxides are converted, respectively, to nitric and sulfuric acid; nonmethane hydrocarbons (NMHC) are oxidized to organic acids after reaction with OH. Hydrogen peroxide also contributes to acid precipitation because it is the oxidant that converts SO<sub>2</sub> to sulfuric acid in cloud and rain droplets at low pH (4).

Thus,  $O_3$ , OH, and  $H_2O_2$  are key players in a number of environmental problems,

and there is considerable interest in whether their atmospheric concentrations are changing over time. The total atmospheric burden of  $O_3$ , OH, and  $H_2O_2$  determines the "oxidizing capacity" of the atmosphere (5). As a result of the multiple interactions among the three oxidants and the multiphase activity of  $H_2O_2$ , there is no single expression that defines the earth's oxidizing capacity (6). Some researchers take the term loosely to mean the total global amount of OH, although even this parameter is not defined unambiguously (7).

In this article, I describe the atmospheric chemistry of  $O_3$ , OH, and  $H_2O_2$  and present observational evidence for historical changes in each of the oxidants. Photochemical models are used to interpret the oxidant record in terms of changing atmospheric concentrations of other trace gases (for example, CH<sub>4</sub> or CO) or changing climatic properties. These models are also used to predict concentrations of  $O_3$ , OH, and  $H_2O_2$  over the next 50 to 100 years.

### **Oxidants in Atmospheric Chemistry**

Ozone, OH, and  $H_2O_2$  interact with each other and with other key trace gases in a variety of ways (Fig. 1). Ozone interconverts atmospheric odd nitrogen (NO, NO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>3</sub>), hydrogen (OH and HO<sub>2</sub>), halogens, and sulfur and readily oxidizes unsaturated hydrocarbons. The major photochemical loss process for O<sub>3</sub> in the troposphere (0 to 15 km) leads to formation of the OH radical. This occurs by way of reaction between the transient O(<sup>1</sup>D) and water vapor, following formation of O(<sup>1</sup>D) from O<sub>3</sub> by photodissociation in the near-ultraviolet:

SCIENCE • VOL. 256 • 22 MAY 1992

$$O_3 + h\nu \to O(^1D) + O_2 \qquad (R1)$$

$$O(^{1}D) + H_{2}O \rightarrow OH + OH$$
 (R2)

Hydrogen peroxide forms when two  $HO_2$  radicals combine, either in the atmosphere or inside droplets (8):

$$OH + O_3 \rightarrow HO_2 + O_2$$

 $HO_2 + HO_2 \rightarrow H_2O_2 + O_2 \qquad (R3)$ 

Although the formation of OH follows the destruction of  $O_3$  (R1 and R2), subsequent reactions of OH can lead to  $O_3$ formation by conversion of NO to NO<sub>2</sub> (9):

$$OH + CH_4 (+O_2) \rightarrow CH_3O_2 + H_2O (R4)$$

or

$$OH + CO (+O_2) \rightarrow CO_2 + HO_2$$
 (R5)

followed by

$$CH_3O_2 + NO \rightarrow NO_2 + CH_3O$$
 (R6)

or

$$HO_2 + NO \rightarrow NO_2 + OH$$
 (R7)

$$NO_2 + hv \rightarrow O + NO$$
 (R8)

$$O + O_2 (+M) \rightarrow O_3 + M$$
 (R9)

With reactions R1 through R9 occurring simultaneously, the processes in R4 and R5 do not represent 100% losses for OH. In regions with sufficient concentrations of reactive NMHC from pollution or from vegetative emission of isoprene, an OH oxidation analogous to R4 produces an organic peroxy radical,  $RO_2$  that can also convert NO to  $NO_2$  (R7), leading to  $O_3$ formation. In a low-NMHC environment



**Fig. 1.** The roles of the oxidants  $O_3$ , OH, and  $H_2O_2$  in atmospheric photochemical reactions.

1157

The author is with the National Aeronautics and Space Administration (NASA) Goddard Space Flight Center, Laboratory for Atmospheres, Greenbelt, MD 20771.

(usually polar or remote marine regions), up to 75% of OH loss is by reaction with CO and the remainder with  $CH_4$ .

In that atmospheric  $CH_4$  is increasing globally, currently at a rate of 0.5 to 1% per year (10, 11), the chain of reactions R1 to R9 suggests that, even if the concentrations of other trace gases did not change, increasing emissions of  $CH_4$  could be perturbing background concentrations of  $O_3$ , OH, and  $H_2O_2$  (12–16). Ozone would be expected to increase in response to higher concentrations of  $CH_4$ .

The tendencies for OH and  $H_2O_2$  to change as CH<sub>4</sub> (or CO, NO, or NMHC) emissions increase depend on unperturbed CO, hydrocarbon, and NO<sub>x</sub> concentrations because of feedbacks among these species. Consider the reactions that determine the equilibrium concentration of OH:

$$\frac{[O(^{1}D)][H_{2}O]}{k_{R4}[CH_{4}] + k_{R5}[CO] + \sum_{i}' k_{i} [NMHC_{i}]}$$

where the k's represent rate coefficients for reactions between OH and the species that it oxidizes (17). The denominator shows that NMHC and CO suppress OH concentrations in the initial oxidation, but subsequent reactions formed in those processes produce  $O_3$ , which contributes to OH via R1 and R2. In particular, NO concentrations are pivotal in CH<sub>4</sub>-CO-hydrocarbon-O<sub>3</sub>-OH feedbacks. If sufficient NO is present to make the processes in R6, R7 (and analogous reactions with oxygenated hydrocarbons) efficient,  $O_3$  may be formed sufficiently fast for OH formation to dominate as CH<sub>4</sub> emissions increase.

Thus, the formation of oxidants is complex, with tropospheric OH and  $O_3$  concentrations depending nonlinearly with simultaneously varying emissions (surface fluxes) of CH<sub>4</sub> and NO. This complicates calculation of oxidant concentrations by photochemical models, particularly those that simulate an urban-influenced environment. Consider a model in which NO<sub>x</sub> ranges from 1 to 2 ppbv and unperturbed O<sub>3</sub> is 60 ppbv (Fig. 2A). With higher emissions of NO, an increasing CH<sub>4</sub> flux adds to tropospheric OH. However, beyond a certain point, increasing NO emissions suppress OH because removal of OH by NO<sub>2</sub> to form HNO<sub>3</sub> becomes effective:

$$OH + NO_2 + M \rightarrow HNO_3 + M$$
 (R10)

Nitric acid, with a photochemical lifetime of several days, is a reservoir for OH and  $NO_2$ , which otherwise cycle in a matter of seconds between  $HO_2$  and NO, respectively (Fig. 1). At very low surface NO fluxes (as in a remote marine tropical environment), additional  $CH_4$  emissions suppress OH concentrations under nearly all conditions (Fig. 2B).

1158

Beyond a certain concentration of  $NO_x$ ,  $O_3$  production also becomes less efficient (18, 19) and is further complicated by the presence of hydrocarbons. Atmospheric hydrocarbon concentrations range from low levels in the marine atmosphere (total NMHC as an equivalent amount of carbon is <1 ppbv C, consisting of low molecular weight alkanes and alkenes) to hundreds of parts per billion by volume C in an urban area (for example, alkanes, alkenes, and aromatics from combustion) or in a forested region (isoprene that is very reactive with OH and terpenes).

