- 3. D. J. Tholen, Sky Telescope 60, 203 (1980).
- V. Žappalà, M. Ďi Martino, F. Scaltriti, G. Djurašević, Z. Knežević, Icarus 53, 458 (1983).
- 5. D. W. Dunham, Occultation Newsl. 2, 139 (1981). 6. \_\_\_\_\_, Sky Telescope 83, 73 (1992).
- 7. D. L. Mitchell et al., Icarus 118, 105 (1995).
- F. Marchis, D. Hestroffer, A. Cellino, P. Tanga, V. Zappalà, *IAU Circ.* 7308 (Smithsonian Astrophysical Observatory, Cambridge, MA, 1999).
- J. K. Harmon, R. E. Arvidson, E. A. Guinness, B. A. Campbell, M. A. Slade, *J. Geophys. Res.* **104**, 14065 (1999).
- 10. P. Magnusson et al., Icarus 85, 229 (1990).
- 11. R. S. Hudson and S. J. Ostro, *Science* **263**, 940 (1994). 12. \_\_\_\_\_, *Science* **270**, 84 (1995).
- The accuracy of our inversion technique has been calibrated with extensive Monte Carlo simulations and laboratory laser-radar experiments (14).
- A. K. Andrews, R. S. Hudson, D. Psaltis, *Opt. Lett.* 20, 2327 (1995).
- 15. Inversions with disparate initial conditions (including an ellipsoid and, to test the possibility that a binary system might explain the images, two co-orbiting spheres) each vielded a dumbbell shape.
- 16. D. L. Mitchell et al., Icarus 124, 113 (1996).

- REPORTS
- R. A. Simpson and G. L. Tyler, *IEEE Trans. Antennas Propag.* AP-30, 438 (1982).
- 18. C. Magri et al., Icarus 140, 379 (1999).
- 19. S. J. Ostro et al., Science 252, 1399 (1991).
- W. D. Carrier III, J. K. Mitchell, A. Mahmood, Proc. Lunar Sci. Conf. 4, 2403 (1973).
- D. J. Scheeres, S. J. Ostro, R. S. Hudson, E. M. DeJong, S. Suzuki, *Icarus* 132, 53 (1998).
- 22. A. N. Strahler, *The Earth Sciences* (Harper & Row, New York, ed. 3, 1971).
- D. S. McKay, T. D. Swindle, R. Greenberg, in Asteroids *II*, R. P. Binzel, T. Gehrels, M. S. Matthews, Eds. (Univ. of Arizona Press, Tucson, 1989), pp. 617–642.
- 24. Our data and model alone do not rule out the presence of an empty gap, up to a few kilometers wide, in the middle of the asteroid. However, such a gap would require our model's internal density to be <3.4 g cm<sup>-3</sup>, below our lower limit on the asteroid's surface bulk density.
- W. K. Hartmann and D. P. Cruikshank, *Icarus* 36, 353 (1978).
- W. K. Hartmann, in Asteroids, T. Gehrels, Ed. (Univ. of Arizona Press, Tucson, 1979), pp. 466-479.
- 27. Z. M. Leinhardt, D. C. Richardson, T. Quinn, *Icarus*, in press.

## Large-Scale Thermal Events in the Solar Nebula: Evidence from Fe,Ni Metal Grains in Primitive Meteorites

## Anders Meibom,<sup>1\*†</sup> Steven J. Desch,<sup>2</sup> Alexander N. Krot,<sup>1</sup> Jeffrey N. Cuzzi,<sup>2</sup> Michael I. Petaev,<sup>3</sup> Lionel Wilson,<sup>4</sup> Klaus Keil<sup>1,5</sup>

Chemical zoning patterns in some iron, nickel metal grains from CH carbonaceous chondrites imply formation at temperatures from 1370 to 1270 kelvin by condensation from a solar nebular gas cooling at a rate of  $\sim$ 0.2 kelvin per hour. This cooling rate requires a large-scale thermal event in the nebula, in contrast to the localized, transient heating events inferred for chondrule formation. In our model, mass accretion through the protoplanetary disk caused large-scale evaporation of precursor dust near its midplane inside of a few astronomical units. Gas convectively moved from the midplane to cooler regions above it, and the metal grains condensed in these parcels of rising gas.

