

- 12. J. Fishman and W. Seiler, J. Geophys. Res. 88. 3662 (1983).
- 13 The O₂ instrument (Thermo Electron Corporation: Model 49) is based on ultraviolet absorption at 254 nm, and the CO instrument (Thermo Electron Corporation: Model 48) uses nondispersive infrared absorption. Each CO instrument was modified for improved sensitivity by adding a field lens (14) and more precise temperature control of the absorption cell. We checked the performance of each O3 instrument twice daily by sampling zero air (ambient air passed through a charcoal trap) and an O₂ stream from the instrument's internal O₃ generator added both directly at the instrument and at the inlet. This latter procedure verified that the inlet line passed O_3 without loss. We measured the sensitivity of the CO instrument twice daily by addition of a 100 ppmv (parts per million by volume) CO calibration standard to the sampled air stream at a rate of 0.2% of the total flow. The zero of the CO instrument was determined hourly by sampling air passed through a heated catalyst bed that oxidized CO to CO2. This procedure was used because water vapor absorbs in the same infrared region as CO and is thus an interferant in the CO measurement. Hence to correct for this interference, it is necessary that the water level be identical in the sampled ambient air and in the zero air. [See (15) for additional details.] During periods of rapid absolute humidity changes, we expect to have systematic errors in the measurements because the catalyst bed absorbs water, and it needs time (~30 min) to come into equilibrium with the ambient water vapor. However, in the marine boundary layer, where the present measurements were made, the water vapor is expected to be in near equilibrium with the sea surface temperature, and rapid water vapor changes are not expected. The instrument tests were performed automatically by computers that also collected, stored and telemetered the data back to the home laboratory by way of the GOES satellite.
- R. R. Dickerson and A. C. Delany, J. Atmos. Ocean. Tech. 5, 424 (1988).
- 15 D. D. Parrish, M. Trainer, M. P. Buhr, B. A. Watkins, F. C. Fehsenfeld, J. Geophys. Res. 96, 9309 (1991).
- S. R. Piotrowicz, C. J. Fischer, R. S. Artz, Global 16. Biogeochem. Cyc. 4, 215 (1990). M. Saeger *et al.*, "The 1985 NAPAP emissions
- inventory (Version 2): Development of the annual data and modelers' tapes" (EPA Rep. 600/7-89-012a, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Washington, DC, 1989). The estimate of the eastern North American
- 18. source of CO may be low for two reasons. First, it has been suggested (19) that the emissions inventory for CO (17) has significantly underestimated the CO emissions. However, more recent results (15, 20) indicate that the error in the current inventory is likely to be small. Second. much of the CO emitted over western North America may also be transported over eastern North America and onto the North Atlantic.
- 19. W. R. Pierson, A. W. Gertler, R. L. Bradow, J. Air Waste Manage. Assoc. 40, 1495 (1990).
- M. P. Buhr, M. Trainer, D. D. Parrish, R. E. Sievers, 20 F. C. Fehsenfeld, Geophys. Res. Lett. 19, 1009 (1992).
- 21 CO is not only emitted directly, but it also is produced as a photochemical intermediate in the atmospheric oxidation of hydrocarbons emitted from anthropogenic and natural sources. This production of CO over eastern North America is difficult to quantify, but is expected to be considerably less than the direct emissions (2)
- S. A. McKeen, E.-Y. Hsie, M. Trainer, R. Tallam-22 raju, S. C. Liu, J. Geophys. Res. 96, 10,809 (1991).
- 23
- D. J. Jacob *et al., ibid.,* in press. S. C. Liu, D. Kley, M. McFarland, J. D. Mahlman, 24 H. Levy II, ibid. 85, 7546 (1980).
- 25. D. D. Parrish et al., ibid. 97, 15,883 (1992). J. Fishman, K. Fakhruzzaman, B. Cros, D. Nga-26
- nga, Science 252, 1693 (1991).

27. A. M. Hough and R. G. Derwent, Nature 344, 645 (1990).

28 The Atmospheric Environment Service of Environment Canada and the Canadian Coast Guard provided assistance and supporting data. This research has been funded as part of the Climate and Global Change program by the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration.