#### Modeling Atmospheric Oxidants

Evaluation of past and future oxidant trends requires photochemical models that can simulate changes in  $O_3$ , OH, and  $H_2O_2$ concentrations under the influence of changing emissions of trace gases (CO, NO, NMHC, for example) on a global scale. The chemical reactions and physical processes in a model are considered valid for making future predictions if they reproduce



Fig. 2. Tropospheric OH response to changes in CH<sub>4</sub> and NO emissions. Tropospheric OH is defined as the total column abundance between the surface and 15 km. (A) Initial conditions (1,1,1) correspond to a composition typical of urban-influenced mid-latitude regions: ~60 ppbv O<sub>3</sub>, 1.4 ppbv NO<sub>x</sub> (NO<sub>x</sub> = NO + NO2); 380 ppbv CO. (B) Initial conditions (1,1,1) correspond to a composition typical of marine tropics: ~20 ppbv O3, 5 pptv NO, 90 ppbv CO. Normalized CH<sub>4</sub> fluxes are 8 × 10<sup>10</sup>  $cm^{-2} s^{-1}$  for the urban region and 1  $\times$  10<sup>11</sup> cm<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> for the marine region. Normalized NO fluxes at (1,1,1) are  $7 \times 10^{10}$  cm<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> for the urban region and 7  $\times$  10<sup>8</sup> cm<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> for the marine region. [Reprinted with permission from (18); Pergamon Press]

SCIENCE • VOL. 256 • 22 MAY 1992

present observations and past trends. For example, photochemical reaction schemes with hundreds of processes involving hydrocarbons and their oxidation by-products can be validated in regional-scale models that have been developed to devise pollutant control strategies (20). Experiments conducted in smog chambers provide some constraint, but so far there is no single "best" set of chemical reactions. Thus, each model uses the reaction scheme that best simulates the constituent of interest, for example, O<sub>3</sub> in air quality models and H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> for acid deposition models.

Models are further complicated when oxidant reactions in condensed phases (for example, aerosols, cloud, rain droplets) and on particle surfaces are introduced into the reaction scheme (21). Simulations show that cloud scavenging of free radicals may significantly modify oxidant concentrations (22), but there are not sufficient observations to confirm this. Mechanistic complexities imply inherent uncertainties in calculating concentrations of O3, OH, and  $H_2O_2$ . Even the relatively uncomplicated models that are used to simulate nonpolluted environments (20 to 30 trace species and fewer than 100 photochemical reactions) propagate imprecisions from reaction rate coefficients as measured in the laboratory (23, 24). One study suggests that kinetic uncertainties in a typical CH<sub>4</sub>-CO-OH-NO<sub>x</sub>-O<sub>3</sub> reaction scheme introduce  $\sim$ 25% uncertainty into a calculation of the global OH concentration (Fig. 3).

Calculations of oxidant changes have been conducted with one- (1D), two- (2D), and three-dimensional (3D) models. The 1D models give only vertical profiles of trace gases and are useful for determining the sensitivity of chemical composition to changes in emissions or to other processes that are reasonably parameterized to one dimension (for example, radiation). Several 1D models compute regional changes in O<sub>3</sub>, OH, and H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> for different types of chemical environments (15, 25) and average over the regions to estimate global oxidant changes.

The 2D models treat latitudinal variations in atmospheric variables (mixing times, temperature, moisture, solar insolation, stratospheric injection of O3 and odd nitrogen, source strengths) with zonally averaged parameters (26-30). This approach is inadequate for representing extremes in emissions of short-lived nitrogen oxides and hydrocarbons and their subsequent O3 formation (31). A recent study with a 3D model demonstrated that zonally averaging NO<sub>x</sub> and hydrocarbon emissions may overestimate O<sub>3</sub> and OH concentrations in the low-altitude tropics and at northern midlatitudes (32). The OH overestimate implies an underestimate in the amount of  $CH_4$ , for

which OH is the dominant photochemical sink. This would lead to an error in a climate model that calculates radiative forcings from specified concentrations of  $CH_4$  and other greenhouse gases (33).

The 3D models offer the potential of more accurate simulation of oxidants because they can resolve regions of extreme chemical source variability and other physical characteristics for which longitudinal averaging is probably not meaningful, for example, convection (34), cloudiness, precipitation, and surface uptake rates. Even so, for model integrations over long time periods (for example, to look at O<sub>3</sub> and OH and their interactions with climate) processes on scales smaller than the physical grid of the model must be parameterized.

### Probable Past Oxidant Changes

Ozone. Although it is obvious that urban regions of high  $O_3$  are a relatively recent

**Fig. 3.** The fractional uncertainty  $[s = (1\sigma/\mu) \times$ 100] in the computed OH concentration from a Monte Carlo study with a 1D photochemical model (24). The distribution of OH mixing ratios from 400 model runs is shown. Mixing ratios for 24 species (some illustrated in Fig. 1) are computed in every run. For each constituent the continuity equation includes nonvarying transport and photochemical production and loss terms from among 73 reactions (free radical formation, propagation, and recombination processes). In every simulation the rate coefficient for each process is chosen randomly from recommended values based on laboratory measurements. Mean values and  $1\sigma$  imprecisions for the coefficients are given in (23). There are 24 processes in the model involving reaction with OH. The fractional uncertainty varies with the mean value, that is, atmospheric

**Fig. 4.** A comparison of monthly mean surface O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratios from the 1970s and 1980s compared to observations from Montsouris, France, in the 1880s (*36*). The weak maximum in the Montsouris record is evident during spring

record is evident during spring when dynamical exchange of  $O_3$ from stratosphere to troposphere is most active. In the modern-day record, the maximum (79) has shifted to July when the peak in solar ultraviolet insolation occurs, and the amount of  $O_3$  produced in the lower atmosphere from reactions of combustion-derived CO, NO<sub>x</sub>, and hydrocarbons exceeds the amount of  $O_3$  transported downward from the stratosphere. [From (80) as reported in (33)] and widespread phenomenon, from the viewpoint of global oxidizing capacity O3 concentrations in nonurban (background) locations and in the free troposphere are of most interest. Observations rarely predate the 1960s, although records of surface O<sub>3</sub> made in the last century at nonurban Western Europe and North American sites show clear evidence for long-term changes in O<sub>3</sub> concentrations in these places. For example, the monthly mean concentration of surface O<sub>3</sub> recorded at Montsouris outside Paris in the 1870s to 1880s (35, 36) was half as high as nonurban O3 means from background sites in the 1970s and 1980s in Canada, the United States, and Germany during winter and 1/3 to 1/5 as high during summer (Fig. 4).

The modern record from which global tropospheric  $O_3$  trends are derived is taken from surface monitoring at a few sites and from vertical profiles collected at roughly two dozen locations at varying intervals by balloon- or rocket-borne ozonesondes



conditions. The case shown is based on mean  $O_{3^{*}}$  NO<sub>x</sub>, and CO conditions for a nonpolluted continental environment. In a more polluted environment the fractional uncertainty in OH may exceed 60%.



SCIENCE • VOL. 256 • 22 MAY 1992

(37). Surface O<sub>3</sub> has been monitored continuously at the four baseline sites of the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA) Climate Monitoring and Diagnostics Laboratory (CMDL) since about 1960 (Fig. 5). The two Northern Hemisphere sites show increases in surface O<sub>3</sub> from 1974 to 1989 (37), but the increases at Mauna Loa may be only apparent. The trend  $[+(0.43 \pm 0.34)\%]$ year<sup>-1</sup> from 1974 to 1989] nearly disappears when the maxima from 1981 to 1983 maxima are discounted. At Point Barrow the strongest positive trend occurs for measurements in July, as would be expected from the interaction of increasing levels of pollutants with maximum solar insolation, but O<sub>3</sub> concentrations have also increased in autumn during lower insolation.

At the South Pole CMDL site, surface  $O_3$  has been decreasing at an increasing rate (Fig. 5). The trend for 1974 to 1989 is  $-(0.38 \pm 0.27)\%$  year<sup>-1</sup>, but summertime  $O_3$  decreased by 15 to 20% from 1976 to 1989, apparently as a result of stratospheric  $O_3$  depletion during austral spring and summer (38). Stratospheric  $O_3$  depletion allows more than normal amounts of ultraviolet



**Fig. 5.** Monthly mean surface  $O_3$  at four CMDL stations (*81*) showing trends (dashed lines) from 1973 to 1989. Trends from 1973 to 1989 are superimposed on monthly mean  $O_3$  mixing ratios. The variation in seasonal behavior among the four sites reflects local differences in photochemistry, stratosphere-troposphere exchange processes, and deposition to the surface. [After (*37*)]



**Fig. 6.** Tropospheric residual  $O_3$  (annual mean distribution) from TOMS and SAGE satellite observations (43). Note the maximum in the tropics west of Africa as well as high values in northerm mid-latitude industrialized regions.

light to penetrate to the troposphere (39). This leads to tropospheric  $O_3$  destruction (R1), which is not offset by  $O_3$ -forming processes (R4 through R9) because concentrations of NO<sub>x</sub> are too low at the South Pole (40). Surface  $O_3$  depletion at the South Pole may be the first evidence that stratospheric  $O_3$  depletion is modifying tropospheric  $O_3$  (41).