Chondrules and Ca,Al-rich inclusions (CAIs) in primitive meteorites (chondrites) offer insights into events that took place in the solar nebula during the earliest stages of planetary formation  $\sim$ 4.56 billion years ago. Chondrules are millimeter-sized silicate spherules that formed by

\*To whom correspondence should be addressed. Email: meibom@pangea.stanford.edu

†Present address: Department of Geological and Environmental Sciences, Stanford University, Building 320, Lomita Mall, Stanford, CA 94305-2115, USA. melting of solids during localized, transient, and repetitive heating events with peak temperatures in the range of 1800 to 2100 K [e.g., (1)]. Dynamic crystallization experiments reproduce chondrule textures similar to those of the most abundant porphyritic chondrules only when the cooling rate is ~100 to 1000 K hour<sup>-1</sup> (2, 3). The CAIs consist of refractory silicate and oxide minerals that are inferred to condense out of a cooling gas of solar composition [e.g., (4)]. However, most CAIs have experienced subsequent thermal processing resulting in melting and evaporation [e.g., (5)]. Comparison with dynamic crystallization experiments constrains the cooling rates of CAIs that crystallized from melts (type B) to 2 to 50 K hour<sup>-1</sup> at temperatures around 1700 to 1800 K (6). In this way, chondrules and CAIs offer important constraints on the thermal evolution of the solar nebula during processing of preexisting solids. However, constraints on the thermal evolution

- D. R. Davis, C. R. Chapman, R. Greenberg, S. J. Weidenschilling, A. W. Harris, in *Asteroids*, T. Gehrels, Ed. (Univ. of Arizona Press, Tucson, 1979), pp. 528–557.
- 29. P. Farinella, P. Paolicchi, V. Zappalà, *Icarus* 52, 409 (1982).
- E. Asphaug, S. J. Ostro, R. S. Hudson, D. J. Scheeres, W. Benz, *Nature* 393, 437 (1998).
- C. R. Chapman, W. J. Merline, P. Thomas, *Icarus* 140, 28 (1999).
- 32. Part of this research was conducted at the Jet Propulsion Laboratory, operated by the California Institute of Technology under contract with NASA. The Arecibo Observatory is part of the National Astronomy and Ionosphere Center, which is operated by Cornell University under a cooperative agreement with NSF with support from NASA. R.S.H. was partially supported by NASA grant NAGW-4636. D.J.S. was partially supported by NASA grant NAGW-9017. D.B.C. was partially supported by NASA grant NAG 5-4220. C.M. was partially supported by NASA grant NAG 5-4220. C.M. was partially supported by NSF grant AST-9973216. We are grateful to A. Crespo, P. Perillat, S. Suzuki, A. Hine, J. K. Harmon, E. M. DeJong and the staff of the Arecibo Observatory.

10 February 2000; accepted 27 March 2000

of the nebula gas during formation of the first solids by gas-solid condensation are lacking.

Recently, Fe,Ni metal grains with chemical zoning patterns in Fe, Ni, Co, and Cr resulting from gas-solid condensation (7-12) were described in CH, CR, and Bencubbin-like chondrites (13-15). Some metal grains in CH chondrites, amounting to a fraction  $(10^{-4} \text{ to } 10^{-2})$ of all metal grains, appear to have condensed from a gas of solar composition at a total gas pressure of  $\sim 10^{-4}$  bar at temperatures from 1370 to 1270 K (13). During this process, the metal grains must have grown sufficiently fast and the gas must have cooled sufficiently fast to avoid homogenization of the zoned patterns by solid-state diffusion. Here we estimate the growth rate of the zoned metal grains, obtain a cooling rate for the region of the nebula from which they condensed, and discuss a possible astrophysical setting of this event.

