

and Ukrainian scientists have also gathered health data that should provide grist for international studies.

RICHARD STONE

## Many Citations Support Global Warming Trend

**ARGUING AGAINST CONCLUSIONS ABOUT** global warming reached by Donald Kennedy in his Editorial "An unfortunate U-turn on carbon" (30 Mar., p. 2515), S. Fred Singer says, "...the overwhelming balance of evidence shows no appreciable warming trend in the past 60 years; hence, it is unlikely to be significant in the future" (Letters, "Global warming: an insignificant trend?" 11 May, p. 1063). He is wrong on both counts.

The evidence for warming over the last 60 years is unequivocal, even if the direct instrumental record is ignored. The change in temperature has led to a major reduction in the mass of alpine glaciers in almost all parts of the world (1), an increase in permafrost thawing at high latitudes (2) and at high altitudes (3), a reduction in the extent and thickness of Arctic sea-ice (4), later

"...regardless of arguments over instrumental versus satellite-based estimates of [global] warming... there are multiple indicators of warming in the 20th century..."

freeze-up and earlier break-up dates of ice on rivers and lakes (5), and an increase in the calving rate of Antarctic ice shelves (6). There is no evidence or reason to think that these systems have a lag response to warming of 50 years or more [e.g., (7)]. There have also been shifts in the distribution of plant and animal species, both latitudinally and altitudinally (8), changes in the phenology of plant leafing and flowering (9), and the storage of significant quantities of heat in the near-surface ocean (10), as well as an overall rise in sea-level driven by both continental ice melting and a steric change due to the increase in overall ocean temperature (11). In addition, there have been remarkable increases in ground temperatures over the last millennium (12).

Thus, regardless of arguments over instrumental versus satellite-based estimates of warming in recent decades (13), there are multiple indicators of warming in the 20th century that paint a vivid picture of the global-scale environmental consequences of the temperature increase. Going forward in time, the accelerating rate of fossil fuel consumption will drive global temperatures to levels not seen in at least a millennium, and probably higher than for many thousands of years. This scenario will play out in a world whose population will increase by 50% over the next century.

RAYMOND S. BRADLEY

Department of Geosciences, Morrill Science Center, University of Massachusetts, Amherst, MA 01003, USA. E-mail: rbradley@geo.umass.edu

### References and Notes

1. M. B. Dyurgerov, M. F. Meier, *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A.* **97**, 1406 (2000); L. G. Thompson *et al.*, *Glob. Planet. Change* **7**, 145 (1993); H. H. Brecher, L. G. Thompson, *Photogramm. Eng. Remote Sens.* **59**, 1017 (1993).
2. T. E. Osterkamp, V. E. Romanovsky, *Permafrost Periglacial Proc.* **10**, 17 (1999).
3. H. Jin *et al.*, *Glob. Planet. Change* **26**, 387 (2000).
4. D. A. Rothrock *et al.*, *Geophys. Res. Lett.* **26**, 3469 (1999); P. Wadhams, N. R. Davis, *Geophys. Res. Lett.* **27**, 3973 (2001); K. Vinnikov *et al.*, *Science* **286**, 1934 (1999).
5. J. J. Magnuson *et al.*, *Science* **289**, 1743 (2000).
6. T. A. Scambos *et al.*, *Ann. Glaciol.* **46**, 516 (2000).
7. G. Patzelt, M. Aellen, *Mitt. Naturforsch. Versuchsanst. Wasserbau Hydrol. Glaziologie ETH Zurich* **108**, 49 (1990).
8. G. Grabherr *et al.*, *Nature* **369**, 448 (1994); H. Pauli *et al.*, *World Resources Rev.* **8**, 382 (1996).
9. R. B. Myneni *et al.*, *Nature* **386**, 698 (1997).
10. S. Levitus *et al.*, *Science* **287**, 2225 (2000).
11. R. Warrick, J. Oerlemans, in *Climate Change: The IPCC Scientific Assessment*, J. T. Houghton *et al.*, Eds. (Cambridge Univ. Press, Cambridge, 1990).
12. S. Huang *et al.*, *Nature* **403**, 756 (2000); R. N. Harris, D. S. Chapman, *Geophys. Res. Lett.* **28**, 747 (2001).
13. National Research Council, *Reconciling Observations of Global Temperature Change* (National Academy Press, Washington, DC, 2000).

## The Scope of Medieval Warming

**HEMISPHERIC MEAN TEMPERATURES THAT** have been reconstructed with a wide range of climate proxies indicate that temperatures were warmer in Medieval times than during the subsequent "Little Ice Age" (~1550 to 1850) (1). However, all studies of large-scale climate variations reveal some regions that do not follow the global or hemispheric trend [for example, (2)], so selecting a few data points, as W. S. Broecker does in his Perspective (*Science's* Compass, 23 Feb., p. 1497), adds little to resolving the title question he poses: "Was the Medieval Warm Period global?"

Furthermore, Broecker's statement that only borehole temperatures and snowlines can reconstruct temperatures to within 0.5°C is not supported in the literature. Reconstructing global temperature re-



## ...and vision.

There is much more to PNA than you might expect. PNA has the potential to bring significant improvements to routine molecular techniques, and creates a new dimension of capability for the entire diagnostic testing industry. Boston Probes' license rights and intellectual property comprise the most extensive PNA portfolio in the world.