Ideally, global monitoring of a highly variable gas such as O3 is done from space. Although tropospheric O<sub>3</sub> is not directly measured from any currently operational satellite, a method of using satellite data to deduce the total thickness of tropospheric O<sub>3</sub> has been developed by Fishman and co-workers (42). The technique is applicable between 50°N and 50°S where the TOMS (Total Ozone Mapping Spectrometer aboard Nimbus 7) gives "total"  $O_3$  between the top of the atmosphere and the earth's surface and the SAGE instrument (Stratospheric Aerosols and Gases Experiment aboard the Earth Radiation Budget satellite) gives the stratospheric O<sub>3</sub> column. The difference between column O<sub>3</sub> from TOMS and stratospheric O<sub>3</sub> as registered by SAGE is called the "tropospheric residual," usually reported in Dobson units (DU; one DU =  $2.69 \times 10^{16}$ molecules of  $O_3$  per square centimeter) (43). The tropospheric residual is a good approximation to the total depth of tropospheric O3 and correlates well with ozonesonde measurements at the mid-tropospheric level, that is, 500 mbar (42).

The tropospheric residual (Fig. 6) gives a remarkable picture of global distributions and seasonal patterns of  $O_3$ . In particular, measurements from 1979 to 1990 show that the highest values of the tropospheric residual (35 DU or more) were confined to northern mid-latitudes (25° to 50°N), except for a region in the tropics west of Africa. Distinct seasonal changes are evident in both the Northern Hemisphere

and the Southern Hemisphere. The maximum in the Northern Hemisphere occurs in July with values >40 DU found over Europe and downwind of Asia. The principal cause, as sonde and surface O<sub>3</sub> records suggest, is widespread industrial pollution. In the Southern Hemisphere tropospheric O3 residuals are highest during the austral late winter and spring, possibly as a result of a large influx of  $O_3$  from the stratosphere. From September to November, however, the highest tropospheric  $O_3$ residual in the Southern Hemisphere is found off the African coast; it may be associated with urban pollution and the burning of biomass on the African and South American continents (43, 44). The satellite data suggest that the tropical burning source of O<sub>3</sub> may be increasing (44). The apparent tropospheric  $O_3$  increase may account for the lack of a negative total O<sub>3</sub> (stratosphere + troposphere) trend as derived from TOMS (45).

The OH radical. To many researchers the questions of changing oxidizing capacity and changes in global OH are synonymous because the total amount of OH determines the atmospheric lifetime of gases such as CH₄ and hydrogenated chlorofluorocarbons that are greenhouse gases and interact with stratospheric  $O_3$  (46). Thus, models that predict tropospheric O<sub>3</sub> forcings on global climate and O3 depletion depend critically on being able to determine OH changes. However, with a mean concentration of ~10<sup>6</sup> molecules cm<sup>-3</sup> (approximately one in 50 trillion), OH is too dilute to measure except in isolated conditions by long-path length absorption (47) or complex laser techniques (48). Thus, direct monitoring of OH is not practical.

Two approaches to tracking trends in global OH are used: (i) models that compute OH from a fairly complete set of chemical reactions, assuming changing concentrations or emissions of more stable gases; (ii) a network of observations called the Atmospheric Lifetime Experiment (ALE) and its successor, the Global Atmospheric Gases Experiment (GAGE), that define an experiment from which OH can be derived with a suitable model (49). The idea of the ALE and GAGE experiments is simple. Select a manufactured trace gas with well-defined sources that reacts with OH at a known rate and monitor concentrations of the compound over time at a series of background stations. The compound is 1,1,1-trichloroethane (CH<sub>3</sub>CCl<sub>3</sub>, commonly called methyl chloroform), and five background stations have been used since the late 1970s. Using the first 7 years of ALE-GAGE data, Prinn and co-workers (49) derived a global OH concentration of

**Table 1.** Model-calculated changes in global OH. AREAL, Atmospheric Research and Exposure Assessment Laboratory; OGI, Oregon Graduate Institute; GSFC, Goddard Space Flight Center; n.a., not available; NH, Northern Hemisphere; SH, Southern Hemisphere.

Model and type	Refer- ence	Current global OH (10 <sup>6</sup> cm <sup>-3</sup> )*	OH change since preindustrial time	OH change since LGM
Harvard University (1D)	(56)	n.a.	60% loss	150% loss†
Cambridge University (2D)	(30)	0.95	NH: 50% loss SH: 20% gain	
Max Planck (2D)	(82)	0.91	NH: 50% gain to 40% loss SH: 20–40% loss	30-40% loss
Max Planck (3D)	(83)	0.6–0.80	NH: 10–20% gain SH: 10–20% loss	
USEPA/AREAL (1D)	(55)	0.6	4% loss	20% loss
OGI (multi-1D)	(25)	0.8	11% loss	40% loss
GSFC (multi-1D)	(53)	0.6	20% loss	32% loss

\*Global average refers to volume average over model domain. †LGM calculation neglected temperature effect on H<sub>2</sub>O vapor.

SCIENCE • VOL. 256 • 22 MAY 1992

 $(7.7 \pm 1.4) \times 10^5$  cm<sup>-3</sup> and a lifetime for  $CH_3CCl_3$  of 6.3 (+1.2, -0.9) years (50). The simplicity of the ALE-GAGE concept has been compromised somewhat by the discoveries that the ocean takes up a small amount of CH<sub>3</sub>CCl<sub>3</sub> (51) and that derived OH depends on the choice of model (46). The ALE-GAGE data have been used to infer a trend in global OH concentrations from 1978 to 1990 (+1.0 ± 0.8% year<sup>-1</sup>), although this conclusion depends strongly on inferred OH for a couple of relatively extreme years (52). A positive trend in global OH would be consistent with a tropical O<sub>3</sub> increase or a H<sub>2</sub>O vapor increase from temperatures increasing during the past decade. An increase in global OH levels could also account for a diminishing rate of atmospheric  $CH_4$  increase (33), that is, a decline in CH<sub>4</sub> lifetime.

What do models say about likely trends in OH? The answer depends on the assumed distribution of CH<sub>4</sub>, CO, NO<sub>x</sub>, and NMHC emissions. Current increases in CH4 and CO concentrations would imply that O<sub>3</sub> concentrations are increasing and OH concentrations are decreasing over time if NO<sub>x</sub> and NMHC emissions are unperturbed. There is no way to track OH by measurements back several hundred years to preindustrial conditions. The only observational constraint is given by  $CH_4$  concentrations in ice cores. Modelers have found that CH4 levels do not narrowly define CO,  $NO_x$ , and NMHC emissions that also affect OH (53). There is consensus that most of the change in CH<sub>4</sub> since 1700 has been driven by increases in CH<sub>4</sub> sources and that lifetime increases (declining OH) are responsible for 10 to 20% of the change (12, 14, 54).

The consensus of several model evaluations of preindustrial OH concentrations (Table 1) is that OH concentrations have decreased globally since the start of preindustrial times with a continuing present-day loss of OH likely over remote Southern Hemisphere regions where  $NO_x$  levels are low (6). Both 2D and 3D model calculations show that, globally, the present OH concentrations are 10 to 30% lower than the values in the period 1200 to 1800.