We model gas-solid condensation of metal grains from a cooling gas of solar composition at a total pressure of  $10^{-4}$  bar. For simplicity, we assume that the growing metal grains are spherical in shape and consist of Fe atoms [zoned metal grains contain <10 weight % (wt %) Ni, Co, and Cr] and that the metal grains grow by Fe atoms continuously colliding with and sticking to the surface of the growing grain with a sticking coefficient of 1 (16, 17). The number of hits of Fe atoms per second on a sphere of radius *a* is  $Z = \pi a^2 n_{g}$ (Fe) $V_{avg}$ (Fe), where  $n_o(Fe)$  is the number density of Fe atoms in the gas and  $V_{avg}(Fe) = (8kT/\pi m_{Fe})^{1/2}$  is the mean speed of Fe atoms in the gas (Maxwell distribution) [where k is the Boltzmann constant, T is the temperature (in K), and  $m_{\rm Fe}$  is the atomic weight of the Fe atom]. The number density of Fe atoms in solid Fe metal is  $n_s$ (Fe), and the growth rate of the sphere is  $n_{\rm s}({\rm Fe})4\pi a^2 da = Zdt \Rightarrow da/dt = n_{\rm s}({\rm Fe})V_{\rm avg}({\rm Fe})/dt$  $4n_{c}$  (Fe), where t is time. In gas of solar composition (18) at 1320 K and  $10^{-4}$  bar,  $n_o$ (Fe) =  $3 \times 10^{16} \text{ m}^{-3}$  and  $V_{avg}(\text{Fe}) = 705 \text{ m s}^{-1}$ . The

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Hawai'i Institute of Geophysics and Planetology, School of Ocean and Earth Science and Technology, University of Hawai'i at Manoa, Honolulu, HI 96822, USA. <sup>2</sup>NASA Ames Research Center, Mail Stop 245-3, Moffett Field, CA 94035, USA. <sup>3</sup>Harvard-Smithsonian Center for Astrophysics, 60 Garden Street, Mail Stop 52, Cambridge, MA 02138, USA. <sup>4</sup>Environmental Science Department, Institute of Environmental and Natural Sciences, Lancaster University, Lancaster LA1 4YQ, UK. <sup>5</sup>Hawai'i Center for Volcanology, University of Hawai'i at Manoa, Honolulu, HI 96822, USA.

parameter  $n_{\rm s}$ (Fe) =  $8.4 \times 10^{28}$  m<sup>-3</sup>. Thus, we get  $da/dt \approx 6 \times 10^{-11}$  m s<sup>-1</sup>, which can be integrated to obtain the time,  $t_{\rm growth}$ , required to grow a grain of radius *a*. For a grain with radius  $a \approx 100 \mu$ m (typical size of zoned metal grains), we obtain  $t_{\rm growth} \approx 19$  days.

This  $t_{\text{growth}}$  needs to be compared with the time scale on which solid-state diffusion of Ni, Co, and Cr would cause homogenization of the zoning pattern  $(t_{diff})$ . In order for solidstate diffusion of Ni to cause substantial homogenization of a zoned metal grain with radius  $a = 100 \mu m$ , a minimum average diffusion length of  $\sim 25 \ \mu m$  is required. The time scale for diffusion over a length scale, d, is  $t_{\text{diff}} = d^2/D_{\text{Ni}}$ ,  $D_{\text{Ni}}$  being the diffusion coefficient of Ni (~10<sup>-12</sup> cm<sup>2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> at T =1400 K). Accounting for the decrease in  $D_{Ni}$ with decreasing temperature (19, 20),  $t_{\text{diff}} = 10^{(-9.74 + 15250/T)}d$ . At T = 1300 K and d =25  $\mu$ m, homogenization takes  $t_{diff} = 100$ days. At T = 1000 K, homogenization takes  $t_{\rm diff} = 1000$  years. Because  $t_{\rm diff} \gg t_{\rm growth}$ , we infer that the zoned metal grains condensed fast enough to avoid being homogenized by solid-state diffusion.

Because the temperature interval during condensation of the zoned metal grains is  $\Delta T \approx 100$  K, the cooling rate of the nebula gas (and the solids entrained in it) is  $\Delta T/t_{\text{growth}} \approx 0.2$  K hour<sup>-1</sup>. This cooling rate is substantially slower than those inferred for chondrule or CAI melts (2).