25 August 1992; accepted 24 December 1992

Fossilization of Soft Tissue in the Laboratory

Derek E. G. Briggs and Amanda J. Kear

Some of the most remarkable fossils preserve cellular details of soft tissues. In many of these, the tissues have been replaced by calcium phosphate. This process has been assumed to require elevated concentrations of phosphate in sediment pore waters. In decay experiments modern shrimps became partially mineralized in amorphous calcium phosphate, preserving cellular details of muscle tissue, particularly in a system closed to oxygen. The source for the formation of calcium phosphate was the shrimp itself. Mineralization, which was accompanied by a drop in pH, commenced within 2 weeks and increased in extent for at least 4 to 8 weeks. This mechanism halts the normal loss of detail of soft-tissue morphology before fossilization. Similar closed conditions would prevail where organisms are rapidly overgrown by microbial mats.

 ${f F}$ ossils that preserve evidence of soft tissues yield a wealth of information over and above that provided by the normal remains of mineralized shells, bones, and teeth. Structural organic tissues such as cuticle may become incorporated into the fossil record as complex inert biopolymers. Tissues such as muscle, however, which are subject to rapid autolysis and metabolization by bacteria, usually can be preserved only by early authigenic mineralization (1, 2). Occasionally such mineralization occurs quickly enough to preserve spectacular three-dimensional detail of muscles and other tissues and thus to give rise to some of the most remarkable fossils known. This type of preservation usually involves calcium phosphate (3). Recently studied examples have been found in the Santana Formation (Lower Cretaceous), Chapada do Araripe, Brazil (4-6), and the Cordillera de Domeyko (Upper Jurassic) of Chile (7). Here the striated muscle of both elasmobranchs and bony fishes displays details of the morphology of the sarcolemma, fibrils, sarcomeres, and the banding within them, and occasionally even rows of cell nuclei (6, 7). Mineralization of fish soft tissue is a more widespread phenomenon than is generally realized, but many reports predate the availability of scanning electron microscopy (SEM), and the degree of detail that is preserved is unknown. Phosphatized muscle has also been reported in other groups, including pterosaurs from the Santana Formation (8), cephalopods from Solnhofen (Jurassic, Tithonian), Germany (9), and Christian Malford (Jurassic, Callovian), England (10), and crustaceans from Soln-

SCIENCE • VOL. 259 • 5 MARCH 1993

hofen and from within the gut of Santana fishes (11).

Attempts to understand the process of soft-tissue mineralization-the so-called "Medusa effect" (5)—and the conditions required to promote it have been based mainly on data from fossils. Experiments on mineralization in association with decaying shrimps (1) and fish (12) have resulted in the formation of calcium soaps, but not in extensive mineralization of soft tissue (13). Here we describe how the mineralization of soft tissue can be induced under experimental conditions in the laboratory, and we use the results to interpret its occurrence in the fossil record.

Freshly killed specimens of the shrimp Crangon crangon and the prawn Palaemon sp. (14) were placed in experimental vessels with 50 ml of standard artificial seawater (ASW) inoculated with water (50 ml/liter) and sediment (~ 0.5 ml/liter) from the Tay Estuary, Dundee, Scotland, and yeast extract (0.1 g/liter) (15, 16). The vessels were incubated at $20^{\circ} \pm 0.5^{\circ}$ C for 3 days to 25 weeks before sampling (17).

We carried out replicate experiments (five separate vessels, one carcass in each, for each sample point) under four different conditions (experiments A to D) to explore the mineralization process. At start-up, the O_2 in the water in experiments A, B, and C was at 50% saturation; in experiment D the water was deoxygenated (18). Initial decay reduced the O₂ concentration to just a few percent within 1 to 2 days. Rapid rediffusion of atmospheric O2 was permitted in experiment A, which was not sealed; in experiment B the jar was fitted with a cap that permitted slow diffusion only; in experiments C and D the systems were sealed with anaerocult, which removes gaseous O_2

Department of Geology, University of Bristol, Wills Memorial Building, Queen's Road, Bristol BS8 1RJ, United Kingdom.

and replaces it with CO_2 , in an aluminum bag that prevented reoxygenation (19, 20).