To find out what the leader in PNA technology can do to accelerate your success, call 888.488.3312 or visit our Web site: [www.bostonprobes.com](http://www.bostonprobes.com)



Probes

## SCIENCE'S COMPASS

quires a geographically extensive network of data. Studies that have analyzed data from a wider range of instruments than Broecker mentions (1, 3) conclude that 20th century warming is unprecedented, in both rate and magnitude, compared with warming during the past 1000 years.

Medieval climate was clearly unusual in some areas (4), and further regional studies are needed. These might help determine if Broecker's hypothesis of a change in thermohaline circulation holds water.

RAYMOND S. BRADLEY,<sup>1</sup>\* KEITH R. BRIFFA,<sup>2</sup>  
THOMAS J. CROWLEY,<sup>3</sup> MALCOLM K. HUGHES,<sup>4</sup>  
PHILIP D. JONES,<sup>2</sup> MICHAEL E. MANN<sup>5</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Geosciences, University of Massachusetts, Amherst, MA 01003, USA. <sup>2</sup>Climatic Research Unit, University of East Anglia, Norwich NR4 7TJ, UK. <sup>3</sup>Department of Oceanography, Texas A&M University, College Station, TX 77843, USA. <sup>4</sup>Laboratory of Tree-Ring Research, University of Arizona, Tucson, AZ 85721, USA. <sup>5</sup>Department of Environmental Sciences, University of Virginia, Charlottesville, VA 22903, USA

\*To whom correspondence should be addressed.  
E-mail: rbradley@geo.umass.edu

### References and Notes

1. P. D. Jones *et al.*, *Holocene* **8**, 455 (1998); M. E. Mann, R. S. Bradley, M. K. Hughes, *Geophys. Res. Lett.* **26**,

759 (1999); T. J. Crowley, T. S. Lowery, *Ambio* **29**, 51 (2000).

2. P. D. Jones *et al.*, *Rev. Geophys.* **37**, 173 (1999).
3. M. K. Hughes, H. F. Diaz, *Clim. Change* **26**, 109 (1996); K. R. Briffa *et al.*, *J. Geophys. Res.* **106D**, 2929 (2001).
4. S. Stine, in *Water, Environment and Society in Times of Climatic Change*, A. S. Issar, N. Brown, Eds. (Kluwer, Dordrecht, Netherlands, 1998), pp. 43–67; M. K. Hughes, G. Funkhauser, in *The Impacts of Climate Variability on Forests*, M. Beniston, J. L. Innes, Eds. (Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 1998), pp. 99–107; C. Pfister *et al.*, *Holocene* **8**, 535 (1998); V. C. LaMarche, *Science* **183**, 1043 (1974); D. Dahl-Jensen *et al.*, *Science* **282**, 268 (1998).

## CORRECTIONS AND CLARIFICATIONS

**REVIEW:** "Mechanism of Actin-Based Motility" by D. Pantaloni, C. Le Clainche, M.-F. Carlier (25 May, p. 1502). In the legend for Fig. 3, the name of C. Sykes was misspelled. In reference 69, the name of V. Noireaux was misspelled.

**NEWS OF THE WEEK:** "SDI Redux has one element critics like" by Daniel Charles (11 May, p. 1035). The statement "But the skeptics believe that the Administration has other foes in mind. 'They want to counter China and get a start on Russia,' says Richard Garwin, a senior science fellow" is in error. What Garwin said was that many of the most fervent supporters of national

missile defense are not primarily interested in countering North Korea, Iran, and Iraq. These supporters are the "they" of Garwin's quotation, not "the Administration."

**PERSPECTIVES:** "Unwrapping glial cells from the synapse: what lies inside?" by Vittorio Gallo and Ramesh Chittajallu (4 May, p. 872). The first sentence of the sixth paragraph should have read "Iino *et al.* (4) modified the molecular composition of AMPA receptors in Bergmann glia by infecting these cells" (not "Purkinje cells") "with a recombinant adenovirus containing the coding region of the GluR2 gene."

## Letters to the Editor

Letters (~300 words) discuss material published in *Science* in the previous 6 months or issues of general interest. They can be submitted by e-mail (science\_letters@aaas.org), the Web (www.letter2science.org), or regular mail (1200 New York Ave., NW, Washington, DC 20005, USA). Letters are not acknowledged upon receipt, nor are authors generally consulted before publication. Whether published in full or in part, letters are subject to editing for clarity and space.

## Spectrum Laboratory Products

just a... **CLICK** away



**11,000 Fine CHEMICALS and SUPPLIES**

[www.spectrumchemical.com](http://www.spectrumchemical.com)

Circle No. 55 on Readers' Service Card

Phase II expansion of our  
production facility in  
Hollister, CA will greatly  
increase our ability to  
deliver the highest  
quality nude mice.

CD-1® nu  
BALB/c nu  
NIH-bg-nu-xid  
NU/NU-nu

**CHARLES RIVER  
LABORATORIES**  
Contributing to the Search for Healthier Lives®

In US call 877-CRIVER-1 • Belgium 32 2 268 10 93  
France 33 4 74 01 69 69 • Germany 0049 9761 406 0  
Italy 39 039 509 915 • Japan 81 45 474 9340  
Spain 34 93 71 92 740 • UK 01843 823575  
[www.criver.com](http://www.criver.com)  
© Charles River Laboratories, Inc., 2001

Circle No. 24 on Readers' Service Card