Consider the thermal adjustment time  $(t_{rad})$ , i.e., the time scale on which a parcel of gas of size *d* achieves thermal equilibrium with its surroundings by exchange of radiation (21):

$$t_{\rm rad} = \rho^2 \kappa c_{\rm p} d^2 / 64 \sigma T^3 \tag{1}$$

where  $c_p = 1.25 \times 10^8 \text{ erg g}^{-1} \text{ K}^{-1}$  is the heat capacity of the gas,  $\rho = 2.1 \times 10^{-9} \text{ g cm}^{-3}$  is its density, and  $\sigma$  is the Stefan-Boltzmann constant. The Rosseland mean opacity of the gas,  $\kappa$ , is dominated by silicates, which largely condense out of the gas before the Fe,Ni metal; we therefore assume that  $\kappa \approx 3 \text{ cm g}^{-1}$  (22). At

T = 1320 K, even as large a region as d = $3.6 \times 10^5$  km (such as considered below) will reach thermal equilibrium in only about 3 days. For a transiently heated region of the nebula to cool on longer time scales, such as those relevant to zoned metal grain condensation ( $t_{cool} =$  $t_{\rm growth} = 19$  days), the region would have to be millions of kilometers across, comparable to the scale height of the protoplanetary disk and much larger than inferred for chondrule formation (e.g., shock waves). Although shock waves from infalling planetesimals (23, 24) could possibly heat gas on these large length scales, the heating occurs high above the midplane of the disk, where the density of the gas is substantially lower ( $\rho \ll 10^{-9} \text{ g cm}^{-3}$ ) than that inferred for metal condensation. We propose instead that the zoned Fe,Ni metal grains condensed in a very large parcel of nebula gas as it convectively ascended from the hot nebula midplane into the cold, dusty regions above it.

Inward radial evolution of matter through the protoplanetary disk liberates gravitational potential energy that heats the disk (25). Early in the disk's evolution, the mass accretion rate may be on the order of  $dM/dt = 10^{-6}$  solar masses  $(M_{\odot})$  year<sup>-1</sup>, during which the midplane temperature in the innermost several astronomical units (AU) exceeded  $\sim$ 1400 K (26), enough to vaporize most solids (27). Under such circumstances, the midplane region becomes optically thin with essentially the same temperature throughout. Thermal energy is transported from the midplane region to the dusty surface regions mostly by radiative diffusion. However, if heat is transported to the disk surface by radiation alone, the resultant temperature gradient in the dusty regions becomes superadiabatic and protoplanetary disks are therefore predicted to be convective as well (26) (Fig. 1). The velocities  $(v_{conv})$  associated with convection in the dusty layers of the disk can be estimated (21) from

$$F_{\rm conv} \approx 4\rho c_{\rm p} T v_{\rm conv}^3 / g l_{\rm m} \tag{2}$$

where  $F_{\rm conv}$  is the heat flux through the disk carried by convection,  $l_{\rm m}$  is the mixing length



**Fig. 1.** Schematic representation of a cross section through the protoplanetary disk of the sun. Matter falls on the disk and accretes into the sun through the midplane of the disk. Inward of 1 AU from the sun, the midplane temperature becomes high enough to evaporate dust. Convection carries heat from the midplane to the surface of the disk, and the zoned Fe,Ni metal grains condense as the gas rises and cools through the 1370 to 1270 K temperature interval.

of convection, and  $g = \Omega^2 z$  is the gravitational acceleration [where  $\Omega$  is the orbital frequency and  $z \approx 2H$ ; H is the scale height of the disk, about  $10^7$  km at 1 AU (26)]. The major uncertainty in the convection velocity is the mixing length  $l_m$ , an upper limit for which we estimate as 2H. The smallest  $l_m$ consistent with this model is roughly 0.04 H, the vertical distance between the T = 1370 K and the T = 1270 K levels, as shown below. It is assumed that convection in the dusty layers above the midplane carries about 10% of the total heat flux (F) through the disk:  $F = (3/8\pi)\Omega^2 dM/dt$  (26). Using these parameters and assuming the pressure at z = 2H is about 0.1 times the pressure at the midplane, the range of convective velocities based on the uncertain mixing length is  $9.4 \times 10^3$  to  $3.5 \times 10^4$  cm s<sup>-1</sup> = 0.04 to 0.16c, where c is the sound speed at the midplane ( $\sim 2.2$  km  $s^{-1}$ ). Such convective velocities are realistic for the solar nebula and perhaps even required for convection to overcome the radial inward drift of gas at velocities of ~0.01 km  $s^{-1}$  (28).