Where O2 was available throughout (experiments A and B), the carcasses displayed four stages of decay. Within 1 week, the abdomen flexed ventrally and the arthrodial membranes stretched as the internal tissues expanded as a result of osmotic pressure. The cuticle began to lose rigidity. The muscles became opaque but retained their internal strength and cohesion. Isolated flat, round, hemispherical or dumbbellshaped crystal bundles (21), up to 0.5 mm in dimension, began to precipitate in the envelopes of cuticle formed by the scaphocerites, limbs, and tail fan. Within 2 to 3 weeks, the carcass split at the junction between the cephalothorax and abdomen. The muscles lost their internal strength; few fibers remained. Crystal bundles began to form in the cephalothorax and tergites. In some experiments they coalesced into a crude pavement on the inner surface of the cuticle. By 4 to 8 weeks (in Crangon and Palaemon, respectively) the entire cuticle was flaccid, and, although it remained relatively intact, it collapsed on removal from the water. The muscles shrank and in most cases degenerated to an amorphous white semiliquid state; no evidence of fibers remained. By 8 to 20 weeks (in Crangon and Palaemon, respectively) the legs fell off and the exoskeleton gradually disarticulated; any semiliquid soft tissue that remained was released. Muscle tissue was rarely mineralized in these experiments (none recorded in weeks 4 to 8 in Palaemon or Crangon under condition B; 13%, n = 80 in all Palaemon run in experiment B) and consisted only of scraps (<1 mm in dimension).

Where reoxygenation was prevented (experiments C and D), decay followed a similar sequence but some of the muscle tissue usually became mineralized. In addition, the cuticle remained rigid, particularly in the tergites of the abdomen. Crystal bundles sometimes formed. Mineralization of the muscle took place in stages. The muscle developed a pasty texture within 2 weeks, which, if disturbed, collapsed and flowed over the cuticle as in a mud flow. Small scraps of tissue (<1 mm, usually 0.1 to 0.5 mm in dimension) became mineralized within 2 to 4 weeks. In addition to muscle, scraps of the hepatopancreas and complete eggs became mineralized. Within 4 to 8 weeks, blocks of mineralized muscle tissue 1 to 3 mm in size were evident and the hepatopancreas was mineralized in many specimens. The muscle commonly mineralized on the abdominal tergites and sternites, and, as a result, a hollow center to each somite was left where the remainder of the muscle had decayed. Some of the muscle that shrank and collapsed into the lowest part of the space enclosed by the

exoskeleton was preserved as additional remnants. Mineralization appeared to be initiated in the hepatopancreas and was most pronounced near the anterior of the trunk; the last two abdominal somites were empty as a result of decay in most cases. In very rare cases the muscle of a limb or chela was mineralized.

The proportion of muscle mineralized and the degree of detail preserved varied both among and within specimens. Mineralization of recognizable muscle tissue in *Crangon* occurred in 53% of the experiments in which the water was oxygenated at the outset (experiment C) and in 60% of the experiments in which the systems were completely anoxic from start to finish (experiment D) (4 to 8 weeks, n = 15, in both cases). Mineralization occurred in 67% of *Palaemon* under the conditions in experiment D (4 to 8 weeks, n = 15).

The fibers of muscle were mineralized in many experiments, and traces of the banding on the muscle fibrils (probably corresponding to the M lines where the fibrils rupture) were evident in a few (Figs. 1A and 2A). The microspheres of mineral replicating the muscle tissue were normally less than 1 μ m in diameter. The sarcolemma was occasionally preserved by a coating of mineral even where the fibers it enclosed had decayed (Figs. 1B and 2B). In a few experiments just an outline of the sarcolemma remained as a series of polygons on the inner surface of the tergites with some trace of the ends of the fibers within (Fig. 2C). Eggs, which are ~ 0.5 mm in dimension, were normally covered with an irregular, relatively smooth membrane. Inside this, scattered irregular spheres up to 5 μm in diameter occurred within a disorganized open meshwork (Fig. 2E). Bacteria were rarely mineralized (Fig. 2F).

