delivery system would have to distribute the material over the volume, or one would have to allow adequate time for slow internal mixing. The possibility that the vortex region exchanges and processes air from lower latitudes (32) could lead to some losses of the added alkanes. If instead the gases would be introduced into the stratosphere before the vortex sets up (when there is more mixing), much larger quantities would be needed, and their chemical fate would be more uncertain. Experiments can be imagined with vertically thin atmospheric layers wherein the injected hydrocarbons would be consumed (reaction 1) and the present concept could be tested. Before any actual injection experiment is undertaken there are many scientific, technical, legal, and ethical questions to be faced, not the least of which is the issue of unintended side effects (33).

## REFERENCES AND NOTES

- 1. J. C. Farman, B. G. Gardiner, J. D. Shanklin, Nature 315, 207 (1985).
- For example, monthly means for October have decreased by about 50% from average values of about 320 Dobson units (DU) in the early 1970s; by the late 1980s the area over Antarctica with less than 220 DU overhead had grown to about 20 imes10<sup>6</sup> km<sup>2</sup>. In addition, minimum ozone amounts have continued to decrease; P. A. Newman, R. S. Stolarski, M. R. Schoeberl, R. D. McPeters, A. Krueger, Geophys. Res. Lett. 18, 661 (1991).
- R. S. Stolarski, P. Bloomfield, R. D. McPeters, J. R.
- Herman, *ibid.*, p. 1015.
   After record low (until then) Antarctic ozone amounts in October 1987, ozone lows were ob-served over Australia and New Zealand (27° to 43°S), and meteorological trajectory analysis showed that transport of ozone-poor air was the likely cause of the ozone decreases there [R. J. Atkinson, W. A. Matthews, P. A. Newman, R. A. Plumb, *Nature* **340**, 290 (1989)]. Increased UV-B radiation was observed simultaneously at the surface [C. R. Roy, H. P. Gies, G. Elliott, ibid. 347, 235 (1990)].
- M. R. Schoeberl and D. L. Hartmann, Science 251, 46 (1991).
- 6. M. J. Prather and R. T. Watson, Nature 344, 729 (1990).
- 7. J. G. Anderson, D. W. Toohey, W. H. Brune, Science 251, 39 (1991); D. L. Hartmann et al., in Report of the International Ozone Trends Panel 1988 (Rep. 18, World Meteorological Organization, Geneva, 1990), chap. 11, p. 665; S. Solomon, Rev. Geophys. 26, 131 (1988).
- R. P. Turco et al., in Report of the International Ozone
- C. T. Hittori al., in Report of the International October Trends Panel 1988 (Rep. 18, World Meteorological Organization, Geneva, 1990), chap. 10, p. 641.
  P. J. Crutzen and F. Arnold, Nature 324, 651 (1986); O. B. Toon, P. Hamill, R. P. Turco, J. Pinto, Geophys. Res. Lett. 13, 1284 (1986).
- M. P. McCormick, C. R. Trepte, M. C. Pitts, J. Geophys. Res. 94, 11241 (1989).
- The gas-phase chemical and photochemical reactions are documented by R. P. Turco, in *Photochemistry of Atmospheres*, J. Levine, Ed. (Academic Press, New York, 1985), pp. 77–128; and in R. P. Turco and R. C. Whitten, NASA Tech. Pap. 1002 (1077)
- R. Atkinson and A. C. Lloyd, J. Phys. Chem. Ref. Data 13, 315 (1984); A. M. Thompson and R. J. Cicerone, J. Geophys. Res. 91, 10853 (1986); M. Trainer et al., ibid. 92, 11879 (1987).
- 13. W. B. Demore et al., NASA-Jet Propul. Lab. Publ. 90 (1990) 14. M. J. Molina, T.-L. Tso, L. T. Molina, F. C.-Y.

