

z axes and mismatched along the y axis. For this example (A),  $n_{1x} = 1.57$ ,  $n_{1y} = 1.86$ ,  $n_{1z} = 1.57$ ,  $n_{2x}$ = 1.57,  $n_{2y}$  = 1.57,  $n_{2z}$  = 1.57, and  $n_0$  = 1.0. (B) When measured in the y direction, reflection shows a strong band at near 100% intensity. Along the x direction, there are only air interface reflections.

pass axis (x direction), neither s- nor p-polarized light is reflected by the multilayer stack for any angle of incidence, as the relevant index differences are zero.

Although more complex than a mirror with uniaxial symmetry, GBO design concepts for reflective polarizers can be applied separately for light polarized along each axis. The Fresnel and phase thickness equations given above hold for light incident with its polarization direction parallel to either the x axis or y axis. Reflective polarizers constructed with the polymers discussed above have a demonstrated extinction ratio of 300:1 averaged across all visible wavelengths at all angles of incidence.

## **References and Notes**

- 1. P. Baumeister and G. Pineus, Sci. Am. 223, 58 (December 1970).
- 2. P. Drude, Wied. Ann. 43, 146 (1891).
- , Ann. Phys. Chem. 38, 865 (1891). З.
- 4. D. Brewster, A Treatise on Optics (Lea & Blanchard, London, 1839)
- 5. M. Banning, J. Opt. Soc. Am. 37, 792 (1947).
- 6. P. Lissberger, Rep. Prog. Phys. 33, 197 (1970).
- 7. V. R. Costrich, Appl. Opt. 9, 866 (1970).
- 8. A. Thelen, Appl. Opt. 15, 2983 (1976).
- ., J. Opt. Soc. Am. 70, 118 (1980).
- 10. T. Ito, U.S. Patent 5,579,159 (26 November 1996).
- 11. T. Alfrey, E. F. Gurnee, W. J. Schrenk, Polym. Eng. Sci.
- 9. 400 (1969).
- 12. C. J. Heffelfinger and K. L. Knox, The Science & Technology of Polymer Films (Interscience, New York, 1971), D. 587.
- 13. D. A. Holmes and D. L. Feucht, J. Opt. Soc. Am. 56, 1763 (1966).

## REPORTS

- 14. R. M. A. Azzam and N. M. Bashara, Ellipsometry and Polarized Light (Elsevier, Amsterdam, 1987), p. 119.
- 15. D. W. Berreman, J. Opt. Soc. Am. 62, 502 (1972).
- 16. P. Yeh, J. Opt. Soc. Am. 69, 742 (1979).
- 17. I. Hodgkinson and Q. H. Wu, J. Opt. Soc. Am. A 10, 2065 (1993).
- 18. J. Lekner, J. Opt. Soc. Am. A 10, 2059 (1993).
- 19. Y. Fink et al., Science 282, 1679 (1998).
- 20. Optical stack designs with isotropic materials often compensate for this reduction of p-polarization reflectivity with incidence angle by increasing the number of unit cells in the multilayer stack to such a level that the reflectivity falloff is minimized. This approach can be quite successful for isotropic multilaver interference lavers with air as the external medium, but has limited utility when the external medium allows for larger propagation angles to be present in the stack
- R. M. A. Azzam and N. M. Bashara, in (14), p. 357 21. (corrected equation).
- M. Born and E. Wolf, Principles of Optics (Pergamon, 22. New York, ed. 5, 1975), p. 40. O. S. Heavens and H. M. Liddel, Appl. Opt. 5, 373
- 23. (1966).
- 24. M. Born and E. Wolf, in (22), p. 66.
- 25. A. Thelen, J. Opt. Soc. Am. 53, 1266 (1963).
- J. C. Kim, M. Cakmak, X. Zhou, Polymers 39, 4225 26. (1998).
- 27. J. C. Seferis, Polymer Handbook (Wiley, New York, ed. 3, 1989), p. 45.
- 28. M. Cakmak and J. L. White, Polym. Eng. Sci. 29, 1534 (1989).
- R. L. Jones, S. K. Kumar, D. L. Ho, R. M. Briber, T. P. 29. Russel, Nature 400, 146 (1999).
- H. A. Macleod, Thin-Film Optical Filters (Macmillan, 30 New York, ed. 2, 1986), p. 334.
- 31. AFM image and layer thickness analyses were provided by V. W. Jones of 3M Corporate Analytical Technology Center.