The length of time taken for rising gas to cool from 1370 to 1270 K can be estimated if the temperature gradient in the condensation zone is known. We assume a radiative temperature gradient (21) in this temperature interval:

$$dT/dz = 3F\rho\kappa/16\sigma T^3 \tag{3}$$

With the same parameters and heat flux as above, the temperature drop from 1370 to 1270 K is achieved over a distance of  $3.6 \times 10^5$  km, which is a small fraction of *H*. With the range of convective velocities derived above, the rising gas takes from 12 to 44 days to cross this region, which is in good agreement with the time it takes to grow a zoned Fe,Ni metal grain by condensation (19 days). Because the thermal adjustment time (Eq. 1) for the rising gas is about 3 days, this gas is in good thermal equilibrium with its surroundings and cannot be considered to be adiabatic until higher into the dusty region, justifying the use of the radiative temperature gradient.

After their formation, some of the metal grains in CH chondrites escaped within a few years (at T = 1200 K,  $t_{\rm diff} \sim 2.5$  years) to regions of the solar nebula with midplane temperatures low enough (T < 1000 K) to make homogenization by solid-state diffusion ineffective ( $t_{\rm diff} > 10^3$  years). These regions are about 0.3 AU farther from the sun than regions with midplane temperatures T > 1300 K, where metal condensed (26). Convective updrafts alternate with adjacent downdrafts in the protoplanetary disk (29) (Fig. 1). When Fe,Ni metal grains in a convective updraft reach their maximum height above the midplane, about 50% enter the downdraft closer to the sun and about 50% enter the downdraft farther away from the sun. However, the convective cells will be turbulent (30), and turbulent diffusion can transport some metal grains out of a convective downdraft (into an updraft) before they are brought down to the midplane. The diffusivity of a particle in a convective eddy is  $k \approx l_m v_{conv}$ , and the turnover time of the eddy is comparable to  $l_{\rm m}/v_{\rm conv}$ , so that particles can diffuse about one mixing length. Let  $\Delta r$  be the radial width of the convection cell. The fraction of particles in a downdraft that diffuses outward and into an adjacent updraft before falling halfway to the midplane is  $0.5x[1 - erf(0.28\Delta r/l_m)]$ . If  $\Delta r =$  $l_{\rm m}$ , this fraction is about one-third (0.345). Of this fraction of particles that diffuses into the neighboring updraft,  $\sim$  50% will be transported to a downdraft even farther away, and the process can repeat. The width of a convection cell is likely to be about one mixing length (29), and we assume that  $\Delta r = l_m = H$  (yielding  $t_{\text{growth}} = 15$  days). In this case, particles must migrate outward through about three updrafts and three downdrafts ( $\sim 0.3$  AU) before escaping safely to cooler regions. The fraction that does so is  $(0.5)^3(0.345)^3 = 5 \times 10^{-3}$ . Thus, turbulence induced by convection can transport some Fe,Ni metal grains outward from the sun without sweeping them all the way to the midplane. These particles would not experience temperatures high enough to be vaporized or become homogenized by solid-state diffusion. The fraction of Fe,Ni metal grains that in this way retain their zoning is consistent with the observed relative abundance of zoned metal grains in CH chondrites ( $10^{-4}$  to  $10^{-2}$ ).

The high temperatures and the high heat flux implied in our model require a high mass flux  $(dM/dt = 10^{-6} M_{\odot} \text{ year}^{-1})$ , formation close to the sun ( $r \le 1 \text{ AU}$ ), or both.