- Wang, Science 238, 1253 (1987); M. A. Tolbert, M. J. Rossi, R. Malhotra, D. M. Golden, *ibid.*, p. 1258.
- K. Drdla and R. P. Turco, J. Atmos. Chem. 12, 319 15. \_\_\_\_, S. Elliott, in preparation. (1991);
- (1991); \_\_\_\_\_\_, S. Elliott, in preparation.
  16. D. J. Hofmann, J. W. Harder, S. R. Rolf, J. M. Rosen, *Nature* 326, 59 (1987); T. Deshler and D. J. Hofmann, *Geophys. Res. Lett.* 18, 657 (1991).
  17. S. Solomon, R. R. Garcia, F. S. Rowland, D. J. Solomon, R. R. Garcia, P. S. Rowland, D. J. Solomon, R. R. Carcia, P. S. Rowland, D. J. Solomon, R. R. Carcia, P. S. Rowland, D. J. Solomon, R. R. Carcia, S. Solomon, R. R. Garcia, F. S. Rowland, D. J. Solomon, R. R. Solomon, R. R. Solomon, R. R. Solomon, R. R. Solomon, R.
- Wuebbles, Nature 321, 755 (1986); R. L. Jones et al., J. Geophys. Res. 94, 11,529 (1989)
- M. B. McElroy, R. J. Salawitch, S. C. Wofsy, J. A. Logan, Nature **321**, 759 (1986).
   D. W. Fahcy et al., J. Geophys. Res. **94**, 16,665
- (1989).
- 20. S. R. Kawa et al., ibid., in press.
  21. J. M. Rodriguez et al., ibid. 94, 16,683 (1989)
- 22. S. Solomon and R. R. Garcia, ibid. 88, 5229 (1983); Solomon and R. R. Garcia, *ibid.* **36**, 3229 (1963);
   Solomon and R. R. Garcia, *ibid.* **18**, 11633 (1984);
   M. K. W. Ko, N. D. Sze, M. Livshits, M. B. McElroy, J. A. Pyle, *J. Atmos. Sci.* **41**, 2381 (1984);
   M. K. W. Ko, K. K. Tung, D. K. Weisenstein, N. D.
- 24. W. H. Brune, J. G. Anderson, K. R. Chan, ibid. 94, 16,649 (1989). 25
- M. P. McCormick, H. M. Steele, P. Hamill, W. P. Chu, T. J. Swissler, J. Atmos. Sci. 39, 1387 (1982); M. P. McCormick and C. R. Trepte, Geophys. Res. Lett. 13, 1276 (1986); D. J. Hofmann, Rev. Geo-phys. 26, 113 (1988); D. J. Hofmann, J. M. Rosen, J. W. Harder, J. V. Hereford, J. Geophys. Res. 94, 11,253 (1989).
- D. Hanson and K. Mauersberger, Geophys. Res. 26. Lett. 15, 855 (1988).
- Six other scenarios have been simulated but are not shown here. Models B and H are representative; all models for which the initial (sunrise) concentrations

of active chlorine + HCl exceeded those of  $(NO_x -$ HCl) displayed ozone depletion for the control case, essentially as proposed by S. C. Wofsy, M. J. Molina, R. J. Salawitch, L. E. Fox, M. B. McElroy,

- J. Geophys. Res. 93, 2442 (1988).
   Y. L. Yung, J. P. Pinto, R. T. Watson, S. P. Sander, J. Atmos. Sci. 37, 339 (1980); see also (18).
   The response of the model to ethane or propane (E
- or P) additions is sensitive to amounts and identities of odd-nitrogen  $(NO_y)$  compounds. NO<sub>y</sub> amounts depend on the extent of denitrification, which can vary from year to year. Also, there could be some sporadic leakage of  $NO_x$  into the polar vortex. It is also important to determine how much HNO3 formed by heterogeneous reactions can remain condensed and settle out of the stratosphere.
- 30. D. R. Hanson and A. R. Ravishankara, in preparation; M. J. Prather, in preparation.
- J. D. Mahlman, personal communication.
   A. F. Tuck, J. Geophys. Res. 94, 11,687 (1989).
- 33. Propane and ethane are short-lived in the sunlit stratosphere as a result of fast reactions with OH radicals and with Cl atoms. After sunrise in the polar lower stratosphere these alkanes could survive for perhaps a year, but transport to warmer regions (where OH attack is faster) or to sites with more OH should limit their survival times to some tens of days. By contrast, if NOx were added to the Antarctic stratosphere, it might spread globally if any survived processing by PSCs.
- We acknowledge useful comments from J. D. Mahl-man, S. Solomon, and M. J. Prather and support 34 from the National Science Foundation Atmospheric Chemistry Program (ATM-8911836), National Aeronautics and Space Administration awards W-NAGW-2183 and NAS1-19155, and the University of California's INCOR Program.