25 October 1999; accepted 15 February 2000

## **Dynamic Variations at the Base** of the Solar Convection Zone

R. Howe,<sup>1\*</sup> J. Christensen-Dalsgaard,<sup>2</sup> F. Hill,<sup>1</sup> R. W. Komm,<sup>1</sup> R. M. Larsen,<sup>3</sup> J. Schou,<sup>3</sup> M. J. Thompson,<sup>4</sup> J. Toomre<sup>5</sup>

We have detected changes in the rotation of the sun near the base of its convective envelope, including a prominent variation with a period of 1.3 years at low latitudes. Such helioseismic probing of the deep solar interior has been enabled by nearly continuous observation of its oscillation modes with two complementary experiments. Inversion of the global-mode frequency splittings reveals that the largest temporal changes in the angular velocity  $\Omega$  are of the order of 6 nanohertz and occur above and below the tachocline that separates the sun's differentially rotating convection zone (outer 30% by radius) from the nearly uniformly rotating deeper radiative interior beneath. Such changes are most pronounced near the equator and at high latitudes and are a substantial fraction of the average 30-nanohertz difference in  $\Omega$  with radius across the tachocline at the equator. The results indicate variations of rotation close to the presumed site of the solar dynamo, which may generate the 22-year cycles of magnetic activity.

The differential rotation of the sun and its ability to generate large-scale magnetic fields through cyclic dynamo action appear to be intimately linked. It is thought that the global dynamo behavior (1) responsible for the emergence of large active regions (sun-

spot groups) is derived from strong organized toroidal magnetic fields generated by rotational shear in a thin region, called the tachocline, at the base of the convection zone. The evolving magnetic field could well have a feedback effect on the fluid

motion in that region. We are thus motivated to use helioseismology to look for changes in rotation profiles near the tachocline as the sun's magnetic cycle progresses. Here, we present evidence that the rotation rate in the interior changes with time, with unexpected periods of  $\sim 1.3$ years near the equator and possibly 1.0 year at high latitudes.

Helioseismology provides the means to probe the interior structure and dynamics of the sun, using precise observations of the modes of oscillation (2). In particular, the splitting of the global oscillation frequencies by large-scale flows has successfully

\*To whom correspondence should be addressed. Email: rhowe@noao.edu

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>National Solar Observatory, National Optical Astronomy Observatories, Post Office Box 26732, Tucson, AZ 85726-6732, USA. <sup>2</sup>Theoretical Astrophysics Center, Danish National Research Foundation, and Institute of Physics and Astronomy, Aarhus University, DK-8000 Aarhus C, Denmark. <sup>3</sup>Hansen Experimental Physics Laboratory, HEPL Annex, Stanford University, Stanford, CA 94305-4085, USA. 4Astronomy Unit, Queen Mary and Westfield College, University of London, Mile End Road, London E1 4NS, UK. 5 JILA and the Department of Astrophysical and Planetary Sciences, University of Colorado, Boulder, CO 80309-0440, USA.





Fig. 1. Time-averaged rotation rates  $\Omega/2\pi$  obtained from RLS inversion of GONG frequency splittings, plotted against radius at different latitudes. The tachocline is evident near the base of the convection zone, which is determined to be at a radius of 0.713*R* (5). Dashed lines represent 1 $\sigma$  error bounds for a single inversion.

been used to investigate how the sun's rotation varies with radius and latitude throughout much of the solar interior (3). It was thus found that the angular velocity observed near the solar surface, where the rotation is faster at the equator than near the poles, extends through much of the convection zone (occupying the outer 30% by radius, namely 200 Mm) with little radial dependence. The tachocline (4, 5) is a region of strong shear at the base of the convection zone, where the angular velocity adjusts to apparent solid-body rotation in the deeper radiative interior (Fig. 1). There is also a thin shear boundary layer near the surface ( $\sim$ 5% by radius or 35 Mm in depth) in which rotation increases with depth at intermediate and low latitudes.