The composition of the crystal bundles differs from that of the mineralized soft tissues (Table 1). Analysis with an electron microprobe revealed that the crystal bundles are essentially pure calcium carbonate (x-ray diffraction indicates a mixture of aragonite and calcite). The mineralized



Fig. 1. (**A**) Fresh muscle fiber from *Palaemon* sp. Z bands are evident on the individual fibrils. Scale bar, 10 μ m. (**B**) Sarcolemma in a torn *Crangon crangon* muscle that decayed for 1 day with rapid diffusion. Scale bar, 20 μ m. Both specimens were fixed in 1% glutaraldehyde in 0.1 M cacodylate buffer and prepared for SEM by the hexamethyldisilazane method (*31*).

Table 1. Average composition of mineralized tissues in Crangon and Palaemon (P) at specified
decay times. Oxide weights are based on electron microprobe analyses (total given as the percent
by weight of sample mineralized). The ratio of calcium phosphate to CaCO $_{ m a}$ is based on the
assumption that all P_2O_5 is incorporated into ideal OH-apatite [Ca ₅ (PO ₄) ₃ OH]. The CaO:P ₂ O ₅ ratio
is 1:1.32 (based on molecular weights, ignoring hydrogen and excess oxygen). The remaining CaO
is assumed to form CaCO _a .

Mineralized tissue	Sample miner- alized (% by weight)	Na ₂ O	MgO	SiO ₂	P ₂ O ₅	SO3	CaO	CaO in amor- phous phos- phate	Ratio of calcium phosphate to CaCO ₃ (%)
Crystal bundle, 8 weeks	51.54	0.8	1.6	0.01	1.2	0.6	47.3	1.6	3.4:96.6
Muscle, 8 weeks	40.18	1.0	1.2	0.03	14.9	0.6	22.5	19.7	87.6:12.4
Fresh cuticle	44.22	1.3	0.8	0.13	2.1	0.4	39.3	2.8	7.1:92.9
Cuticle, 15 to 25 weeks (P)	55.89	0.3	1.7	0.17	19.0	1.4	32.7	25.1	76.8:23.2
Egg, 25 weeks (<i>P</i>)	16.85	0	0.3	0.11	3.5	0.4	11.8	4.6	39.0:61.0

SCIENCE • VOL. 259 • 5 MARCH 1993

REPORTS

muscle tissue, on the other hand, is predominantly calcium phosphate (>80%). The lack of definite peaks in the x-ray diffraction pattern indicates that this material is amorphous; calcium soaps may also be present. The amount of phosphate in the cuticle also increased with decay. The eggs were less completely mineralized than the other tissues with a much lower proportion of phosphate to carbonate.

The formation of calcium phosphate in sediments is induced by microbial action (22). Recent discussion of the circumstances surrounding the phosphatization of soft tissue has focused mainly on the fossil fishes of the Cretaceous Santana Formation of Brazil (4, 7, 23). There are striking similarities between the features of our experiments and those of the Santana fishes. In both, preservation is variable both among and within specimens (23), the muscle tissue is only partially mineralized and in many cases it has collapsed within the body cavity (4, 23), similar ultrastructural details of the muscle tissue are retained, and the mineral textures are similar (11, 23). Muscle tissue of fishes from the Santana Formation is preserved in calcium hydroxyapatite and calcium fluorapatite (11). The conditions responsible for the preservation seen in the Santana Formation, however, including the mineral com-