Several models have attempted to simulate conditions of the Last Glacial Maximum (LGM, 18,000 years ago) using the ice-core record of  $CH_4$  concentrations and temperatures and assumed emissions of CO, NO, and NMHC that are based on scaling back contemporary budgets (25, 55, 56). At 18,000 years ago atmospheric  $CH_4$  concentrations were  $350 \pm 30$  ppbv compared to 1700 to 1800 ppbv today (57). The lower temperatures are assumed to produce an environment lower in water vapor than present day, hence a slower rate of OH formation (by R2). The model results suggest that OH concentrations were higher

Fig. 7. Increase in H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> dissolved in the Eurocore sample from Summit. Greenland (72°N) (61). A similar increase appears in two recent drillings at Dye 3 in south Greenland. The observation that ice-core H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> levels in Antarctica are much lower than at Greenland may result from differences in temperature, precipitation, and ice accumulation rates rather than from atmospheric H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> concentrations (61). [Reprinted by permission from (61). Copyright © 1991 Macmillan Magazines Ltd.]



than present-day results, but not much greater than OH concentrations from 1200 to 1800 (Table 1). The tendency for lower CH<sub>4</sub> and CO concentrations to coexist with higher OH concentrations in the LGM is offset by a cooler atmosphere, which cuts down the rate of OH formation from O<sub>3</sub> photodissociation. Although these results are instructive about CH<sub>4</sub>-CO-OH feedbacks (25, 55, 58), the reliability of model estimates of OH in ancient atmospheres is severely restricted by lack of chemical data and uncertain assessments of biogenic NO, CO, and NMHC fluxes during a cooler climate. Ideally, it would be desirable to infer historical OH by using a model and ice-core measurements of a trace gas uncoupled from the CH<sub>4</sub>-CO-NO<sub>x</sub>-OH-NMHC-O<sub>3</sub> cycle.

Hydrogen peroxide. Hydrogen peroxide, which forms in gaseous and condensed phases and is subject to washout by precipitation, is not easily monitored (59). A record of changes in background  $H_2O_2$ concentrations has been derived from analysis of  $H_2O_2$  in ice cores at remote permafrost locations in Greenland and Antarctica (60). Interpretation of the ice-core record is complicated by handling of the sample, long-term instability of  $H_2O_2$  in ice, and the relation of atmospheric  $H_2O_2$  concentrations to the ice accumulation process (60, 61). Two recently drilled cores in Greenland, one at 65°N and one at 72°N, show distinct temporal trends (Fig. 7). In the Eurocore sample that goes back to 1300, ice formed in the first 400 years shows a stable mean  $H_2O_2$  concentration; from 1700 to 1989 there was a 50% increase in dissolved  $H_2O_2$ , with most of the increase during the past 20 years. In contrast, sampling of ice at Siple Station, Antarctica, shows no trend over the past 83 years, but this may reflect a problem with H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> stability in the samples (61). If the recent decreases in surface O3 at the summertime South Pole (38) are due to more ultraviolet light, the loss of O3 would be expected to give more OH,  $HO_2$ , and  $H_2O_2$  (16).

#### **Probable Future Oxidant Changes**

Future changes in atmospheric oxidizing capacity are predicted by models that calculate  $O_3$ , OH, and  $H_2O_2$  distributions based on assumed scenarios of trace gas emissions (62). Although many chemical processes and feedback mechanisms are understood, the task of making reliable oxidant predictions on a global scale continues to be complicated by several factors. There are large uncertainties in budgets for NO<sub>x</sub>,

**Table 2.** Model predictions of global  $O_3$  increases with continued high-growth scenarios. GISS, Goddard Institute for Space Studies; AMAC, Assessment Model for Atmospheric Composition; GSFC, Goddard Space Flight Center; NH, Northern Hemisphere; SH, Southern Hemisphere.

Model and type	Refer- ence	Annual increase in tropical O <sub>3</sub> (%)
SISS/AMAC* (0D+rad.)	(76)	+0.5
GSFC* (multi-1D)	(15)	+0.5
Jniversity of Oslo* (2D)	(75)	+0.2
Cambridge University (2D)	( <i>28</i> ) ( <i>30</i> )	SH: +0.6; NH: 1.5
Max Planck (1D+rad.)	(66)	SH: +0.2; NH: 1

\*Models ran the same scenarios in an intercomparison study (62).

SCIENCE • VOL. 256 • 22 MAY 1992

CO, and hydrocarbon emissions that lead to oxidant formation. For example, the sharp increase in  $CH_4$  observed over the past 30 years has slowed down for the past few years. This may be temporary or it could mean that  $CH_4$  source increases are slowing down. On a global basis the other O<sub>3</sub> precursors—NMHC, CO, and NO have sources that are roughly half natural and half anthropogenic. Thus, it is difficult to predict future growth in emissions from energy consumption, deforestation, biomass burning, and aircraft.

Models for the assessment of future tropospheric composition need to be computationally efficient and validated with observations, which are uneven in coverage, even for O3. Three-dimensional chemicaltransport models are not yet practical for running multiple scenarios. Although several 2D tropospheric models have been developed for oxidant assessments (26-30), there is not an intercompared set of models for estimating uncertainty limits on projections (63). Furthermore, doubts remain about whether 2D models can be validated, given extreme regional variability in sources. Finally, tropospheric oxidants will respond to processes associated with strato-



**Fig. 8.** Percentage change in tropospheric  $O_3$  (column-integrated from 0 to 15 km) calculated with a 1D model that simulates chemically distinct regions [four each in (**A**) and (**B**)]. A moderately high growth rate scenario [ICF scenario 8 in (*15*) and (*62*)] is illustrated. Mean growth rates for emissions are CH<sub>4</sub>, +1.3% year<sup>-1</sup>; NO, +0.5% year<sup>-1</sup>; CO, +0.06% year<sup>-1</sup>; predicted increases in CO and NO concentrations are not uniformly distributed over all regions. [Adapted from (*15*)]

spheric  $O_3$  depletion and climate change. Potential effects on oxidants from a warmer climate are presumably both positive and negative in direction, but the net forcings are unknown (15, 16, 64–66).

Ozone. There is little doubt that continuing growth in emissions of CH<sub>4</sub>, NO, CO, and hydrocarbons will tend to increase tropospheric O3. The questions are how rapidly and where will maximum and minimum growth areas be? Projections of emissions are usually prepared for policy-makers and are based on econometric models that use data for population growth, energy and food demand, land-use programs, and effects of shifting technological options. Emissions growth rates similar to today's define "business-as-usual" scenarios; this means increases of 1 to 2% year<sup>-1</sup> in total (global) emissions of anthropogenic  $CH_4$ , CO, NO, and NMHC.

A number of model studies have been conducted to predict tropospheric oxidant changes over the next 30 to 100 years (Table 2). The range in projected  $O_3$  increases reflects different rates of increase for  $CH_4$ , CO, and NO emissions and different geographical distributions of sources for these gases, including in some cases, lightning and upper tropospheric aircraft sources of NO<sub>x</sub> (46, 67, 68). A typical business-asusual type scenario with a global mean NO, increase of 0.5 to 0.6% year<sup>-1</sup> shows that tropospheric  $O_3$  will increase 0.5% year<sup>-1</sup>. However, in regions where NO and CO increases are expected to be rapid (over populated parts of Asia, for example), O<sub>3</sub> increases will approach 1% year<sup>-1</sup> (Fig. 8).

Several model studies have been conducted to estimate the effects of stratospheric  $O_3$  depletion on tropospheric  $O_3$ . The effect of increased penetration of ultraviolet radiation into the troposphere (that is, higher photodissociation rates) is to increase  $O_3$  formation in urban regions (39, 69, 70). However, on a global basis, lower tropospheric O3 concentrations are expected to result from stratospheric O<sub>3</sub> depletion because of the dominance of the losses (R1 and R2) in large nonpolluted (low NO<sub>x</sub>) regions (40). This forcing could oppose the tendency for tropospheric O<sub>3</sub> to increase as  $CH_4$ , CO, and  $NO_x$  emissions grow. A further moderating effect on a tropospheric  $O_3$  increase could be a warmer climate if the major perturbation is a greater concentration of  $H_2O$  vapor. Normally  $O_3$  and  $H_2O$ vapor are anticorrelated in the troposphere because higher concentrations of H<sub>2</sub>O cause O<sub>3</sub> loss through reactions R1 and R2 (64, 71). Thus, in one study a model prediction of tropospheric O<sub>3</sub> increasing 10% over the next 50 years shifts to a 6% increase if stratospheric O<sub>3</sub> declines 10% during the same period (15). A temperature increase of 2°C at the surface adds enough

SCIENCE • VOL. 256 • 22 MAY 1992

 $H_2O$  vapor to reduce the projected increase in tropospheric  $O_3$  to only 2% over 50 years. This result is based on a simplified model that does not include possible feedback effects of a warmer climate on biogenic emissions of gases such as  $CH_4$ . Localized meteorological changes, for example, additional cloud cover, precipitation, turbulence, and surface characteristics, are also neglected (72).