Study of the evolution of such dynamical structures deep within the sun has now become feasible with the nearly continuous full-disk Doppler observations of the sun provided by two independent but complementary helioseismic studies (6), namely the Global Oscillation Network Group (GONG) project involving six groundbased observatories and the Michelson Doppler Imager (MDI) instrument aboard the Solar and Heliospheric Observatory (SOHO) spacecraft. The basic data for the analyses are frequency splittings resulting from solar rotation for a broad range of fand p-mode oscillations (2) derived over a 4.5-year time span (from May 1995 to November 1999). These are represented in terms of polynomial expansions in the azimuthal order of the modes; the coefficients in these expansions (the so-called a coefficients) depend on the radial order and degree of the modes. The data from the GONG network were obtained as 41 overlapping 108-day sets with starting points separated by 36 days, whereas the MDI data consisted of 16 nonoverlapping 72-day sets (7). There is considerable temporal overlap, although the GONG observations began earlier and MDI had a data gap while control of SOHO was temporarily lost. The odd a coefficients were inverted by two different techniques (8), subtractive optimally localized averaging (OLA) and regularized least squares fitting (RLS), to infer the angular velocity  $\Omega$  as a function of distance r from the solar center and latitude  $\theta$ . For each experiment (i.e., a given choice

of data set, either GONG or MDI, and inversion method), we calculated an average rotation profile over all the time periods and subtracted this temporal average (Fig. 1) from the individual profiles. The resulting residuals  $\delta\Omega$  (r,  $\theta$ ; t) (t representing the epoch of the observations) form the basis for the subsequent investigation.

Temporal variations of the residuals  $\delta\Omega$ are evident (Fig. 2) at selected  $(r, \theta)$  points using the two independent data sets and the two different inversion methods. The two selected radii, 0.72R and 0.63R (where R is the photospheric radius), lie just above and below the tachocline [which is centered at 0.69R, as in (5)], respectively; the former is near the base of the convection zone, and the latter is in the radiative interior. The residuals close to the equator show distinct oscillations with a period of  $\sim 1.3$  years at both radii. The clearest signal of an oscillatory flow is in the equatorial plane at the radius 0.72R (Fig. 2A), having a peak-to-peak variation of  $\sim 6$  nHz, and in the companion deeper site at 0.63R(Fig. 2D), where the phase of the signal is reversed. A smaller amplitude signal is seen at these depths at 30° latitude (Fig. 2, B and E). Variations are also visible at the higher latitude of 60°, where the overall variation has increased to  $\sim 12$  nHz (Fig. 2C), but the signal is more complex. The two sets of observations track well together, and there is good agreement between the two inversion techniques (9). This lends credence to the physical reality of the variations.

Although the variations in  $\delta\Omega$  are not strictly periodic, we can estimate the mean period at a given location by sine-wave fitting (Figs. 3 and 4). The variation of





www.sciencemag.org SCIENCE VOL 287 31 MARCH 2000





**Fig. 3 (left).** Sine-wave fitting in time of residuals  $\delta\Omega/2\pi$  in rotation rate at the equator determined from RLS inversion of GONG data. For each frequency  $\nu$ , a single sine wave of variable phase  $[y = a_1 \cos(2\pi\nu t) + a_2 \sin(2\pi\nu t)]$  was fitted to the time series. (A) Variation at the equator of  $\delta\Omega/2\pi$  at radius 0.72*R*, showing the best fit sinusoid (0.78 years<sup>-1</sup>) as a solid curve. Error bars in (A), (C), and (D) indicate  $1\sigma$  errors. (B)

Power spectrum  $(a_1^2 + a_2^2)$  of sine-wave fits; dashed lines show 1 $\sigma$  error bounds. (C) Power at 0.78-year<sup>-1</sup> frequency as a function of latitude at 0.72*R*. (D) Power at the frequency in (C) as a function of radius at the equator. Fig. 4 (right). Sine-wave fitting results at a latitude of 60° for RLS inversion of GONG data. The notation is the same as in Fig. 3; the dominant frequency is 1.00 year<sup>-1</sup>.