Fig. 2. (**A**) Banding (probably M lines) on mineralized muscle fibrils from the sternite of *Palaemon* after 15 weeks under the conditions of experiment C. Scale bar, $20 \ \mu$ m. (**B**) Mineralized sarcolemma from the same specimen in a fragment where the fibers have decayed away. Scale bar, $100 \ \mu$ m. (**C**) Polygonal pattern of mineralized sarcolemma on the tergite cuticle of *Palaemon* after 10 weeks under the conditions of experiment D. A clump of mineralized fiber ends is attached within each polygon. Scale bar, $10 \ \mu$ m. (**D**) Dumbbell-shaped crystals overgrowing mineralized sarcolemma [same specimen as in (A) and (B)]. Scale bar, $40 \ \mu$ m. (**E**) Partially mineralized egg of *Palaemon* with the outer membrane decayed away after 20 weeks under the conditions of experiment D. Scale bar, $100 \ \mu$ m. (**F**) Mineralized bacteria on the limb cuticle of *Palaemon* after 15 weeks under the conditions of experiment D. Scale bar, $4 \ \mu$ m.

position [it has been argued that the bulk of muscle tissue is preserved in calcite (7, 24)], the pH and O_2 concentration of the seawater, the source of ions, and the rate of mineralization, remain controversial.

Even where O_2 was present at the outset (experiments A through C), it was eliminated in 1 to 2 days with decay of the carcass. However, substantial phosphatization of muscle tissue only occurred where the system was closed (experiments C and D) in an aluminum bag. In the case of the Santana fossils a prokaryotic mat may have played a similar role (4). In closed conditions pH fell rapidly from 8 to between 6 and 7 at 3 days; it then recovered to ~ 8 within 4 weeks. This reduction in pH is a result of anaerobic decay and the buildup of CO_2 and volatile fatty acids, which cannot escape. It may have been slightly enhanced by the CO_2 produced by the anaerocult (25), but the reduction was less than the drop (to pH 6) produced by the decay of larger worm carcasses in conditions of slow diffusion (experiment B), that is, without anaerocult (16).

Lowering the pH generally increases the stability of apatite relative to $CaCO_3$ (26). It has been argued that a drop in pH in the vicinity of a decaying Santana fish carcass was necessary to inhibit carbonate precipitation and to promote the formation of apatite to fossilize the soft tissue (4, 27). Under open conditions (experiments A and B), on the other hand, pH remained just below 8 at week 1 but then rose to about 8.5 and remained at that level beyond week 8. Soft tissue was rarely preserved, and crystal bundles formed. In some closed experiments dumbbell-shaped crystal bundles 100 to 200 µm long precipitated over mineralized muscle tissue (Fig. 2D). Electron microprobe analyses confirmed that the crystal bundles are composed of CaCO₃, whereas the muscle is calcium phosphate (Table 1). We have observed this overgrowth relation only in specimens that have decayed for 8 weeks or more, by which time pH values had recovered to ~ 8 .

Some models for the fossilization of soft tissue in phosphate have involved the buildup of phosphate to critical concentrations in sediment pore waters as a result of microbial decomposition of organic material (4, 10); other models have suggested that the organism itself is the primary source of phosphate (9, 28). Our results confirm that some soft tissue can be partially phosphatized even where the sole source of phosphate is the organism itself (3.0% dry weight in Crangon carcasses, 2.05% in Palaemon, no phosphate in ASW). Additional phosphate would presumably be necessary to mineralize large carcasses extensively, but the preferential fossilization of soft tissue in phosphate in

particular groups, such as fishes, arthropods, and squid, is presumably a reflection of their composition. No mineralization occurred in the polychaete Nereis (1.48% phosphate by weight) under the same experimental conditions.

Phosphatization of Santana Formation fishes has been estimated to occur in life (7) or, on the basis of a comparison with decay rates of modern fish tissues, within 5 hours of death (29). In our experiments, however, the process was initiated within 2 weeks, but the degree of mineralization of muscle tissue increased up to 4 weeks or even longer. The rate of decay, and presumably mineralization, would have been further slowed at lower temperatures.

This study, together with the evidence of the fossil record, emphasizes that precise conditions must prevail in order for mineralization of soft tissue to take place. But, once the morphology is stabilized by initial mineralization, the potential for preservation of the soft tissue through subsequent diagenesis is enormously enhanced, although the material remains vulnerable to compaction unless subsequently enclosed in a concretion. There is a critical balance between decay to release phosphate and precipitation to preserve the soft tissue before much morphological detail is lost (1, 7). This balance occurs in closed conditions where an initial drop in pH triggers phosphatization. The role of microbial films in fossilization may extend beyond the protection of carcasses and inhibition of decomposition (30) to the establishment of the conditions necessary for rapid mineralization (4).