## **References and Notes**

- J. N. Grossman, in *Meteorites and the Early Solar* System, J. F. Kerridge and M. S. Matthews, Eds. (Univ. of Arizona Press, Tucson, AZ, 1988), pp. 680–696.
- G. E. Lofgren, in *Chondrules and the Protoplanetary Disk*, R. E. Hewins, R. H. Jones, E. R. D. Scott, Eds. (Cambridge Univ. Press. Cambridge. 1996). pp. 187–196.
- Univ. Press, Cambridge, 1996), pp. 187-196.
  S. Weinbruch et al. [Meteorit. Planet. Sci. 32, 138 (1997)] concluded that the lower limit on chondrule cooling rates is 10 K hour<sup>-1</sup>. However, chondrule cooling rates near the lower limit have only been determined for relatively rare granular-olivine-pyroxene chondrules studied in the carbonaceous chondrite Allende. Porphyritic chondrules, which all have cooling rate estimates >100 K hour<sup>-1</sup>, are the most abundant type of chondrules by far and are considered the most representative of the chondrule-forming process.
- 4. L. Grossman and J. W. Larimer, *Rev. Geophys. Space Phys.* **12**, 71 (1974).
- G. J. MacPherson, D. A. Wark, J. T. Armstrong, in Meteorites and the Early Solar System, J. F. Kerridge and M. S. Matthews, Eds. (Univ. of Arizona Press, Tucson, AZ, 1988), pp. 746–807.
- E. Stolper and J. M. Paque, *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 50, 1785 (1986).
- 7. L. Grossman and E. Olsen, Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 38, 173 (1974).
- 8. W. R. Kelly and J. W. Larimer, Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 41, 93 (1977).
- Iron-nickel metal, which is an important component in chondritic meteorites, is thermodynamically predicted to form by gas-solid condensation from a gas of solar composition at temperatures between 1450 and 1100 K and pressures of 10<sup>-3</sup> to 10<sup>-5</sup> bar. With decreasing gas temperature, the condensing metal is inferred to

have decreasing Ni (30 to 5 wt %) and Co (0.8 to 0.2 wt %) concentrations (with a solar Co/Ni ratio) and increasing Cr (0 to 0.9 wt %) and Fe (70 to 95 wt %) concentrations. However, metal grains in most types of chondrites have subsequently experienced substantial secondary processing (e.g., melting, thermal metamorphism, and/or oxidation), which caused redistribution of Fe, Ni, Co, and Cr that partially or totally erased these chemical signatures of condensation.

- H. Y. McSween, Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 41, 477 (1977).
- B. Zanda, M. Bourot-Denise, C. Perron, *Lunar Planet*. Sci. Conf. 22, 1543 (1991).
- M. S. Lee, A. E. Rubin, J. T. Wasson, Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 56, 2521 (1992).
- A. Meibom et al., J. Geophys. Res. 104, 22053 (1999).
   M. K. Weisberg and M. Prinz, in 24th Symposium on Antarctic Meteorites, NIPR, Tokyo (National Institute for Polar Research, Tokyo, 1999), pp. 187–189.
- 15. An origin of the zoned Fe,Ni metal grains in CH chondrites by reduction of silicates during chondrule formation can be ruled out because (i) at igneous temperatures (>1600 K) during chondrule formation, solid-state diffusion of Fe, Ni, Co, and Cr is so rapid that zoned Fe,Ni metal grains, which typically are 100  $\mu$ m in radius, would become homogenized on a time scale of tens of minutes, comparable to the cooling time scale of most chondrules, and (ii) zoned Fe,Ni metal grains have never been observed inside chondrules.
- 16. D. E. Sanders and A. E. DePristo, *Surf. Sci.* **254**, 341 (1991).
- 17. The probability of sticking of metal atoms with thermal kinetic energies on a metal surface is nearly unity. The metal atoms become strongly accelerated as they approach the surface because of a deep (several eV) attractive well. When striking the surface, the atoms lose their kinetic energy ( $\sim$ 0.2 eV) to the lattice and are trapped. This does not preclude that some Fe atoms can desorp (leave the surface) at some later time because of thermal vibrations in the crystal lattice. The rate of desorption can be estimated from the vapor pressure of Fe at the temperatures in question. At 1370 K, the vapor pressure of Fe is  $\sim 10^{-7}$  bar, only a small fraction of the partial pressure of Fe in the nebula gas. Although desorption of Fe atoms from the growing grains does take place, it happens at a relatively low rate compared with the rate of bombardment (Z) and does not substantially slow down the growth of the metal grain.