power with frequency (Fig. 3B) at 0.72R at the equator peaks at 0.8 years<sup>-1</sup>, corresponding to a period of 1.3 years; the signal reconstructed from only that frequency is superposed on the data in Fig. 3A. This single period appears to capture much of the variation in  $\delta\Omega$ , although the data interval encompasses only about three cycles. Furthermore, analysis of power at that frequency with latitude (Fig. 3C) and with radius (Fig. 3D) reveals that the response is confined to low latitudes and peaks at radii 0.72R and 0.63R. At 0.63R, the equatorial  $\delta\Omega$  signal at that frequency is nearly anticorrelated with the signal at 0.72R. These results are supported by the other experiments (10). A corresponding sine-wave fit of  $\delta\Omega$  for latitude 60° and radius 0.72R (Fig. 2C) is illustrated in Fig. 4. The variations there are more complex, showing multiple peaks in power (Fig. 4B), with the largest at frequency 1.0 year<sup>-1</sup> (a period of 1.0 year). We place less importance (10) on this identification because of the noisier and more complicated signal, but clearly there is a strong signal (Fig. 4A) that is confined to the higher latitudes (Fig. 4C) and to the base of the convection zone (Fig. 4D). Unlike at lower latitudes, it is more difficult to characterize these variations in terms of a single frequency. However, the correspondence between GONG and MDI in the large excursions, particularly from early 1998 onward, is striking. The significance of the fit in Fig. 3B is substantially

reduced at a period of 1.0 year compared with 1.3 years (the power is lower at a period of 1.0 year by a factor of 4), so it is improbable that the variations detected at the equator are a product of systematic annual changes in observing conditions or of the orbit of SOHO. Furthermore, although the variations illustrated in Fig. 4 do have a dominant period of 1.0 year, the signal at this period is apparent only near 0.72R and  $60^{\circ}$  (Fig. 4, C and D), which again argues against the variations being caused by annual systematic observational errors.

We need to assess whether our inferences of changes in  $\delta\Omega$  at differing depths and latitudes are genuinely independent measurements or whether they might be artifacts of the inversion procedure. Two issues are of concern: (i) the finite resolution of the inversions and (ii) the correlation between the errors in the solutions at different locations. If these were substantial, then a signal (either genuine or a result of data errors) at 0.72R at the equator could bleed into the inferred solution at other locations. The finite resolution of the inversions causes a genuine signal at one location to be perceived also at other locations. A quantitative measure of this effect is provided by the averaging kernels: the inferred solution at a given location is, apart from errors, an average of the true solution weighted by the averaging kernel. An example of such an averaging kernel, showing how the solution at radius 0.72R on the equator is a weighted average of the rotation over a range of radii and latitudes, is shown in Fig. 5A. Averaging kernels at nearby radii and latitudes are similar. Because the resolution kernels in the region of interest are localized, with weights that are generally positive, resolution issues cannot account for the anticorrelation between the oscillations at 0.72R and 0.63R on the equator. Error correlation between different points is a more serious concern; the inversions at different locations are based on the same observational data, so the effects of data noise on the inferences at different locations are correlated. Examination of the error correlation functions (Fig. 5, B and D) shows that the error correlation between 0.72R and 0.63R at the equator is indeed negative, but its magnitude is only  $\sim 0.2$  for OLA inversion of MDI data and  $\sim 0.4$  for the other combinations. Thus, we infer that it is unlikely that error correlation accounts for the anticorrelated temporal variations apparent at these locations.

Inversions of global modes are sensitive only to that component of rotation which is symmetrical around the equator (3). Thus, the signals illustrated at  $30^{\circ}$  and  $60^{\circ}$  latitude are in fact the symmetrized components of the true variations in the sun. If the latter have a substantial antisymmetrical component, which is possible, then the actual fluctuations might be larger than those inferred here. The detection of substantial variations in rotation rate in the vicinity of the tachocline is of particular interest because this region of strong radial shear is thought to play a crucial role in the cyclic generation of magnetic fields. The overall variations of 6 to 12 nHz in  $\delta\Omega$  found at low and high latitudes represent significant signals when compared to the change of 30 to 55 nHz (Fig. 1) in  $\Omega$  across the tachocline (which varies with latitude in magnitude and in the sign of the rotation gradient).

The oppositely signed tachocline shear at low and high latitudes has a pivotal influence on the mean-field interface dynamos (1) currently being considered. These dynamo models seek to provide explanations for the orderly aspects of cyclic variation of the large-scale magnetic activity, involving sunspot eruptions with well-defined rules for field parity and emergence latitudes. Such highly parameterized models of magnetized turbulent flow within the tachocline have not yet provided detailed predictions of changes in  $\Omega$  that may be associated with field production as the cycle advances. On the other hand, the latest three-dimensional simulations of turbulent convection in rotating spherical shells (11) have made progress in explaining aspects of the differential rotation within the convection zone. However, such global modeling has not yet been able to deal effectively with the intense shear and the highly stable stratification of the tachocline and therefore is unable to provide reliable estimates of dynamical variations in  $\Omega$  expected within a zone of rotationally influenced penetrative convection.