3 July 1991; accepted 7 October 1991

## Transgenic Plants with Enhanced Resistance to the Fungal Pathogen Rhizoctonia solani

KAREN BROGLIE, ILAN CHET,\* MARK HOLLIDAY, ROBERT CRESSMAN, PHYLLIS BIDDLE, SUSAN KNOWLTON, C. JEFFRY MAUVAIS, **RICHARD BROGLIE<sup>†</sup>** 

The production of enzymes capable of degrading the cell walls of invading phytopathogenic fungi is an important component of the defense response of plants. The timing of this natural host defense mechanism was modified to produce fungal-resistant plants. Transgenic tobacco seedlings constitutively expressing a bean chitinase gene under control of the cauliflower mosaic virus 35S promoter showed an increased ability to survive in soil infested with the fungal pathogen Rhizoctonia solani and delayed development of disease symptoms.

LANTS RESPOND TO ATTACK BY pathogenic fungi by mobilizing a complex network of active defense mechanisms (1). These include modifications designed to strengthen the plant cell wall and thereby restrict or inhibit access of the pathogen to the plant cell. More aggressive tactics involve the synthesis of toxic antimicrobial compounds (phytoalex-

Agricultural Products Department, E. I. du Pont de Nemours, Wilmington, DE 19880.

ins) and the induction and accumulation of proteinase inhibitors and lytic enzymes such as chitinase and  $\beta$ -1,3-glucanase. The success of the plant in warding off phytopathogen invasion appears to depend on the coordination between the different defense strategies and the rapidity of the overall response (2).

Chitinase catalyzes the hydrolysis of chitin, a  $\beta$ -1,4-linked polymer of N-acetyl-D-glucosamine and a major component of the cell wall of most filamentous fungi except the Oomycetes (3). Although chitinase is generally found at low or basal levels in healthy plants, its expression is increased

1194

<sup>\*</sup>Present address: Hebrew University, Faculty of Agriculture, Rehovot, Israel. †To whom correspondence should be addressed.

during pathogen attack (4), and it accumulates intracellularly in the central vacuole (5) or extracellularly in the intercellular space (6). Evidence for the role of chitinase in the defense response of the plant has been largely dependent on data obtained in vitro. The purified enzymes from tomato and bean hydrolyze isolated fungal cell walls (7, 8). The enzyme from pea alone or in combination with  $\beta$ -1,3-glucanase inhibits the growth of certain pathogenic fungi in culture (9). In addition, the activation profile of a bean chitinase promoter during fungal infection indicates that chitinase expression is intimately associated with the response of the plant to pathogen invasion (10).

Because the timing of the defense response contributes to the outcome of the interaction between host and pathogen, we have eliminated the temporal factor in chitinase gene expression. We find that constitutive expression of a bean endochitinase gene in transgenic tobacco and canola plants affords increased protection



Fig. 1. (A) Structure of the intermediate plasmid pKNK (17), pK35CHN641, and pK35CHN-695. The plasmids pK35CHN641 and pK35-CHN695 contain an Eco RI-Bgl II DNA fragment encoding the chimeric 35S-chitinase gene (13). (B) Immunoblot of protein from control and 35S-chitinase tobacco plants. Soluble protein from leaf (1), stem (s), and root (r) tissue was fractionated by SDS-polyacrylamide gel electrophoresis (29), and the bean chitinase polypeptide was visualized by alkaline phosphatase-linked detection of antibodies to chitinase (16). Plants 230 and 238 were transformed with pK35CHN695, and plants 329 and 373 were transformed with pK35CHN641. Plant 548 was transformed with KNK. Lanes 1 to 15, 10 μg of tobacco protein; lane 16, 20 µg of ethylene-treated bean leaf protein.

against disease caused by the fungal pathogen R. solani.

