

SCIENCE

Published by the **American Association for the Advancement of Science (AAAS)**, *Science* serves its readers as a forum for the presentation and discussion of important issues related to the advancement of science, including the presentation of minority or conflicting points of view, rather than by publishing only material on which a consensus has been reached. Accordingly, all articles published in *Science*—including editorials, news and comment, and book reviews—are signed and reflect the individual views of the authors and not official points of view adopted by the AAAS or the institutions with which the authors are affiliated.

The American Association for the Advancement of Science was founded in 1848 and incorporated in 1874. Its objectives are to further the work of scientists, to facilitate cooperation among them, to foster scientific freedom and responsibility, to improve the effectiveness of science in the promotion of human welfare, to advance education in science, and to increase public understanding and appreciation of the importance and promise of the methods of science in human progress.

Membership/Circulation

Director: Michael Spinella
Deputy Director: Marlene Zendell
Member Services: Rebecca Dickerson, *Manager*; Mary Curry, *Supervisor*; Pat Butler, Helen Williams, Laurie Baker, *Representatives*
Marketing: Dee Valencia, *Manager*; Jane Pennington, *Europe Manager*; Hilary Baar, *Associate*; Angela Mumeka, *Coordinator*
Research: Renuka Chander, *Manager*
Business and Finance: Jacquelyn Roberts, *Manager*; Robert Smariga, *Assistant Manager*
Administrative Assistant: Nina Araujo de Kobes
Science Member Services
 Marion, Ohio: 800-347-6969;
 Washington, DC: 202-326-6417
Other AAAS Programs: 202-326-6400

Advertising and Finance

Associate Publisher: Beth Rosner
Advertising Sales Manager: Susan A. Meredith
Recruitment Advertising Manager: Janis Crowley
Advertising Business Manager: Deborah Rivera-Wienhold
Finance: Randy Yi, *Senior Analyst*; Shawn Williams, *Analyst*
Marketing: John Meyers, *Manager*; Allison Pritchard, *Associate*
Traffic Manager: Tina Turano
Recruitment: Terri Seiter, *Assistant Manager*; Pamela Sams, *Production Associate*; Debbie Cummings, Celeste Miller, Rachael Wilson, *Sales*
Reprints Manager: Corrine Harris
Permissions Manager: Arlene Ennis
Sales Associate: Carol Maddox

PRODUCT ADVERTISING SALES: East Coast/SE.

Canada: Richard Teeling, 201-904-9774, FAX 201-904-9701 • **Midwest/Southeast:** Elizabeth Mosko, 312-665-1150, FAX 312-665-2129 • **West Coast/W. Canada:** Neil Boylan, 415-673-9265, FAX 415-673-9267 • **UK, Scandinavia, France, Italy, Belgium, Netherlands:** Andrew Davies, (44) 457-838-519, FAX (44) 457-838-898 • **Germany/Switzerland/Austria:** Tracey Peers, (44) 270-760-108, FAX (44) 270-759-597 • **Japan:** Mashy Yoshikawa, (3) 3235-5961, FAX (3) 3235-5852
RECRUITMENT ADVERTISING SALES: US: 202-326-6555, FAX 202-682-0816 • **Europe:** Gordon Clark, (44) 81539-5211, FAX (44) 0223-302068 • **Australia/New Zealand:** Keith Sandell, (61) 02-922-2977, FAX (61) 02-922-1100
 Send materials to *Science* Advertising, 1333 H Street, NW, Washington, DC 20005.

Information for Contributors appears on pages 112–114 of the 6 January 1995 issue. Editorial correspondence, including requests for permission to reprint and reprint orders, should be sent to 1333 H Street, NW, Washington, DC 20005.
Internet addresses: science_editors@aaas.org (for general editorial queries); science_letters@aaas.org (for letters to the editor); science_reviews@aaas.org (for returning manuscript reviews); membership@aaas.org (for member services); science_classifieds@aaas.org (for submitting classified advertisements)

LETTERS

Article Copying

If there was ever any doubt that the density of laws (and lawyers) in the United States has far exceeded the point of diminishing returns, Andrew Lawler's News & Comment article "Court says no to copying articles" (25 Nov., p. 1315) should settle the matter once and for all. From the relevant facts of the case against Texaco Corporation's researcher Donald Chickering presented in the article, it would seem that anyone who makes even one photocopy of an article for their personal library, without first obtaining a photocopy license, violates U.S. copyright law. How utterly absurd.

As a writer, I have written and published hundreds of copyrighted articles, and over the years I have received numerous requests from teachers and professors who want to make multiple photocopies of some of my articles for their students. But no one has ever asked me for permission to make a single photocopy for their personal library, nor should anybody have to. This kind of copyright protection I do not need, nor is it enforceable.

Nevertheless, Lawler says that attorney Jon Baumgarten warns academic researchers to "Consult with your university counsel before making copies." Presumably, Baumgarten is recommending that researchers seek legal counsel before making even a single photocopy. How ridiculous. Copyright law is designed to protect authors and publishers against the wholesale distribution of their intellectual property, and any sensible interpretation of the fair-use doctrine must allow for personal copies such as the ones Chickering allegedly made.

One hopes that future jurists hearing this case will use the same good sense exhibited by Judge Dennis Jacobs, whose lone dissenting opinion some lawyers say "should be taken with a grain of salt." In reality, it is the majority opinion that will be taken with a grain of salt, because regardless of the eventual outcome of this case, researchers will continue to make individual copies of articles for their libraries, with or without legal counsel.

But as a paying member of the American Association for the Advancement of Science (AAAS), what bothers me most about this case is that the AAAS is one of the plaintiffs and therefore has presumably squandered some fraction of its members' dues on a legal exercise in futility. The AAAS should have withdrawn from the suit when it was nar-

rowed to include only the actions of Chickering. And if it has not already done so, the AAAS should withdraw now.

Thomas V. Higgins
 12111 Jeanette Place,
 Granada Hills, CA 91344, USA

I am concerned about the role the AAAS played in the recent litigation regarding what constitutes fair use of copyrighted material. It is surprising to see the AAAS as one of the plaintiffs claiming that a researcher photocopying articles for personal use violates copyright laws. Most researchers copy articles, and then file (or pile) them in their offices even before they have read them or "transformed [them] through satire." I clearly consider this fair use. As an author, I am happy if people are copying my papers, and I guess that so would most other scientists be.

The AAAS, which is not only publisher of *Science*, but also a leading scientific organization, clearly did a disservice to most of its membership by taking part in this litigation. If it is of consequence at all, this case will add yet another bit of "red tape" to the daily work of scientists and another cost to their research budgets.

I express my strong hope that the AAAS will defend the interests of its membership in the next trial on the issue and leave the plaintiff's side to commercial publishers.

Christian Peter Klingenberg
 Department of Biological Sciences,
 University of Alberta,
 Edmonton, Alberta T6G 2E9,
 Canada

Indirect Costs

Two News articles in the 28 October 1994 issue ("House Republicans promise science cuts," *ScienceScope*, p. 531; A. Lawler, "Stanford, Navy resolve indirect costs," p. 535) explain university indirect costs reimbursement incorrectly. A 55% indirect cost rate is described on page 535 as one that means that a university with that rate "gets paid 55 cents to administer each dollar of federally funded research."

First, the largest share of indirect cost reimbursement is not for "administering" research; rather, it is for use of buildings and instruments, maintenance of those buildings, interest on borrowed money, humane