Studies have examined the effects of controlling emissions of  $O_3$  precursor gases (62). Controlling emissions of  $CH_4$  and CO can cut the growth rate in tropospheric  $O_3$  approximately in half (Fig. 9). Controlling  $CH_4$  emissions may appeal to policy-makers because  $CH_4$ , a greenhouse gas, is expected to contribute ~25% to radiative forcing of climate over the next century (33). One study suggests that, if  $CH_4$  emissions were to be stabilized at 1990 levels, the projected global  $O_3$  increase from 1985 to 2100 would be reduced by two-thirds compared to a business-as-usual  $CH_4$  growth rate (73).

OH changes. In predicting future atmospheric oxidizing capacity, it is the abundance of OH that is most problematic. The growth of  $O_3$  alone would imply that OH concentrations will also increase, but increasing emissions of CH<sub>4</sub>, CO, and NMHC could suppress OH concentrations over large regions (Fig. 10). Background



**Fig. 9.** Percentage change in tropospheric  $O_3$  from 1985 to 2100 calculated with the 2D University of Oslo model. [Adapted from (75). Copyright by A. Deepak Publishing] (**A**) High growth scenario is the same as in Fig. 8 but the period of simulation is longer; (**B**) scenario 2 (low growth) in (15, 62, 75). Mean growth rates are  $CH_4$ , +0.8% year<sup>-1</sup>; NO, +0.5% year<sup>-1</sup>; CO, -0.8% year<sup>-1</sup>. Here the  $CH_4$  growth rate is approximately half the rate as that simulated in (A). The difference in the  $O_3$  increase between (A) and (B) is roughly a factor of 2, illustrating the importance of  $CH_4$  in  $O_3$  formation (46, 73).

 $NO_x$  and NMHC concentrations are pivotal in determining whether OH concentrations increase or decrease in a region. Longer lived nitrogen-containing compounds (for example, peroxyacetyl nitrate and alkyl nitrates) can supply  $NO_x$  to remote locations (26, 74).

One 2D model (75) shows globally averaged OH concentrations increasing <0.1% year<sup>-1</sup> from 1985 to 2100 as NO and CH<sub>4</sub> emissions increase (Fig. 10), although OH concentrations in the upper troposphere increase by a factor of 2 or more. However, a zero-dimensional coupled stratosphere-troposphere climate model (76) and a multibox 1D model (15) both give decreases of 0.3% year<sup>-1</sup> for the same scenario. When a set of eight scenarios is simulated with these three models, annually averaged rates of change for global OH concentrations are +0.4% year<sup>-1</sup> for the zero-dimensional model and -0.3% year<sup>-1</sup> for the other two models (62). That the range of OH predictions from these models is greater than the corresponding projections for tropospheric  $O_3$  (Table 2) illustrates the difficulties of predicting future concentrations of OH. Some of the differences among the models result from differences in the treatment of NO emissions.

Future OH concentrations might also be affected by (i) stratospheric  $O_3$  depletion; (ii) a warming climate; or (iii) perturbations to the upper troposphere and lower stratosphere from civilian aircraft. Effects of stratospheric  $O_3$  depletion have been simulated in several models (40, 64, 77). In general, the addition of ultraviolet radiation means that tropospheric  $O_3$  will photodissociate and form OH more rapidly. Indeed, one model that simulates increasing CH<sub>4</sub>, CO, and NO emissions shows that a 13% global OH loss from 1985 to 2035 would be nearly canceled by a 10% stratospheric  $O_3$  depletion (15).

It is more difficult to predict effects of global warming on OH concentrations. In general, a warmer climate at unchanged relative humidity should lead to higher H<sub>2</sub>O vapor and OH concentrations, but other perturbations are hard to predict. If mean cloudiness also increases, there could be less ultraviolet radiation reaching the lower troposphere, resulting in lower concentrations of OH. In contrast, greater reflection of ultraviolet radiation in clouds would increase O<sub>3</sub> photodissociation and OH formation above clouds in the mid- and upper troposphere (78). Thus, the effect of a modified cloud amount on tropospheric OH concentrations is uncertain.

Calculations of possible effects of civilian aircraft on upper tropospheric oxidants show that, even though  $NO_x$  emissions enhance  $O_3$  production, there might be little effect on OH because some OH reacts



**Fig. 10.** Percent change in OH from 1985 to 2100 calculated with a 2D model. [From (*75*). Copyright by A. Deepak Publishing] Global mean OH is nearly constant as a result of the near cancellation of positive forcings from increasing NO and controls on CO emissions. Methane is assumed to continue increasing 1% year<sup>-1</sup>.

with  $NO_x$  to form  $HNO_3$  (46, 67, 68).

Hydrogen peroxide. Predictions of future concentrations of  $H_2O_2$  are also sensitive to assumed NO<sub>x</sub> distributions. Increases in CH<sub>4</sub>, CO, and NMHC emissions convert OH to  $HO_2$  and  $H_2O_2$ , except when NO, concentrations increase rapidly enough for HNO<sub>3</sub> formation to compete with  $H_2O_2$ formation. Thus, a 2D model that assumes global increases in NO emissions predicts that H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> will decrease at all latitudes (30), whereas more moderate scenarios in a multiregion 1D model point to substantial  $H_2O_2$  increases in some regions (16). Typical values for business-as-usual scenarios are 50% growth over the next 50 years in all regions except those with highest NO<sub>x</sub> concentrations. This is consistent with the recent ice-core record that shows  $H_2O_2$ increasing more than 40% over the past 20 years (61). Control of CH<sub>4</sub> and CO emissions would moderate increases in  $H_2O_2$ concentrations. Depletion of stratospheric O<sub>3</sub> and a warmer, moister climate favor  $H_2O_2$  formation at the expense of tropospheric OH and O3, but not if cloud and precipitation enrichments were to remove the additional  $H_2O_2$  (16).

#### Summary

A review of observations, limited over time and domain, suggests that the earth's oxidizing capacity—defined as the global abundance of tropospheric  $O_3$ , OH, and  $H_2O_2$ —has changed significantly during the 200 to 300 years of the industrial era. There is good evidence for increasing surface  $O_3$  throughout much of the Northern Hemisphere, ~0.1 to 0.3% year<sup>-1</sup> over the past century in some locations. More recently, dry-season  $O_3$  concentrations may be increasing in the tropics because of widespread biomass burning.

We can rationalize increases in  $O_3$  concentrations by noting that the abundance of the  $O_3$  precursor CH<sub>4</sub> has increased globally since preindustrial times. Photochemical models show that increasing CH<sub>4</sub> (and CO)

SCIENCE • VOL. 256 • 22 MAY 1992

concentrations could account for a doubling of background tropospheric  $O_3$  since 1800. The role played by perturbed  $NO_x$  and NMHC emissions is harder to quantify because of nonlinearity in  $O_3$  formation.

Trends in the critical oxidant OH are less certain. Increases in CH<sub>4</sub> and CO concentrations over vast regions suggest that the global OH abundance was greater in the preindustrial era than now. Presently, OH continues to be suppressed by increases in CO and CH<sub>4</sub> emissions over much of the Southern Hemisphere, but where urbanization and biomass burning are on the rise increasing O3 concentrations could lead to higher OH concentrations. A decline in the rate of atmospheric CH<sub>4</sub> increase over the past 3 to 5 years could signal an increase in global OH abundance. It appears that small changes in OH, either positive or negative, should occur in the next century or so. Increases would be beneficial in controlling stratospheric O<sub>3</sub>depleting hydrochlorofluorocarbons, but they would aggravate other environmental problems, for example, rates of acid formation in the troposphere.