The dynamical implications of our detection of  $\delta\Omega$  variations are therefore difficult to assess because the necessary theoretical framework for understanding the tachocline is still at an early stage. However, several dominant properties stand out from our helioseismic inferences. For one, the detected time-varying flows appear to extend at least to 0.63R, well inside the radiatively stable region. This suggests a strong dynamical coupling between the convection zone and the upper part of the radiative region (5). Further, the anticorrelation of  $\delta\Omega$  between radii 0.72R and 0.63R at low latitudes suggests that angular momentum may be exchanged across the tachocline. The fact that the variation is quasi-periodic is suggestive of a back-and-forth exchange of momentum. The poloidal component of the magnetic field presumed to be present near the base of the convection zone may be the agent responsible for this, as it tends to oppose gradients in angular velocity along field lines. The Alfvén time scale for transport of angular momentum may thus set the periods observed in the variations, though

Fig. 5. (A) Contours of the averaging kernels K and (B) the normalized error-correlation functions C for OLA inversions of MDI data with the target position at radius 0.72R at latitudes of 0° (blue) and 60° (red). The equator is the horizontal axis, and the pole is the vertical axis. (C) Equatorial cuts through averaging kernels K for solutions targeted at the equator and 0.72R for the following pairings of the data set (MDI or GONG) and inversion method (OLA or RLS): MDI-RLS (solid red line), MDI-ÓLA (green dashed line), GONG-RLS (solid black line). and GONG-OLA (blue dashed line). (D)



Equatorial cuts through the normalized error-correlation functions C for the same solution; the line styles are as in (C).

there is considerable uncertainty in the intensity and geometry of the magnetic field close to the tachocline. Another dominant feature of the helioseismic inferences is that variations in  $\delta\Omega$  are also clearly present at high latitudes, but these are more erratic in character. There may also be some latitudinal angular-momentum exchange, although this may be weak in view of the difference in the dominant periods of oscillation. In any case, the larger variations in  $\delta\Omega$  at higher latitudes may reflect the lesser moment of inertia.

Our detection of temporal variations  $\delta\Omega$ near the base of the convection zone calls for a continuation of helioseismic data as the solar cycle progresses. Our identification of a probable period of 1.3 years at low latitudes is tentative because the data now available extend over less than four such cycles. We need to determine whether these are real periods or aperiodic wobbles and whether they are present in the rising and waning phases of solar activity. We also need to know what relation these variations deep in the sun have to the weak bands of zonal flow detected within the outer 8% of the sun (12), which, like the bands of magnetic activity, appear at high latitudes and migrate toward the equator as the cycle proceeds.

The relatively strong  $\delta\Omega$  variations at a radius of 0.63*R* at the equator indicate that the radiative interior is more dynamic than might otherwise have been expected. Although the details of the motion in this region, apart from the oscillatory signal found here, are as yet unclear, they may

involve weak vertical transport. Such transport would affect the chemical composition of the region beneath the convection zone. Interestingly, helioseismic inversion for solar structure has revealed a sound-speed difference in this region, which can plausibly be interpreted as a result of partial mixing that partly counteracts the tendency for helium to settle beneath the convection zone (13). Additional evidence for mixing comes from the depletion of the photospheric lithium abundance by a factor of  $\sim$ 100, relative to the meteoritic abundance (14); nuclear destruction of lithium requires temperatures that are  $\sim 20\%$  higher than the temperature at the convection-zone base in models of the present sun. Taking into account details of the mixing and the change with solar evolution in the depth of the convection zone, mixing in the present sun must extend to a radius of  $\sim 0.64R$  (15). Although the depth to which the time-varying flows found here extend into the radiative interior is subject to some uncertainty because of the finite resolution of the inversions, the near-coincidence of the two locations is remarkable. The detected variation of rotation close to the presumed site of the solar dynamo may thus also have bearing on the chemical composition realized within the convection zone.

