8 November 1985, Volume 230, Number 4726

# SCIENCE

## AMERICAN ASSOCIATION FOR THE ADVANCEMENT OF SCIENCE

Science serves its readers as a forum for the presentation and iscussion of important issues related to the advancement of cience, including the presentation of minority or conflicting oints of view, rather than by publishing only material on which a onesnus has been reached. Accordingly, all articles published in *icience*—including editorials, news and comment, and book eviews—are signed and reflect the individual views of the uthors and not official points of view adopted by the AAAS or he institutions with which the authors are affiliated.

Publisher: WILLIAM D. CAREY

Editor: DANIEL E. KOSHLAND, JR.

### **Deputy Editors**

PHILIP H. ABELSON (Engineering and Applied Sciences), JOHN BRAUMAN (Physical Sciences), GARDNER LINDZEY (Social iciences)

#### **Editorial Board**

PHILIP W. ANDERSON, DAVID BALTIMORE, ANSLEY J. COALE, GOEPH L. GOLDSTEIN, LEON KNOROFF, SEYMOUR LIPSET, WAL-TER MASSEY, OLIVER E. NELSON, ALLEN NEWELL, RUTH PAT-UCK, VERA C. RUBIN, HOWARD E. SIMMONS, SOLOMON H. INYDER, ROBERT M. SOLOW

#### **Board of Reviewing Editors**

Board of Reviewing Editors JAMES P. ALLISON, QAIS AL-AWQATI, LUIS W. ALVAREZ, DON ... ANDERSON, KENNETH J. ARROW, C. PAUL BIANCHI, ELIZA-IETH H. BLACKBURN, FLOYD E. BLOOM, MICHAEL S. BROWN, MMES H. CLARK, STANLEY FALKOW, NINA V. FEDOROFF, GARY <sup>7</sup>ELSENFELD, DOUGLAS J. FUTUYMA, THEODORE H. GEBALLE, <sup>7</sup>TEPHEN P. GOGFF, PATRICIA S. GOLDMAN-RAKIC, RICHARD M. HELD, GLORIA HEPPNER, JOHN IMBRIE, ERIC F. JOINSON, CONRAD B. KRAUSKOPF, PAUL E. LACY, JOSEPH B. MARTIN, CONRAD B. KRAUSKOPF, PAUL E. LACY, JOSEPH B. MARTIN, CONKER, FREDERIC M. RICHARDS, JAMES E. <sup>8</sup>COTHMAN, RONALD H. SCHWARTZ, OTTO T. SOLBRIG, ROBERT I. N. TJIAN, VIRGINIA TRIMBLE, GEERAT J. VERMEU, MARTIN <sup>9</sup>WEIGERT, GEORGE M. WHITESIDES, WILLIAM B. WOOD, <sup>1</sup>ARRIET ZUCKERMAN **JARRIET ZUCKERMAN** 

#### Editorial Staff

Managing Editor: PATRICIA A. MORGAN Assistant Managing Editors: NANCY J. HARTNAGEL, JOHN E.

Managing Editor: PATRICIA A. MORGAN Assistant Managing Editors: NANCY J. HARTNAGEL, JOHN E. NOLE Production Editor: ELLEN E. MURPHY News Editor: BARBARA J. CULLITON News and Comment: COLIN NORMAN (deputy editor), MARK 4. CRAWFORD, CONSTANCE HOLDEN, ELIOT MARSHALL, R. EFFREY SMITH, MARJORE SUN, JOHN WALSH European Correspondent: DAVID DICKSON Research News: ROGER LEWIN (deputy editor), DEBORAH M. JARNES, RICHARD A. KERR, GINA KOLATA, JEAN L. MARX, KITHUR L. ROBINSON, M. MITCHELL WALDROP Administrative Assistant, News: SCHERRAINE MACK; Editorial Assistant, News: FANNE GROOM Senior Editors: ELEANORE BUTZ, RUTH KULSTAD Associate Editors: MARTHA COLLINS, SYLVIA EBERHART, AITLIN GORDON, WILLIAM GRAVES, BABARA JASNY, STE-HEN KEPPLE, EDITH MEYERS, LOIS SCHMITT Assistant Editor: ILISA MCCULOUCH Book Reviews: KATHERINE LIVINGSTON, Editor; LINDA IEISERMAN, JANET KEGG Letters Editor: CHRISTINE GILBERT Contributing Editor: RUTH L. GUYER Production: JOHN BAKER, HOLLY BISHOP, KATHLEEN OSMANO, ELEANOR WARNER; ISABELLA BOULDIN, SHARON YAN, BEVERLY SHIELDS Covers, Reprints, and Permissions: GRAYCE FINGER, Editor; BERLDINE CRUMP, CORRINE HARRIS Guide to Scientific Instruments: RICHARD G. SOMMER Manuscript System Analyst: WILLIAM CARTER EDITORAL CORESPONDENCE: 1373 H Street, NW, Vashington, D.C. 20005, Telephone: 202-326-6500. For "Infor-nation for Contributors" see page xi, Science, 27 September 983.