Concentrations of  $H_2O_2$  could be increasing at even greater rates than tropospheric  $O_3$ , although increases in  $NO_x$  emissions tend to counteract increases in atmospheric  $H_2O_2$ . Recent increases in  $H_2O_2$  concentrations in Greenland ice cores suggest that increases in  $CH_4$  and CO concentrations will add to the atmospheric burden of this oxidant. The increase in  $H_2O_2$  concentrations could be a sign of OH depletion, representing net conversion of OH to  $HO_2$ .

#### **REFERENCES AND NOTES**

- 1. The U.S. Environmental Protection Agency defines a region to be in violation of the air quality standard whenever 2 days in a calendar year register maximum 1-hour averaged  $O_3$  mixing ratios in excess of 120 ppbv.
- W-C. Wang, J. P. Pinto, Y. Yung, J. Atmos. Sci. 37, 333 (1980); A. A. Lacis, D. J. Wuebbles, J. A. Logan, J. Geophys. Res. 95, 9971 (1990).
- 3. T. E. Graedel, Chemical Compounds in the Atmo-

sphere (Academic Press, New York, 1978).

- 4. S. A. Penkett, B. M. R. Jones, K. A. Brice, A. E. J. Eggleton, Atmos. Environ. 13, 123 (1979).
- In urban environments the free radicals NO3 and 5 HO2 may be significant oxidants, especially at night. See B. J. Finlayson-Pitts and J. N. Pitts, Jr., Atmospheric Chemistry: Fundamentals and Ex-Althospheric Chemistry, Fundamentals and Experimental Techniques (Wiley, New York, 1986).
  6. I. S. A. Isaksen, in *The Changing Atmosphere*:
- Report of the Dahlem Workshop on the Changing Atmosphere, F. S. Rowland and I. S. A. Isaksen, Eds. (Wiley-Interscience, New York, 1988), pp. 141\_158
- 7. M. Prather and C. Spivakovsky, J. Geophys. Res. 95. 18723 (1990).
- T. E. Graedel and C. J. Weschler, *Rev. Geophys.* 8 *Space Phys.* **19**, 505 (1981); W. L. Chameides and D. D. Davis, *J. Geophys.* **Res. 87**, 4863 (1982).
- H. Levy III, Planet. Space Sci. 20, 919 (1972); P. J. Crutzen, Pure Appl. Geophys. 106–108, 1385 (1973). The sequence of reactions R1 through R9, and analogous processes starting with OH attack on NMHC are known collectively as "smoo" reactions. See M. W. Gery et al., J. Geophys. Res. 94, 12935 (1989); F. W. Lurmann et al., ibid. 91, 10905 (1986); W. R. Stockwell et al., ibid. 95, 16343 (1990).
- 10. D. H. Ehhalt, in The Changing Atmosphere: Report of the Dahlem Workshop on the Changing Atmosphere, F. S. Rowland and I. S. A. Isaksen, Eds. (Wiley-Interscience, New York, 1988), pp. 25-32; R. A. Rasmussen and M. A. K. Khalil, J. Geophys. Res. 86, 9826 (1981); D. R. Blake and F. S. Rowland, J. Atmos. Chem. 4, 43 (1986).
- 11. H. Craig and C. C. Chou, Geophys. Res. Lett. 9 1221 (1982); R. A. Rasmussen and M. A. K. Khalil. J. Geophys. Res. 89, 11599 (1984); B. Stauffer, G. Fischer, A. Neftel, H. Oeschger, Science 229, 1386 (1985).
- W. L. Chameides, S. C. Liu, R. J. Cicerone, J. Geophys. Res. 82, 1795 (1977); N. D. Sze, Science 195, 673 (1977); J. S. Levine, C. P. Rinsland,
  G. M. Tennille, *Nature* 318, 254 (1985).
  13. S. Hameed, J. P. Pinto, R. W. Stewart, *J. Geophys.*
- Res. 84, 763 (1979).
- 14. A. M. Thompson and R. J. Cicerone, ibid. 91, 10853 (1986).
- 15. A. M. Thompson, M. A. Huntley, R. W. Stewart, ibid. 95, 9829 (1990).
- Atmos. Environ. Part A 25, 1837 (1991). 16.
- Hydroxyl reacts efficiently with oxygenated hydro-carbons, including radicals, peroxides, alde-hydes, and acyl compounds; a compilation of rate coefficients for OH attack on organic compounds is R. Atkinson, Ed., Journal of Physical and Chemical Reference Data, Monograph 1 (American Institute of Physics, New York, 1989)
- S. C. Liu *et al.*, *J. Geophys. Res.* 92, 4191 (1987).
   X. Lin, M. Trainer, S. C. Liu, *ibid.* 93, 15879 (1988).
   J. A. Leone and J. H. Seinfeld, *Atmos. Environ.* 19,
- 437 (1985); W. R. Stockwell, ibid. 20, 1615 (1986); A. M. Hough, J. Geophys. Res. 93, 3789 (1988); M. C. Dodge, ibid. 94, 5121 (1989).
- 21. Regional-scale models developed for acid deposition address some of these requirements, for example, J. S. Chang et al., J. Geophys. Res. 92, 14681 (1987).
- 22. J. Lilieveld and P. J. Crutzen, Nature 343, 227 (1990).
- 23. W. B. DeMore et al., Eds., "Chemical kinetics and photochemical data for use in stratospheric modeling: NASA Kinetics Panel Evaluation No. 9" (NASA/JPL Publ. 90-1, Jet Propulsion Laboratory, Pasadena, CA, 1990). 24. A. M. Thompson and R. W. Stewart, *J. Geophys.*
- Res. 96, 13089 (1991). The uncertainty in a model calculation of ambient OH from a set of highprecision measurements of O3, CO, and NOx may be reduced to 15 to 20%.
- Y. Lu and M. A. K. Khalil, Chemosphere 23, 397 25. (1991).
- 26. P. J. Crutzen and L. T. Gidel, J. Geophys. Res. 88, 6641 (1983); M. Kanakidou, H. B. Singh, K. M. Valentin, P. J. Crutzen, *ibid.* **96**, 15395 (1991).
- 27. I. S. A. Isaksen and O. Hov, Tellus Ser. B 39, 271 (1987).