## References and Notes

 The 22-year solar cycles of global magnetic activity might be described by an interface mean-field dynamo, operating in the tachocline, whose rotational shear can stretch the poloidal magnetic field generated by cyclonic turbulence in the convection zone into a strong toroidal field at its base [E. N. Parker, Astrophys. J. 408, 707 (1993); N. O. Weiss, in Lectures on Solar and Planetary Dynamos, M. R. E. Proctor and A. D. Gilbert, Eds. (Cambridge Univ. Press, Cambridge, 1994), pp. 59–95; S. M. Tobias, Astron. Astrophys. 322, 1007 (1997); P. Charbonneau and K. B. MacGregor, Astrophys. J. 486, 502 (1997)]. Such a toroidal field should be susceptible to buoyancy instabilities that lead to portions of the field rising through the convection zone and subsequently erupting into the atmosphere as large-scale magnetic loops [P. Caligari, F. Moreno-Insertis, M. Schüssler, Astrophys. J. 441, 886 (1995)].

- 2. For general reviews on helioseismology, see work by J. Christensen-Dalsgaard, D. Gough, J. Toomre, Science 229, 923 (1985); D. O. Gough and J. Toomre, Annu. Rev. Astron. Astrophys. 29, 627 (1991); and J. Christensen-Dalsgaard, W. Däppen, W. A. Dziembowski, J. A. Guzik, in Variable Stars as Essential Astrophysical Tools, C. İbanoğlu, Ed. (Kluwer, Dordrecht, Netherlands, 2000), pp. 59-167. A mode of oscillation is characterized by the degree *l* and azimuthal order *m* of the spherical harmonic, which describes its behavior over the solar surface. and the radial order n, which typically measures the number of nodes in the displacement eigenfunction in the radial direction. The modes observed on the sun are typically acoustic modes (pressure or p modes), although in the MDI data, surface gravity modes (f modes) are also observed at high degree
- Recent helioseismic results on solar rotation are presented by M. J. Thompson et al., Science 272, 1300 (1996); T. Corbard et al., Astron. Astrophys. 324, 298 (1997); and J. Schou et al. (16). The splitting of global-mode frequencies by rotation provides the means to sample only the latitudinally symmetric component of the variation of angular velocity Ω.
- 4. The radial gradients of angular velocity  $\Omega$  in the tachocline may arise from anisotropic turbulent mixing of angular momentum in the stably stratified boundary layer at the base of the convection zone. The much stronger transport in the latitudinal direction than in the radial direction serves to circumvent the diffusive spread of latitudinal differential rotation into the deeper interior over long time scales [E. A. Spiegel and J.-P. Zahn, Astron. Astrophys. 265, 106 (1992); J. R. Elliott, Astron. Astrophys. 327, 1222 (1997)]. Other models invoke magnetic fields to enforce solid-body rotation in the radiative interior [D. O. Gough and M. E. McIntyre, Nature 394, 755 (1998)]. Linear instability studies of latitudinal shear combined with toroidal magnetic fields [P. A. Gilman and P. A. Fox, Astrophys. J. 510, 1018 (1999); M. Dikpati and P. A. Gilman, Astrophys. J. 512, 417 (1999)] suggest mechanisms for achieving enhanced horizontal turbulent mixing in the tachocline.
- 5. The nearly adiabatic stratification of the convection zone has been determined to extend to a depth of 0.287R below the surface, using helioseismic data, with an uncertainty of 0.003R or better [J. Christensen-Dalsgaard, D. O. Gough, M. J. Thompson, Astrophys. J. 378, 413 (1991); S. Basu and H. M. Antia, Mon. Not. R. Astron. Soc. 287, 189 (1997)]. The base of this zone at radius 0.713R may be contrasted to helioseismic estimates that place the midpoint of the tachocline at radius 0.692R, with a thickness estimated to be of the order of 0.02R to 0.09R [A. G. Kosovichev, Astrophys. J. 469, L61 (1996); T. Corbard, G. Berthomieu, J. Provost, P. Morel, Astron. Astrophys. 330, 1149 (1998); P. Charbonneau et al., Astrophys. J. 527, 445 (1999); (17)]. Thus, the tachocline is largely embedded in a region of very stable stratification.
- The GONG project is described by J. W. Harvey *et al.* [Science 272, 1284 (1996)], and the Solar Oscillation Investigation (SOI), which utilizes the MDI instru-

ment, is described by P. H. Scherrer et al., Sol. Phys. 162, 129 (1995).