A hybrid chitinase gene was constructed by the replacement of the 5' regulatory region of a bean endochitinase CH5B gene (11) with the promoter region of the cauliflower mosaic virus (CaMV) 35S transcript, a highly active promoter that is able to function in a wide variety of plant cell types (12). The chimeric 35S-chitinase genes, contained in the plasmids pK35CHN641 and pK35CHN695 (Fig. 1A) (13), were mobilized from *Escherichia coli* HB101 into *Agrobacterium tumefaciens* strain GV3850 (14) and used to infect leaf disks of *Nicotiana tabacum* cv. Xanthi (15).

Of the 47 kanamycin-resistant primary transformants that were regenerated, 22 were screened for expression of the bean chitinase polypeptide by immunoblot analysis (Fig. 1B) (16). All were found to contain a band that was immunoreactive with polyclonal antibodies to bean chitinase and identical in size to the protein from bean. No cross reaction was detected with soluble protein isolated either from wild-type tobacco or from tobacco transformed with an otherwise identical construct pKNK (17) that lacked the 35S-chitinase gene (control plants). The size of the protein, indistinguishable from the size of the native bean polypeptide, suggested that the precursor protein was correctly processed in the heterologous tobacco system. Somewhat higher amounts of bean chitinase protein were found in the roots of the transgenic plants than in the leaves. Out of four randomly selected transformants, 238 displayed the lowest amount of bean chitinase; 373 showed the strongest expression of the bean chitinase polypeptide. Assays of protein extracts indicated increased chitinase enzyme activity in the 35S-chitinase transformed plants (Table 1) (18). Homozygous progeny showed a two- to fourfold increase in the **Table 1.** Chitinase enzyme activity of leaf, stem, and root samples of control and 35S-chitinase tobacco plants (18). The specific activity [nanoKatal (nkat) per milligram of protein] (8) is defined as that amount of enzyme which releases 1 nmol N-acetyl-D-glucosamine per second per milligram of protein; 548, control plants; and 238 and 373, 35S-chitinase tobacco plants.

Plant no.	Chitinase activity (nkat) per milligram of protein		
	Leaf	Stem	Root
548	1.3	1.5	13.4
238	29.9	16.8	24.4
373	57.2	35.4	58.4

roots and a 23- to 44-fold increase over control plants in chitinase enzyme activity in the leaves. These results demonstrate that the chimeric 35S-chitinase gene was functional in tobacco and gave rise to constitutive expression of the bean polypeptide in healthy plants. Transgenic tobacco plants constitutively expressing bean chitinase showed no obvious difference in growth and development when compared to control or wild-type tobacco plants.

The 35S-chitinase tobacco plants were assayed for resistance to the phytopathogen R. solani (19), an endemic, chitinous, soilborne fungus that infects numerous plant species, including corn and soybeans (20). Seeds planted in soils heavily infested with R. solani typically have problems with stand establishment and early season growth. Damping-off, seedling blight, and brown-girdling root rot are diseases that are attributable to R. solani infection.