REFERENCES AND NOTES

- 1. P. A. Allison, Paleobiology 14, 139 (1988).
- _ and D. E. G. Briggs, in The Processes of Fossilization, S. K. Donovan, Ed. (Belhaven, London, 1991), pp. 120-140; in Taphonomy, Releasing the Data Locked in the Fossil Record, P. A. Allison and D. E. G. Briggs, Eds. (Plenum, New York, 1991), pp. 25–70. Preservation of muscle tissue in amber is an exception [A. Henwood, Palaios 7, 203 (1992)].
- The silicification of soft tissues in the Eocene 3. lignite of Geiseltal is an exception [E. Voigt, Cour. Forsch.-Inst. Senckenberg 107, 325 (1988)].
- 4. D. M. Martill, Palaeontology 31, 1 (1988).
- 5 , Geol. Today 5, 201 (1989)
- 6. Nature 346, 171 (1990).
- H.-P. Schultze, *Revista Geol. Chile* **16**, 183 (1989). 7 8. D. M. Martill and D. M. Unwin, Nature 340, 138 (1989)
- J. Mehl, Archaeopteryx 8, 77 (1990) a
- 10. P. A. Allison, Lethaia 21, 403 (1988)
- 11. P. R. Wilby and D. M. Martill, Hist. Biol. 6, 25 (1992)
- 12. R. A. Berner, Science 159, 195 (1968).
- 13. P. A. Allison [thesis, University of Bristol (1987)] recorded fragments (not exceeding 100 µm) of fibrous material (muscle or connective tissue collagen) mineralized in an unknown phosphate after decay of fish muscle for 8 days in marine mud and water enriched with calcium phosphate.
- 14. Live specimens of Crangon crangon (n = 139; size range, 0.09 to 1.77 g) and Palaemon sp. (n 97; size range, 0.10 to 1.95 g) were obtained by

trawling (Plymouth Sound) or hand-netting (Poole Harbour: Starcross Harbour) in southern England. They were held in an aquarium (3° to 10°C, within ASW of salinity 35 to 37 per mil) until required, and then killed by anoxia in an anaerobic cabinet, dried with tissue, and weighed.

- 15 The Tay Estuary was chosen because this site is characterized by high rates of degradation of organic matter as a result of aerobic processes and anaerobic sulfate reduction [R. J. Parkes and W. J. Buckingham, in Proceedings of the 4th International Symposium on Microbial Ecology, F. Megasar and M. Gantar, Eds. (Slovene Society for Microbiology, Ljubljana, Yugoslavia, 1991), pp. 617–624; R. J. Parkes, G. R. Gibson, I. Mueller-Harvey, W. J. Buckingham, R. A. Herbert, J. Gen. Microbiol. 135, 175 (1989)].
- 16. D. E. G. Briggs and A. J. Kear, Paleobiology 19, 107 (1993)
- Sampling, which terminated the experiments, was carried out at 3 days and 1, 2, 3, 4, 6, 8, 10, 15, 20, and 25 weeks. The pH and O2 content of the ASW and the wet and dry weights of the decaying carcass were measured. The state of decay and degree of mineralization were recorded, and mineralized tissue was examined under a scanning electron microscope (gold coated with an accelerating voltage of 4 to 8 kV, or sometimes 12 kV), and analyzed with the use of x-ray diffraction and electron microprobe techniques
- 18. By bubbling O_2 -free N_2 through it overnight while agitating with a magnetic stirrer.
- 19. The conditions for experiments A, B, C, and D correspond to those for experiments 1a, b, c, and d, respectively, in (16).
 20. B. A. Cragg, S. J. Bale, R. J. Parkes, *Lett. Appl.*
- Microbiol 15 125 (1992)
- 21. Similar to bacterially induced precipitates in experiments by C. Buczynski and H. S. Chafetz, J. Sediment. Petrol. 61, 226 (1991).
- 22. C. R. Glenn and M. A. Arthur, Mar. Geol. 80, 231 (1988); D. T. Heggie et al., in Phosphorite Research and Development, A. J. G. Notholt and I. Jarvis. Eds. (Special Publication 52, Geological

Society, London, 1990), pp. 87-117; J. Lucas and L. Prévôt, C. R. Acad. Sci. Ser. II 292, 1203 (1981); A. Hirschler, J. Lucas, J.-C. Hubert, *Geomicrobiol. J.* 8, 47 (1990).