- 7. The *a* coefficients  $a_k(n, l)$  used in this study are defined in terms of an expansion of  $\boldsymbol{\Omega}$  in toroidal vector functions introduced by M. H. Ritzwoller and E. M. Lavely [Astrophys. J. 369, 557 (1991)]; for a description of the actual implementation used, see (18). The GONG data sets cover the period from 7 May 1995 to 1 August 1999. Each set comprises typically 10,000 coefficients, up to  $a_{15}$ , for a total of ~1200 p-mode multiplets (n, l) for  $l \leq 150$ . The MDI sets cover the period from 1 May 1996 to 17 November 1999, with some interruptions due to problems with the SOHO satellite. These sets contain  $\sim$  30,000 coefficients, up to  $a_{35}$ , for  $\sim$  1800 multiplets with  $l \leq 300$ . The GONG and MDI data analyses continue to be extended as new observational data become available.
- 8. In the OLA inversion, linear combinations of the observations are formed such as to correspond to localized averages, in radius and latitude, of the angular velocity, while controlling the error in the inference [F. P. Pijpers and M. J. Thompson, Astron. Astrophys. 262, L33 (1992); see also (16)]. In the RLS technique, a parameterized representation of  $\boldsymbol{\Omega}$  is fitted to the observations in a least squares sense, including in the minimization of an integral of the square of the second derivative of  $\Omega$ ; this term suppresses the tendency for rapid variations in the solution and also, implicitly, limits the error (18). The methods are controlled by trade-off parameters that provide a balance between resolution and errors. In both cases, the inference can be represented as an average of the true solution, weighted by an averaging kernel whose extent provides a measure of the resolution. In addition to the error, it is also important to take into account the error correlation between the inferences at different locations in the sun [R. Howe and M. J. Thompson, Mon. Not. R. Astron. Soc. 281, 1385 (1996); D. O. Gough, T. Sekii, P. Stark, Astrophys. J. 459, 779 (1996)].
- 9. The agreement between OLA and RLS inversion methods can be assessed by examining the difference between OLA and RLS rotation residuals  $\delta\Omega$  at a given location. As can be seen in Fig. 2, these are within 1 $\sigma$  in all but a few cases, and the root mean square of the difference to error ratio for each of the cases illustrated is less than unity.
- 10. To further quantify the significance of the sinewave fits, we have examined the  $\chi^{\rm 2}$  for each fit. For the (0.72R, 0°) case using GONG data and RLS inversion (Fig. 3), the uncertainty in the fitted frequency of 0.78 years<sup>-1</sup> is  $\pm 0.10$  years<sup>-1</sup>, with a reduced  $\chi^2$  for the residuals of 0.64. The experiment with GONG data and OLA inversions gives a frequency of 0.78  $\pm$  0.10 years<sup>-1</sup> with a reduced  $\chi^2$  of 1.16, whereas combining the GONG and MDI RLS inversions gives a frequency of 0.77  $\pm$  0.10 years<sup>-1</sup> with a reduced  $\chi^2$  of 0.80. Combining GONG and MDI OLA inversions gives a frequency of 0.77  $\pm$  0.14 years  $^{-1}$  and a reduced  $\chi^{\rm 2}$ of 1.26. It is difficult to fit a period to the MDI observations taken alone because of the smaller number of data points and the coarser temporal sampling. For the (0.72, 60°) case (Fig. 4), the GONG data with RLS inversion yield a frequency of 1.01  $\pm$  0.10 years  $^{-1}$ , and the reduced  $\chi^2$  is 1.32. For combined GONG and MDI RLS inversions, the frequency is 1.02  $\pm$  0.12 years  $^{-1}$  , and the reduced  $\chi^2$  is 1.41. GONG data with OLA inversion give a frequency of 1.03  $\pm$  0.07 years<sup>-1</sup> with a reduced  $\chi^2$  of 1.96, and combined GONG and MDI OLA inversions give 1.05  $\pm$  0.10 years<sup>-1</sup> with a reduced  $\chi^2$  of 2.07. The higher  $\chi^2$  for all combinations at this location is mostly due to the increase in amplitude later in the period, which is not well reproduced by a single sine wave.

vection in full spherical shells to study the resulting differential rotation have been discussed by J. R. Elliott *et al.*, in *Structure and Dynamics of the Interior of the Sun and Sun-Like Stars*, S. Korzennik and A. Wilson, Eds. (ESA SP-418, European Space Agency, Noordwijk, Netherlands, 1998), pp. 765– 770; J. R. Elliott, M. S. Miesch, J. Toomre, *Astrophys.* J. 533, 548 (2000); and M. S. Miesch *et al.*, *Astrophys. J.*, 532, 593 (2000).