#### **Business Staff**

Chief Business Officer: WILLIAM M. MILLER III Business Manager: HANS NUSSBAUM Assistant to Chief Business Officer: ROSE LOWERY Business Staff Supervisor: DEBORAH JEAN RIVERA Membership Recruitment: GWENDOLYN HUDDLE Member and Subscription Records: ANN RAGLAND

#### Advertising Representatives

Advertising Representatives Director: EARL J. SCHERAGO Production Manager: DONNA RIVERA Advertising Sales Manager: RICHARD L. CHARLES Marketing Manager: HERBERT L. BURKLUND Sales: New YORK, N.Y. 10036: J. Kevin Henebry, 1515 Broadway (212-730-1050); SCOTCH PLAINS, N.J. 07076: C. Rich-rid Callis, 12 Unami Lane (201-889-8473); CHCAGO, LL. 60611: ack Ryan, Room 2107, 919 N. Michigan Ave. (312-337-4973); BevERLY HILLS, CALIF. 90211: Winn Nance, 111 N. La Cienega Ivd. (213-657-2772); SAN JOSE, CALIF. 95112: Bob Brindley, 310 3. 16 St. (408-998-4690); DORSET, VT. 05251: Fred W. Dieffen-mach, Kent Hill Rd. (802-867-5581). ADVERTISING CORRESPONDENCE: Tenth floor, 1515 Broadway, New York 10036 (212-730-1050).

# Air Pollution and Acid Rain

Research being conducted on air pollution and acid rain is leading to a changing picture of the relative importance of  $SO_2$  and  $NO_x$ . Political and regulatory efforts have been focused on sulfur oxides because they produced about twice as much acid as  $NO_x$ . However, that emphasis disregards the role of  $NO_x$  in the formation of toxic photochemical oxidants. Controlled studies at experimental facilities and observations in the field have identified effects of ozone and  $NO_x$  as more damaging to vegetation than SO<sub>2</sub> alone.

In sunlight a complex series of reactions occurs in the troposphere, including photolysis of  $NO_2$  to produce excited atomic oxygen and thence ozone. Additional reactive species formed include hydrogen peroxide, methyl hydroperoxide, peroxyacetic acid, and reactive free radicals, including OH, NO<sub>3</sub>, and HO<sub>2</sub>. Maxima in the amounts of these species usually occur between 9:00 a.m. and 4:00 p.m. in midsummer. Monitoring has revealed considerable variability in concentrations of the oxidizing pollutants related to abundance of the input substances. Some ozone may be present that originates in the stratosphere.

It has been known that  $SO_2$ ,  $NO_x$ , and  $O_3$  can have toxic effects on plants. In the early days, experiments tended to be performed "scientifically"; that is, plants were exposed in chambers in which the chemicals were tested one at a time. Under those circumstances, it was noted that concentrations of SO<sub>2</sub> and NO<sub>2</sub> greater than ambient were required to produce notable pathology. Indeed, low concentrations of NO<sub>2</sub> were sometimes beneficial (perhaps a fertilizer effect). However, in the real world, pollutants are present together. When experiments were conducted with ambient midday levels of ozone present (for example, 50 to 100 parts per billion), toxicity was noted. When the ozone was supplemented with NO<sub>2</sub>, there was usually a substantial additional toxicity attributable to NO<sub>2</sub>. Similar results were noted when ozone was supplemented with SO<sub>2</sub>.

The deleterious effects of ozone on agricultural crops have been documented and analyzed in a report\* issued by the Environmental Protection Agency. It is estimated that a reduction in ambient ozone levels of 25 percent would produce nearly \$2 billion in benefits, while a 25 percent increase in ozone would lead to an additional \$2.3 billion in crop losses.

The photochemical oxidants, particularly OH, have an important role in the oxidation of  $SO_2$  leading to  $H_2SO_4$ . In the summer, with abundant OH present, the oxidation proceeds much more rapidly than in winter. Sulfur dioxide emissions in winter and summer are about the same, but the total deposition of sulfate in January and February at stations in northeastern states was found to be a third or less than what it was in midsummer. Deposition of nitrate showed little seasonal effect. Thus, at the crucial time of the spring runoff, the contribution of nitric acid was about equivalent to that of sulfuric acid.

Initiatives to reduce acid rain tend to be centered on the electrical utilities and on their emissions of SO<sub>2</sub>. When new coal-fired plants are built, they are required to include facilities for flue gas desulfurization. This adds substantially to the cost of the plant, decreases the efficiency of energy conversion to electricity, and diminishes overall reliability. While the process is effective in capturing SO<sub>2</sub>, it is ineffective in removing NO. Any program aimed at reducing acid rain should take into consideration the total air pollution problem, including  $NO_x$ . Efforts to reduce  $SO_2$  emissions should be accompanied by a corresponding emphasis on reducing  $NO_x$ , whatever the source. For the electrical utilities, this would mean providing more flexibility to use technologies that reduce both  $SO_2$  and  $NO_x$ . But in addition, the other large contributors to  $NO_x$ , such as motor vehicles, should come under scrutiny.-PHILIP H. ABELSON

R. M. Adams, S. A. Hamilton, B. A. McCarl, The Economic Effects of Ozone on Agriculture (Environmental Research Laboratory, Environmental Protection Agency, Corvallis, Ore. 1984).