Homozygous progeny of 35S-chitinase transgenic tobacco plants were grown in the presence of *R. solani* to determine their susceptibility to fungal attack. Eighteenday-old tobacco seedlings were transplanted



**Fig. 2.** Resistance of 35S-chitinase tobacco plants to R. solani. (A and B) Comparison of control plants (A) and 35S-chitinase transformants 373 (B) 18 days after growth in R. solani-infested sand (1.0 ml per pint of soil) (19). (C) Root fresh weight of 23-day-old control and 35S-chitinase tobacco seedlings 11 days after growth in soil containing increasing amounts (0, 1, and 4 ml per pint of soil) of R. solani inoculum. 548 (control),  $\bigcirc$ ; 373,  $\bigcirc$ ; 230,  $\blacktriangle$ ; 238,  $\blacksquare$ ; 329,  $\blacksquare$ . Two independent experiments were performed by use of ten replicates for each experimental condition. Bars indicate standard error of the determinations.

into *R. solani*-inoculated soil and grown for 13 to 16 days (19). Under these conditions, an average of 53% of the plants without the 35S-chitinase gene died. A lower percentage of seedling mortality, ranging from 22.7 to



Fig. 3. Inhibition of fungal growth by bean chitinase. Samples added (40  $\mu$ l per well) to 1-day-old *R. solani* cultured on a potato dextrose agar, and incubated for 12 hours at room temperature are as follows: 1, buffer (50 mM sodium phosphate, pH 7.0, 0.1 M NaCl) containing 100  $\mu$ g of BSA per milliliter; 2, buffer containing 100  $\mu$ g of bean chitinase per milliliter; 3, buffer containing 400  $\mu$ g of BSA per milliliter; 5, buffer containing 100  $\mu$ g of boiled bean chitinase per milliliter; 5, buffer containing 400  $\mu$ g of boiled bean chitinase per milliliter; 5, buffer containing 400  $\mu$ g of boiled bean chitinase per milliliter; 6, buffer containing 400  $\mu$ g of boiled bean chitinase per milliliter.

37.1% (21), was observed for plants containing the 35S-chitinase gene. Transgenic plants with higher amounts of the bean polypeptide showed greater resistance to the development of disease symptoms. When the 35S-chitinase plants were grown in the presence of a pathogen, *Pythium aphanidermatum*, that lacks a chitin-containing cell wall, no difference in survival was detected compared to control plants. Twenty days after transplanting into infested soil, seedling mortality ranged from  $48.4 \pm 6.6$  to  $63.7 \pm 1.9\%$  for the 35S-chitinase plants and  $56.5 \pm 2.6\%$  for control transgenic plants (22).

In certain plants, susceptibility to infection by R. solani decreases with increasing age of the plant. For tobacco, lettuce, cauliflower, and bean (23), young seedlings are most severely affected. On more mature plants, stem and roots may be damaged, but the plant is still able to survive. Control tobacco plants grown in infested soil were noticeably stunted (Fig. 2A), while the 35S-chitinase tobacco plants were larger and hardier (Fig. 2B) and showed minimal root damage. To quantitate the effect of R. solani infection on root development, conditions were chosen such that the plants did not die; instead, the extent of disease was monitored by the loss of root fresh weight (Fig. 2C). For the 35S-chitinase plants the



Fig. 4. (A) Wild-type canola (left) and 35S-chitinase canola (right) 14 days after growth in sand inoculated with *R. solani* (0.25 ml per pint) (19). (B) Rate of seedling mortality of 35S-chitinase canola plants (closed circles) and wild-type canola plants (open circles). Data represent four independent experiments with 12 plants used in each. Error bars are standard errors of the determinations. loss in root fresh weight ranged from an average of 5 to 15%, compared to 46% for the control plants.

The enhanced resistance of the 35S-chitinase plants is consistent with the inhibitory effect of bean chitinase on the growth of R. solani in vitro (Fig. 3). Inhibition was proportional to the concentration of added chitinase. No inhibition was detected in the presence of either boiled enzyme or bovine serum albumin (BSA). The observed growth inhibitory effect may arise from enzyme-catalyzed hydrolysis of newly formed chitin (24) and resultant disruption of the growing fungal-hyphal tips (25). It is not known whether modification of chitinase expression alone is sufficient to provide protection against a wide range of chitinous fungal pathogens. For example, tobacco plants containing transgenically increased amounts of a tobacco chitinase enzyme were only slightly more resistant than control tobacco plants to attack by the fungal pathogen Cercospora nicotinae, indicating that factors other than chitinase may be limiting in the defense against this pathogen (26).