- 18. E. Anders and N. Grevesse, Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 53, 197 (1989).
- D. C. Dean and J. I. Goldstein, *Metall. Trans.* 17A, 1131 (1986).
- The diffusion coefficients of Ni, Co, and Cr in γ-Fe are essentially identical, with Ni being slightly faster [D. R. Lide, Ed., Handbook of Chemistry of Physics (CRC Press, Boca Raton, FL, ed. 79, 1981)].
- 21. R. Kippenhahn and A. Weigert, *Stellar Structure and Evolution* (Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 1990).
  - 22. J. B. Pollack et al., Astrophys. J. 421, 615 (1994).
- 23. A. P. Boss and J. A. Graham, Icarus 106, 168 (1993).
- L. L. Hood and D. A. Kring, in *Chondrules and the* Protoplanetary Disk, R. E. Hewins, R. H. Jones, E. R. D. Scott, Eds. (Cambridge Univ. Press, Cambridge, 1996), pp. 265–276.
- D. C. Lin and J. Papaloizou, in *Protostars and Planets II*, D. C. Black and M. S. Matthews, Eds. (Univ. of Arizona Press, Tucson, AZ, 1985), pp. 981–1072.
- K. R. Bell, P. M. Cassen, H. H. Klahr, T. Henning, Astrophys. J. 486, 372 (1997).
- J. W. Larimer, in *Meteorites and the Early Solar System*, J. F. Kerridge and M. S. Matthews, Eds. (Univ. of Arizona Press, Tucson, AZ, 1988), pp. 375–389.
- M. Rozyczka, P. Bodenheimer, K. R. Bell, Astrophys. J. 423, 736 (1994).
- H. H. Klahr, T. Henning, W. Kley, Astrophys. J. 514, 325 (1999).
- J. N. Cuzzi, A. R. Dobrovolskis, R. C. Hogan, in *Chondrules and the Protoplanetary Disk*, R. H. Hewins, R. H. Jones, E. R. D. Scott, Eds. (Cambridge Univ. Press, Cambridge, 1996), pp. 35–43.
- 31. This collaboration between meteoriticists and astrophysicists was spurred by the 1999 Gordon Research Conference (Origins of Solar Systems), which brought together researchers from both disciplines in a highly inspiring scientific environment. Our work was supported by NASA grants 5-4212 (K. Keil, P.I.) and NAGW 3451 (J. A. Wood, P.I.) and NASA's Origins of Solar Systems program (J. Cuzzi, P.I.). A.M. is grateful for support from the Danish Natural Science Research Council. S.J.D. was supported by a National Research Council Research Associateship. We appreciate illuminating discussions with R. Bell, H. Klahr, A. Showman, A. Luntz, F. Besenbacher, T. Fagan, E. Scott, and J. Taylor.

7 December 1999; accepted 2 March 2000

## Age of Neoproterozoic Bilatarian Body and Trace Fossils, White Sea, Russia: Implications for Metazoan Evolution

M. W. Martin,<sup>1</sup>\* D. V. Grazhdankin,<sup>2</sup>† S. A. Bowring,<sup>1</sup> D. A. D. Evans,<sup>3</sup><sup>‡</sup> M. A. Fedonkin,<sup>2</sup> J. L. Kirschvink<sup>3</sup>

A uranium-lead zircon age for a volcanic ash interstratified with fossil-bearing, shallow marine siliciclastic rocks in the Zimnie Gory section of the White Sea region indicates that a diverse assemblage of body and trace fossils occurred before 555.3  $\pm$  0.3 million years ago. This age is a minimum for the oldest well-documented triploblastic bilaterian *Kimberella*. It also makes co-occurring trace fossils the oldest that are reliably dated. This determination of age implies that there is no simple relation between Ediacaran diversity and the carbon isotopic composition of Neoproterozoic seawater.

The terminal Neoproterozoic interval is characterized by a period of supercontinent amalgamation and dispersal (1, 2), low-latitude glaciations (3, 4), chemical perturbations of seawater (5-7), and the first appearance and subsequent diversification of metazoans. Construction of a terminal Neoproterozoic biostratigraphy has been hampered by preserva-