- 28 A M Hough and B G Derwent Nature 344 645 (1990)
- D. J. Wuebbles, P. S. Connell, K. E. Grant, R. 29. Tarp, K. E. Taylor, Report UCRL-21178 (Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory, Livermore, CA, 1987).
- 30. K. S. Law and J. A. Pyle, Atmos. Environ. Part A 25 1863 (1991).
- 31. A 2D meridionally averaged model is described in S. Solberg, I. S. A. Isaksen, R. B. Chatfield, in Ozone in the Atmosphere, R. D. Bojkov and P. Fabian, Eds. (A. Deepak, Hampton, VA, 1989), pp. 548-551
- 32. M. Kanakidou and P. J. Crutzen, Chemosphere, in press; P. H. Zimmermann, J. Feichter, H. K. Rath, P. J. Crutzen, W. Weiss, in *Air Pollution Modeling* and Its Application, H. Van Dop, Ed. (Plenum, New York, 1988), vol. 6, pp. 593–607.
- For discussion of the roles of  $O_3$  and OH in climate change, see R. T. Watson, H. Rodhe, H. Oeschger, U. Siegenthaler, in Climate Change: The IPCC (Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change) Assessment, J. T. Houghton, G. J. Jenkins, J. J. Ephraums, Eds. (Cambridge Univ. Press, Cambridge, 1990), chap. 1.
- R. B. Chatfield and P. J. Crutzen, *J. Geophys. Res.* **89**, 7111 (1984); R. R. Dickerson *et al.*, *Science* **235**, 460 (1987); K. E. Pickering *et al.*, *J.* 34. Geophys. Res. 95, 14049 (1990). R. D. Bojkov, J. Climate Appl. Meteorol. 25, 343
- 35. (1986). A new report of surface  $O_3$  doubling in South America from the 1880s to the present is in S. Sandroni, D. Anfossi, S. Viarengo, J. Geophys. Res. 97, 2535 (1992).
- A. Volz and D. Kley, Nature 332, 240 (1988). 36
- Summary Rep. 1989: No. 18 (NOAA/CMDL, Boulder, CO, 1990), pp. 40–49. 37
- R. C. Schnell et al., Nature 351, 726 (1991). 38 S. Madronich, *Geophys. Res. Lett.* **19**, 37 (1992); P. J. Crutzen, *Nature* **356**, 104 (1992). 39.
- S. C. Liu and M. Trainer, J. Atmos. Chem. 6, 221 40.
- (1988). 41
- A. M. Thompson, Nature 352, 282 (1991).
- J. Fishman, C. E. Watson, J. C. Larsen, J. A. Logan, J. Geophys. Res. 95, 3599 (1990). Typical 42. values for total  $O_3$  range from 250 DU over the tropical Pacific to 450 DU or more at high latitudes except during the period of the Antarctic  $O_2$  hole, when TOMS has sometimes measured <120 DU. Eighty percent or more of the total O3 column is in the stratosphere.
- J. Fishman, K. Fakhruzzaman, B. Cros, D. Nga-nga, *Science* **252**, 1693 (1991). This paper in-43 cludes data through 1989. Figure 6 includes data from 1990 and uses Version 6.0 of the TOMS archive instead of Version 5.0. The newer version of the TOMS Archive results in an increase of the tropospheric residual amounts of ~11%. The maximum off the western African coast may include some artifact O<sub>3</sub> because of increased reflectivity over marine stratocumulus clouds.
- J. Fishman, personal communication. The possi-44. ble importance of biomass burning was pointed out by P. J. Crutzen, L. E. Heidt, J. P. Krasnec, W. H. Pollock, and W. Seiler [*Nature* 282, 253 (1979)].
- R. S. Stolarski, P. Bloomfield, R. D. McPeters, J. 45 Herman, Geophys. Res. Lett. 18, 1015 (1991).
- The most recent stratospheric  $O_3$  Assessment 46. Report discusses the roles of tropospheric OH and O<sub>3</sub> in stratospheric chemistry: I. S. A. Isaksen in Scientific Assessment of Ozone Depleet al., tion: 1991 (Rep. 25, World Meteorological Organization-United Nations Environment Programme. Geneva, Switzerland, 1992), chap. 5.
- 47. H.-P. Dorn, J. Callies, U. Platt, D. H. Ehhalt, Tellus Ser. B 40, 437 (1988); A. Hofzumahaus et al., Atmos. Environ. Part A 25, 2017 (1991); G. H. Mount, J. Geophys. Res. 97, 2427 (1992).
- 48. I. S. Leifer, D. J. Tanner, F. L. Eisele, Eos 72, 99 (1991). An intercomparison of two OH measurement techniques appears in this issue; see G. H. Mount et al., Science 256, 1187 (1992) and W. Brune, *ibid.*, p. 1154.
- R. Prinn et al., Science 238, 945 (1987). D. M. Cunnold and R. G. Prina, J. Geophys. Res.

SCIENCE • VOL. 256 • 22 MAY 1992

96, 17392 (1992); difficulties in calibration and constraint of lifetime are discussed by C. M. Spivakovsky, ibid., p. 17395.

- J. J. Butler et al., ibid., p. 22347 R. Prinn et al., ibid. 97, 2445 (1992). 52.
- A. M. Thompson, J. A. Chappellaz, I. Y. Fung, T. L. 53.
- Kucsera, in preparation.
- M. A. K. Khalil and R. A. Rasmussen, *Atmos. Environ.* **19**, 397 (1985).
   J. P. Pinto and M. A. K. Khalil, *Tellus Ser. B* **43**,
- 347 (1991). 56. M. B. McElroy, in The Environmental Record in
- Glaciers and Ice Sheets, H. Oeschger and C. C. Langway, Jr., Eds. (Wiley, London, 1989), pp. 363-377.
- 57. B. Stauffer, E. Lochbronner, H. Oeschger, J. Schwander, *Nature* **332**, 812 (1988); D. Raynaud, J. Chappellaz, J. M. Barnola, Y. S. Korotkevich, ibid. 333, 665 (1988).
- 58. P. D. Guthrie, *Global Biogeochem. Cycles* 4, 287 (1989); Y. Lu and M. A. K. Khalil, in preparation. D. W. Gunz and M. R. Hoffmann, Atmos. Environ. 59.
- B. W. Calz and W. H. Hommann, Annos. Environ. Part A 24, 1601 (1990).
   A. Neftel, P. Jacob, D. Klockow, Nature 311, 43 (1984); A. Sigg and A. Neftel, Ann. Glaciol. 10, 157 (1988); A. Sigg, T. Staffelbach, A. Neftel, J. Atmos. Chem. 14, 223 (1992).
- A. Sigg and A. Neftel, Nature 351, 557 (1991).
- 62. D. A. Lashof and D. A. Tirpak, Eds., Policy Options for Stabilizing Global Climate: Report to Congress (USEPA Publ. 21P-2003.1 and 21P-2003.3, Environmental Protection Agency, Washington, DC, 1990). In this report the models described in (15, 75, and 76) were intercompared; each model was used to run a set of eight scenarios for CH<sub>4</sub>, CO, and NO emissions from 1985 to 2050.
- 63. Roughly a dozen 2D models for stratospheric assessment purposes have been intercompared by running the same scenarios. C. H. Jackman, R. K. Seals, Jr., M. J. Prather, Eds., "Two-dimensional comparison of stratospheric models," NASA Conference Publication 3042 (NASA, Washington, DC, 1989). Despite the simplifications of heterogeneous chemistry and 2D transport, the scientific community accepts the use of these models for U.S. and international assessment and policy studies because they are able to reproduce observations of total O3 reasonably well. See (45, 46).
- A. M. Thompson, R. W. Stewart, M. A. Owens, J. A. Herwehe, Atmos. Environ. 23, 519 (1989).
- 65. Few models have looked at a range of interactions among perturbed climate, troposphere, and stratosphere. See D. J. Wuebbles, K. E. Grant, P. S. Connell, and J. E. Penner [J. Air Pollut. Control Assoc. 39, 22 (1989)] and D. J. Wuebbles and J. E. Penner ["Sensitivity of Urban/Regional Chemistry to Climate Change: Report of the Workshop, 17–18 February 1988" (*Rep. UCRL-99436* (Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory, Livermore, CA, 1989).
- C. Bruhl and P. J. Crutzen, Climate Dyn. 2, 173 66. (1988).
- 67. Studies have examined the impact of aircraft emissions on upper tropospheric  $O_3$  (46, 68). On the basis of the channel model (31), it is estimated that typical NO emissions from civilian aircraft maintain upper tropospheric O<sub>2</sub> levels 12% above levels consistent with no aircraft. J. P. Beck, C. E. Reeves, F. A. A. M. de Leeuw, S. A. Penkett, Atmos. Environ. Part A 26, 17 (1992).
- R. G. Derwent, Atmos. Environ. 16, 1997 (1982); 68. S. C. Liu et al., J. Geophys. Res. 85, 7546 (1980); C. Johnson, J. Henshaw, G. McInnes, Nature 354, 69 (1992).
- M. W. Gery, in Environmental Effects of Ozone 69. Depletion: 1991 Update (United Nations Environment Programme, November 1991, available from the Environmental Protection Agency, Washington, DC, Publication RD-682D).
- There are clearly increases in surface ultraviolet 70. light associated with the Antarctic ozone hole ID. Lubin, J. E. Frederick, A. J. Krueger, *J. Geophys. Res.* 94, 8491 (1989)], but no definite evidence at mid-latitudes. See C. Bruhl and P. J. Crutzen,

IN NEW PROPERTY OF A CONTRACT OF

Geophys. Res. Lett. 16, 703 (1989).