- 23. J. G. Maisey, in Santana Fossils, an Illustrated Atlas, J. G. Maisey, Ed. (T. F. H. Publications, Neptune City, NJ, 1991), pp. 57–88.
 P. R. Wilby and D. M. Martill (personal communi-
- cation) have pointed out that, because the analyses by Schultze (7) were based on mechanically extracted rather than acid-prepared material, any phosphate peaks on the x-ray diffractometer would have been swamped by interstitial calcium carbonate. They observed that the preservation of muscle tissue in calcite is not supported by petrography or elemental mapping by energy-dispersive x-ray analysis.
- Mineralization occurred whether anoxia was maintained by anaerocult A or C; the former results in a starting level of 18% CO₂ of gas volume, the latter only 8 to 9%.
- Y. Nathan and E. Sass, Chem. Geol. 34, 103 (1981). 26.
- A contrary view is expressed in (10). 28. H. Willems and M. Wuttke, Neues Jahrb. Geol.
- Palaeontol. Abh. 174, 213 (1987). 29. D. M. Martill and L. Harper, Palaeontology 33, 423 (1990). The experimental conditions (tissue samples of a freshwater fish in an open vessel of seawater at room temperature) are unlikely to have been similar to those in the Santana Sea. 30
- J.-C. Gall, Lethaia 23, 21 (1990). 31. J. L. Nation, Stain Technol. 58, 347 (1983).
- We are grateful to R. J. Parkes for advice and 32. discussion. T. Kemp, S. Lane, and D. Robinson assisted with the analysis of samples. S. Powell assisted with photography. F. Frettsome and R. Swinfen of the Plymouth Marine Laboratory coordinated the supply of specimens. M. Collins, J. G. Maisey, D. M. Martill, R. Raiswell, K. M. Towe, and P. R. Wilby commented on the manuscript. This work was funded by Natural Environment Research Council grant GR3/7235.

18 September 1992: accepted 17 December 1992

Population Structure and the Evolution of Virulence in Nematode Parasites of Fig Wasps

Edward Allen Herre

It is often assumed that parasitic and disease-producing organisms tend to evolve benign relationships with their hosts over time. In contrast, theoretical arguments suggest that increased opportunities for parasite transmission will promote the evolution of increased virulence. The natural history of species-specific nematodes that parasitize fig-pollinating wasps permits the testing of these predictions in natural populations. For 11 species of Panamanian fig wasps, those species characterized by population structures that result in increased opportunities for parasite transmission harbor more virulent species of nematodes. In addition, differences in population structure are also associated with differences in other intra- and interspecific phenomena, including sex ratios among the fig wasp species, the degree of tension in the wasp-fig mutualism, and lethal combat among the males of parasitic wasps.

Parasitic and disease-producing organisms influence nearly all aspects of biological organization. These organisms have been implicated either directly or indirectly in (i) limiting the geographical range of host organisms (community composition); (ii) reg-

SCIENCE • VOL. 259 • 5 MARCH 1993

ulating host population densities and dynamics; (iii) mediating the outcome of competition or predation between theirhosts and other organisms; (iv) maintaining polymorphisms in blood proteins, and possibly in maintaining general genetic polymorphisms; (v) underlying sexual selection; and (vi) serving as a selective force leading to the predominance of sexual reproduction (1–6). The proposed mechanisms by which

Smithsonian Tropical Research Institute, Apartado 2072, Balboa, Republic of Panama or Smithsonian Tropical Research Institute, Unit 0948, APO AA 34002-0948.