We have also introduced the chimeric 35S-chitinase gene into canola, Brassica napus cv. Westar (27). In 1983 and 1984, yield losses of 36 and 23%, respectively, were attributed to root rot diseases caused by R. solani infection (28). Regenerated transgenic canola plants were assayed for bean chitinase expression by immunoblot analysis and homozygous progeny generated by self-fertilization of primary transformants. One transformant, which exhibited a 33-fold increase in chitinase activity in leaves and a twofold increase in roots over chitinase activity in untransformed tobacco plants, was analyzed and was found to be more resistant to root rot disease of R. solani. The 35S-chitinase plants showed more vigorous growth (Fig. 4A) and a decrease in seedling mortality (Fig. 4B) during growth in inoculated soil.

The extent of disease resistance observed in the 35S-chitinase tobacco or canola varied with the amount of fungal inoculum used, a property characteristic of quantitative resistance. However, the delay in the appearance of symptoms as well as the lower severity of disease may enable young seedlings to survive the critical period during stand establishment in the field when they are most susceptible to attack by soil-borne pathogens.

## **REFERENCES AND NOTES**

 D. J. Bowles, Annu. Rev. Biochem. 59, 873 (1990).
 J. N. Bell, T. B. Ryder, V. P. M. Wingate, J. A. Bailey, C. J. Lamb, Mol. Cell. Biol. 6, 1615 (1986); M. H. A. J. Joosten and P. J. G. M. De Wit, Plant Physiol. 89, 945 (1989); N. Benhamou, J. Grenier, A. Asselin, M. Legrand, Plant Cell 1, 1209 (1989); N. Benhamou, M. H. A. J. Joosten, P. J. G. M. De Wit, Plant Physiol. 92, 1108 (1990).