- 71. D. Kley et al., in Global and Regional Environmental Atmospheric Chemistry: Proceedings of the International Conference on Global and Regional Environmental Atmospheric Chemistry (Department of Energy Conference 890525, 1989, available from the National Technical Information Service, Springfield, VA), p. 9.
- 72.
- Nos, Spiniglied, VA), p. 9.
  D. Rind, R. Suozzo, N. K. Balanchandran, M. J. Prather, J. Atmos. Sci. 47, 475 (1990).
  K. B. Hogan, J. S. Hoffman, A. M. Thompson, Nature 354, 181 (1991); A. M. Thompson, K. B. Hogan, J. S. Hoffman, Atmos. Environ., in press. 73 74. C. S. Atherton and J. E. Penner, J. Geophys. Res.
- 95, 14027 (1990).
- 75. I. S. A. Isaksen, T. Berntsen, S. Solberg, in Ozone in the Atmosphere, R. D. Bojkov and P. Fabian, Eds. (A. Deepak, Hampton, VA, 1989), pp. 576–579.76. M. J. Prather, Ed., "An assessment model for

atmospheric composition" (NASA Conf. Publ. 3023, NASA, Washington, DC, 1989).

- 77. S. Madronich and C. Granier, Geophys. Res. Lett. 19, 465 (1992).
- 78. A. M. Thompson, J. Geophys. Res. 89, 1341
- (1984); S. Madronich, *ibid.* **92**, 9740 (1987). S. A. Penkett and K. A. Brice, *ibid.* **319**, 655 79. (1986).
- 80. J. A. Logan, J. Geophys. Res. 90, 10463 (1985). An update for the North American data is in J. A. Logan, in Tropospheric Ozone, I. S. A. Isaksen, Ed. (North Atlantic Treaty Organization Advanced Study Institutes, Reidel, Dordrecht, Holland, 1988), pp. 327-344.
- Locations of sites: Barrow (71°N, 157°W); Mauna Loa (19.5°N, 156°W); Samoa (14°S, 171°W); South Pole (90°S, 0). See (36); S. J. Oltmans and W. D. Komhyr, J. Geophys. Res. 91, 5229 (1986).
- 82. K. M. Valentin, thesis, Johannes-Gutenburg Uni-

# Molecular Epidemiology of HIV Transmission in a Dental Practice

Chin-Yih Ou, Carol A. Ciesielski, Gerald Myers. Claudiu I. Bandea, Chi-Cheng Luo, Bette T. M. Korber, James I. Mullins, Gerald Schochetman, Ruth L. Berkelman, A. Nikki Economou, John J. Witte, Lawrence J. Furman. Glen A. Satten, Kersti A. MacInnes, James W. Curran, Harold W. Jaffe, Laboratory Investigation Group,\* Epidemiologic Investigation Groupt

Human immunodeficiency virus type 1 (HIV-1) transmission from infected patients to health-care workers has been well documented, but transmission from an infected healthcare worker to a patient has not been reported. After identification of an acquired immunodeficiency syndrome (AIDS) patient who had no known risk factors for HIV infection but who had undergone an invasive procedure performed by a dentist with AIDS, six other patients of this dentist were found to be HIV-infected. Molecular biologic studies were conducted to complement the epidemiologic investigation. Portions of the HIV proviral envelope gene from each of the seven patients, the dentist, and 35 HIV-infected persons from the local geographic area were amplified by polymerase chain reaction and sequenced. Three separate comparative genetic analyses-genetic distance measurements, phylogenetic tree analysis, and amino acid signature pattern analysis-showed that the viruses from the dentist and five dental patients were closely related. These data. together with the epidemiologic investigation, indicated that these patients became infected with HIV while receiving care from a dentist with AIDS.

Increasingly, molecular biologic techniques have been used to study the epidemiology of infectious diseases. For viral infections of humans, techniques to analyze viral genetic sequence information, such as oligonucleotide fingerprinting of RNA genomes with ribonuclease, mapping of DNA genomes with restriction endonucleases, and genomic sequencing, have been used to study viral transmissions from person to person, within communities, and between countries (1). Requisite to such studies is the existence of viral genetic variation; the greater the variation, the greater the power of the methods to distinguish strains of the virus. For a virus with substantial genomic variation, identification of strains with a

high degree of genetic relatedness may imply an epidemiologic linkage between persons infected with these strains.

The human immunodeficiency virus (HIV) has a high mutation rate (2, 3), such that HIVs from different individuals are found to be genetically distinct (3). In this article, we describe the use of genomic sequencing to investigate a cluster of HIV infections in a Florida dental practice. The high degree of genetic relatedness observed among the HIV strains from a dentist with acquired immunodeficiency syndrome (AIDS) and five of his infected patients supports the epidemiologic investigation that indicated that these patients became infected with HIV while receiving dental care.

versity, Mainz (1990). 83. P. J. Crutzen and P. H. Zimmermann, *Tellus Ser, B* 

43, 136 (1991). 84 The following people have been generous with reports of recent work: C. Bruhl, J. Fishman, I. S. A. Isaksen, M. Kanakidou, M. A. K. Khalil, K. Law, Y. Lu, A. Neftel, J. Pinto, M. Prather, and R. Prinn. M. Kanakidou, J. Logan, and W. Stockwell made helpful comments on the manuscript. Some of the model comparisons (Tables 1 and 2) grew out of the United Nations Environmental Programme-World Meteorological Organization Ozone Assessment Group Workshop (London, June 1991) and a North Atlantic Treaty Organization Advanced Re-search Workshop on Methane (Mt. Hood, Oregon, October 1991). My research on oxidizing changes is supported by NASA Programs in Earth Observing Systems and Tropospheric Chemistry and by the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency.

## **Epidemiologic Investigation**

In July 1990, we reported that a young woman with AIDS (patient A) had most likely acquired her HIV-1 infection while undergoing invasive dental procedures by a Florida dentist with AIDS (4). Following publication of the report, the dentist publicly requested that his former patients be tested for HIV infection. Among approximately 1100 persons whose blood was tested by the Florida Department of Health and Rehabilitative Services (HRS), two patients (patients B and C) were found to be HIV-positive. An additional infected patient (patient D) was ascertained by HRS through cross matching a list of the dentist's former patients with the Florida AIDS case registry. Two other patients of the dentist (patients E and G) contacted the Centers for Disease Control (CDC) to report that they were HIV-infected. A former sex partner named by patient E was found to be HIV-infected and had also been a patient of the dentist (patient F). Characteristics of these seven infected patients and the dentist are included in Table 1.

Patient D had previously been reported

C.-Y. Ou, C. A. Ciesielski, C. I. Bandea, C.-C. Luo, G. Schochetman, R. L. Berkelman, G. A. Satten, J. W. Curran, and H. W. Jaffe are in Division of HIV/AIDS, National Center for Infectious Diseases, Centers for Disease Control, Atlanta, GA 30333. G. Myers, B. T. M. Korber, and K. A. MacInnes are in the Theoretical Division, Los Alamos National Laboratory, Los Alamos, NM 87545. J. I. Mullins is in the Department of Microbiology and Immunology, Stanford University School of Medicine, Stanford, CA 94305. A. N. Economou and J. J. Witte are in the Florida Department of Health and Rehabilitative Services, Tallahassee, FL 32399. L. J. Furman is in the Division of Oral Health National Center for Prevention Services, Centers for Disease Control, Atlanta, GA 30333.

\*J. Moore, Y. Villamarzo, and C. Schable, Division of HIV/AIDS and E. G. Shpaer, Department of Microbiology and Immunology, Stanford University School of Medicine

†T. Liberti and S. Lieb, Florida Department of Health and Rehabilitative Services (HRS); R. Scott, J. Howell, R. Dumbaugh, A. Lasch, Florida HRS District 9; B. Kroesen and L. Ryan, Martin County Public Health Unit, Florida HRS; K. Bell, V. Munn, D. Marianos, and B. Gooch, Centers for Disease Control.