- 12. Helioseismic inferences regarding the nature of banded zonal flows in the upper regions of the solar convection zone, and their equatorward migration, are presented by J. Schou et al., in Proceedings of IAU Symposium 185: New Eyes to See Inside the Sun and Stars, F.-L. Deubner, J. Christensen-Dalsgaard, D. W. Kurtz, Eds. (Kluwer, Dordrecht, Netherlands, 1998), pp. 199-212; J. Schou, Astrophys. J. 523, L181 (1999): R. Howe, R. W. Komm, F. Hill, Sol. Phys., in press; R. Howe et al., Astrophys J., in press; and J. Toomre et al., Sol. Phys., in press. Similar flows on the solar surface had previously been detected through direct Doppler observations [R. Howard and B. J. LaBonte, Astrophys. J. 239, L33 (1980)]. For extensive results of surface observations of these flows, see work by R. K. Ulrich, in Structure and Dynamics of the Interior of the Sun and Sun-Like Stars, S. Korzennik and A. Wilson, Eds. (ESA SP-418, European Space Agency, Noordwijk, Netherlands, 1998), pp. 851-855.
- A. G. Kosovichev, in Robotic Exploration Close to the Sun: Scientific Basis, vol. 385 of AIP Conference Proceedings, S. R. Habbal, Ed. (American Institute of Physics, Woodbury, NY, 1997), pp. 159-166; M. Takata and H. Shibahashi, Astrophys. J. 504, 1035 (1998); H. M. Antia and S. M. Chitre, Astron. Astrophys. 339, 239 (1998); A. S. Brun, S. Turck-Chieze, J.-P. Zahn, Astrophys. J. 525, 1032 (1999); (17).
- 14. E. Anders and N. Grevesse, Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 53, 197 (1989).
- 15. As a result of the averaging over the mixed region and over solar evolution, the mean rate of lithium destruction is roughly half the rate at the base of the mixed region in the present sun [J. Christensen-Dalsgaard, D. O. Gough, M. J. Thompson, Astron. Astrophys. **264**, 518 (1992)]. Therefore, the mixed region needs to extend to a temperature of ~2.76 × 10<sup>6</sup> K, corresponding to  $r \approx 0.64R$ . The precise depth of mixing depends somewhat on the properties of the model.
- 16. J. Schou et al., Astrophys. J. 505, 390 (1998).
- 17. J. R. Elliott and D. O. Gough, Astrophys. J. 516, 475 (1999).
- J. Schou, J. Christensen-Dalsgaard, M. J. Thompson, Astrophys. J. 433, 389 (1994).
- 19. This work uses data obtained by the GONG project, managed by the National Solar Observatory, a division of the National Optical Astronomy Observatories, which is operated by the Association of Universities for Research in Astronomy (AURA), under a cooperative agreement with NSF. The data were acquired by instruments operated by the Big Bear Solar Observatory, High Altitude Observatory, Learmonth Solar Observatory, Udaipur Solar Observatory, Instituto de Astrofisico de Canarias, and Cerro Tololo Interamerican Observatory. The SOI involving MDI is supported by NASA grant NAG 5-3077 to Stanford University. SOHO is a mission of international cooperation between ESA and NASA. R.W.K. and, in part, R.H. were supported by NASA contract S-92698-F. J.C.-D. was supported in part by the Danish National Research Foundation through the establishment of the Theoretical Astrophysics Center. M.J.T. was supported in part by the UK Particle Physics and Astronomy Research Council. J.T. was supported in part by NASA through grants NAG 5-7996 and NAG 5-8133 and by NSF through grant ATM-9731676. We thank D. O. Gough for helpful comments on the manuscript.

11. Global simulations of turbulent compressible con-

16 December 1999; accepted 16 February 2000