- 3. J. G. H. Wessels and J. H. Sietsma, in Encyclopedia of Plant Physiology New Series, W. Tanner and F. A. Loewus, Eds. (Springer-Verlag, New York, 1982), Vol. 13B, p. 352.
   T. Boller, Oxford Surv. Plant Mol. Cell Biol. 5, 145
- 1989)
- 5. T. Boller and U. Vogeli, Plant Physiol. 74, 442 (1984).
- 6. G. Payne et al., Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 87, 98
- (1990).
  7. D. H. Young and G. F. Pegg, *Physiol. Plant Pathol.* 21, 411 (1982).
- 8. T. Boller, A. Gehri, F. Mauch, U. Vogeli, Planta 157, 22 (1983)
- F. Mauch, B. Mauch-Mani, T. Boller, Plant Physiol. 88, 936 (1988).
- 10. D. Roby et al., Plant Cell 2, 999 (1990). K. E. Broglie, P. Biddle, R. Cressman, R. Broglie, 11.
- *ibid.* 1, 599 (1989).
  12. J. T. Odell, S. Knowlton, W. Lin, C. J. Mauvais, *Plant Mol. Biol.* 10, 263 (1988).
- 13. A fragment containing the chitinase coding and 3'
- end region was generated by Bal 31 digestion of a subclone of the CH5B gene (11) pCH35 $\Delta$ 6 that contains 600 bp of 5' flanking DNA, the 981-bp chitinase open reading frame, and 1670 bp of 3' flanking DNA. Two fragments having 5' end end points at +5 (641), and +23 (695) and a common 3' end point at +1520 (relative to the transcriptional start site) were joined to the 35S promoter contained in pK35CAT [W. Lin, J. T. Odell, R. M. Shreiner, *Plant Physiol.* 84, 856 (1987)]. The pK35CHN641 and pK35CHN695 were obtained by insertion of a 3.5-kb Eco RI fragment bearing the neomycin phosphotransferase (NPT) I gene of Tn903 and a chimeric NPTII gene (17). No systematic difference in the amount of bean chitinase could be discerned between transgenic plants containing either plasmid.
- G. Ruvkin and F. M. Ausubel, Nature 289, 85 (1981); P. Zambryski et al., EMBO J. 2, 2143 1983
- R. B. Horsch et al., Science 227, 1229 (1985).
   M. Blake, K. H. Johnston, G. J. Russel-Jones, E. C. Gotschlich, Anal. Biochem. 136, 175 (1984).
   J. T. Odell, P. Caimi, N. S. Yadav, C. J. Mauvais,
- Plant Physiol. 94, 1647 (1990). 18. Chitinase activity was measured in a radiochemical assay by use of tritiated chitin as the substrate (8, 10). For each tissue sample, triplicate assays were performed over a range of different protein concentrations.
- 19. Rhizoctonia solani (AG-4, isolated from peanut), was inoculated into a medium consisting of 800 g of quartz sand, 25 g (dry weight) of Cream of Wheat, 30 g of corn meal, and 75 ml of water, incubated in the light at 25°C for 2 weeks and dried at room temperature for 3 days. Inoculum was stored at 4°C and used for up to a year. Because pathogenicity varied with preparation and age of inoculum, the amount of fungal inoculum required to yield about 50% seedling mortality on control or wild-type plants was empirically deter-mined. Tobacco seedlings (18-day-old) or canola seedlings (7-day-old) were transplanted into inoculated potting medium (metromix 300 or quartz sand); plants sowed in sand were watered with Hoagland's solution [D. R. Hoagland and D. I. Aron, Calif. Agric. Exp. Circ. 347 (1950)]. Tobacco plants were grown in environmental chambers at 24°C for 12 hours under mixed cool, white fluorescent and incandescent lights and at 20°C in the dark for 12 hours, with approximately 80% relative humidity. Canola plants were maintained at 20°C under 16-hour days/8-hour nights and 50% relative humidity.
- 20. N. A. Anderson, Annu. Rev. Phytopathol. 20, 329 (1982).
- 21. For each experiment, 16 to 20 replicate plants were used. Numbers are the mean and standard error of the percent seedling mortality relative to the con-(548) and represent data obtained from three trol to five separate infection experiments. The values for individual transformants are as follows: 28.1 ± 3.8 for 230;  $37.1 \pm 1.7$  for 238;  $34.6 \pm 3.3$  for 329;  $22.7 \pm 1.8$  for 373; and  $53.2 \pm 6.7$  for control 548
- 22. Twenty replicate plants were used, and each exper-

22 NOVEMBER 1991

iment was repeated four times; numbers are the mean and standard error of the percentage of dead plants

- D. F. Bateman and R. D. Lumsden, *Phytopathology* 55, 734 (1965); M. C. Shephard and R. K. S. Wood, *Ann. Appl. Biol.* 51, 389 (1963).
- J. Molano, I. Polacheck, A. Duran, E. Cabib, J. Biol. Chem. 254, 4901 (1979).
- 25. R. Shapira, A. Ordentlich, I. Chet, A. B. Oppenheim, Phytopathology 79, 1246 (1989); N. Benhamou, K. Broglie, I. Chet, R. Broglie, unpublished results. J.-M. Neuhaus, P. Ahl-Goy, U. Hinz, S. Flores, F.
- Meins, Plant Mol. Biol. 16, 141 (1991). 27
- Transgenic B. napus plants were obtained by Agro-bacterium infection of hypocotyl explants essentially as outlined in S. E. Radke *et al.*, *Theor. Appl. Genet.* **75**, 685 (1988). The 35S-chitinase gene was carried on a binary plasmid pMChAD (M. Locke, unpublished results) and introduced into A. tumefaciens

LBA4404. The pMChAD was assembled from the parent binary vector pZS97 (10) and contains in addition to the 35S-chitinase gene a sulfonylurearesistant acetolactate synthase gene from tobacco [M. E. Hartnett et al., in Managing Resistance to Agrochemicals, M. B. Green, H. M. LeBaron, W. K. Moberg, Eds. [American Chemical Society (ACS) Symposium Series 421, ACS, Washington, DC, 1990), pp. 459–473].

- 28. R. K. Gugel, S. M. Yitbarik, P. R. Verma, R. A. A. Morrall, R. S. Sadasivaiah, Can. J. Plant Pathol. 9, 119 (1987)
- 29. R. Broglie, G. Coruzzi, B. Keith, N.-H. Chua, Plant Mol. Biol. 3, 431 (1984).
- We are grateful to M. Fielding for insights and 30. encouragement during the initial phase of this study and M. Locke for constructing pMChAD.

2 July 1991; accepted 16 September 1991

## Binding of ARF and $\beta$ -COP to Golgi Membranes: Possible Regulation by a Trimeric G Protein

Julie G. Donaldson, Richard A. Kahn, JENNIFER LIPPINCOTT-SCHWARTZ, RICHARD D. KLAUSNER

The binding of cytosolic coat proteins to organelles may regulate membrane structure and traffic. Evidence is presented that a small guanosine triphosphate (GTP)-binding protein, the adenosine diphosphate ribosylation factor (ARF), reversibly associates with the Golgi apparatus in an energy, GTP, and fungal metabolite brefeldin A (BFA)-sensitive manner similar to, but distinguishable from, the 110-kilodalton cytosolic coat protein  $\beta$ -COP. Addition of  $\beta\gamma$  subunits of G proteins inhibited the association of both ARF and  $\beta$ -COP with Golgi membranes that occurred upon incubation with guanosine 5'-O-(3-thiotriphosphate) (GTP-y-S). Thus, heterotrimeric G proteins may function to regulate the assembly of coat proteins onto the Golgi membrane.

YTOSOLIC PROTEINS THAT BIND REversibly to membranes of the Golgi complex have been identified (1, 2)and shown to exist as a high molecular weight complex in the cytosol referred to as the coatomer (3). Cycling between the cytosol and Golgi membrane of at least one of these proteins, the 110-kD coat protein  $\beta$ -COP (4), is affected by nonhydrolyzable analogs of GTP such as GTP-y-S and by BFA (5-7). BFA inhibits the association of cytosolic β-COP with Golgi membranes. Aluminum fluoride and GTP-γ-S both promote association of  $\beta$ -COP with Golgi membranes, suggesting that one or more GTP-binding proteins participate in initiating the association of  $\beta$ -COP with the membrane (6-8).

Two general classes of regulatory GTPbinding proteins have been defined: the signal transducing trimeric G proteins, believed to exert their effects at the plasma membrane, and the family of small GTPbinding proteins (the RAS superfamily). Several of the small GTP-binding proteins have been implicated in the control of intracellular membrane traffic (9, 10). One of these GTP-binding proteins, the adenodiphosphate ribosylation factor sine (ARF), is associated with Golgi membrane and is also present in the cytosol (9).

We used immunofluorescence microscopy to study the effects of various agents that influence energy status, disrupt the Golgi complex, or alter the activity of G proteins or small GTP-binding proteins on the cellular localization of ARF and β-COP in normal rat kidney (NRK) cells. Immunolabeling of ARF and β-COP in untreated cells revealed a predominant Golgi-like staining pattern, which was juxtanuclear and half-moon shaped (Fig. 1). A low amount of ARF staining was also observed throughout the cytosol. Double labeling with antibodies to mannosidase II confirmed the Golgi distribution of both ARF and  $\beta$ -COP (11). Treatment of cells with 50 mM 2-deoxyglucose and 0.05% Na azide (DOGAz) for 10 min at 37°C to

J. G. Donaldson, J. Lippincott-Schwartz, R. D. Klaus-ner, Cell Biology and Metabolism Branch, National Institute of Child Health and Human Development, National Institutes of Health, Bethesda, MD 20892. R. A. Kahn, Laboratory of Biological Chemistry, Divi-sion of Cancer Treatment, National Cancer Institute, National Institutes of Health, Bethesda, MD 20892.