Fig. 2 have each been explicitly associated with the formation of cyclones in both hemispheres (26).

Identification of westerly wind bursts in the central equatorial Pacific before El Niño events of the past does not improve our capability to predict future El Niño events, beyond what can already be accomplished from monitoring the southern oscillation (27, 28). The strong zonal wind bursts near the date line are neither necessary (for example, there were no bursts before the 1963 El Niño, and very weak bursts occurred before the 1976 El Niño) nor sufficient (for example, strong bursts in 1974 and 1977 were not followed by significant El Niño events) for the existence of El Niño. Other factors, beyond the fluctuations of equatorial winds near the date line, must be influencing the onset and development of El Niño.

### D. S. LUTHER

Scripps Institution of Oceanography, La Jolla, California 92093

D. E. HARRISON Department of Meteorology and Physical Oceanography, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge 02139

# R. A. KNOX

Scripps Institution of Oceanography

#### **References and Notes**

- C. S. Ramage and A. M. Hori, Mon. Weather Rev. 109, 1827 (1981).
- 2. E. Rasmusson and T. Carpenter, ibid. 110, 354 (1982).
- (1982).
  K. Wyrtki, J. Phys. Oceanogr. 5, 572 (1975).
  J. D. Horel and J. M. Wallace, Mon. Weather Rev. 109, 813 (1981); H. van Loon and R. A. Madden, *ibid.*, p. 1150.
  J. McCreary, J. Phys. Oceanogr. 6, 632 (1976).
  H. E. Hurlburt, J. C. Kindle, J. J. O'Brien, *ibid.* p. 61.
- 6.
- *ibid.*, p. 621. S. G. H. Philander, *ibid.* 11, 176 (1981). P. S. Schopf and D. E. Harrison, *ibid.* 13, 936 8 (1983)

T. P. Barnett, ibid. 7, 633 (1977)

- It is well known (2, 3) that months after El Niño 10 begins the equatorial trade winds completely collapse, giving rise to a second peak in the SST anomaly at Peru.
- 11. D. S. Luther and D. E. Harrison, Mon. Weather
- *Rev.*, in press. A. J. Busalacchi and J. J. O'Brien, *J. Geophys. Res.* **86**, 10901 (1981). 12.
- 13. The possible importance of energetic westerly wind bursts to the development of El Niño has been suspected for many years (G. Meyers, personal communication)
- personal communication). The wind data have been low-pass-filtered by a cosine sum filter with the point at -3 dB at 70 days and the point at -10 dB at 50 days. The series were subsequently decimated to approxi-14. mately 1 point for every 14 days, and the long-term mean annual cycle was subtracted.
- W. H. Quinn, D. O. Zopf, K. S. Short, R. T. W. Kuo Yang, Fish. Res. Bull. 76, 663 (1978). 15.
- Kub 1 Aug, 151. Kes. Ball. 76, 005 (1976).
  I. J. R. Donguy, A. Dessier, G. Meyers, Tro Ocean-Atmos. Newsl. 16, 7 (1983).
  W. S. Wooster, *ibid.*, p. 4.
  B. H. Hickey, J. Phys. Oceanogr. 5, 460 (1975).
  K. Wyrtki, *ibid.*, 9, 1223 (1979).
  J. Namias, *ibid.*, 6, 130 (1976).
  The Kelvin wave phase and group speeds va Meyers, Trop.

- 21. The Kelvin wave phase and group speeds vary from 2.3 m sec<sup>-1</sup> in the eastern Pacific to 3.0 m at the Gilbert Islands for the first baroclinic mode, and from 1.3 to  $1.7 \text{ m sc}^{-1}$  for the second baroclinic mode [D. S. Luther, thesis, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge (1980)].
- S. E. Pazan and G. Meyers, *Mon. Weather Rev.* **110**, 587 (1982). 22.

- 23. The point at -3 dB is now 9 days and the point at -10 dB is 6 days.
   24. S. G. H. Philander and R. C. Pacanowski, J.
- *Geophys. Res.* 86, 1903 (1981). *\_\_\_\_\_\_, ibid.* 85, 1123 (1980) concluded that the dominant vertical scale will be similar to that for 25. a second baroclinic mode, where the fluctuation is trapped somewhat to the surface layers by reflection at the thermocline. R. A. Keen, Mon. Weather Rev. 110, 1405 (1982).
- 26.
- W. H. Quinn, J. Appl. Meteorol. 13, 825 (1974).
   W. Wyrtki, E. Stroup, W. Patzert, R. Williams, W. Quinn, Science 191, 343 (1976).
   We thank J. W. D. Hessel and colleagues of the New York Meteory and Activity Sciences 191.
- New Zealand Meteorological Service for sup-

plying manuscript copies of the Gilbert Islands data. The U.S. National Climatic Center sup-plied the Canton Island record. S. Pazan was instrumental in obtaining the Gilbert Islands data, which J. Bytof digitized and preprocessed. Supported by NSF Pacific Equatorial Ocean Dynamics (PEQUOD) program grants OCE 79-21836 (Scripps Institution of Oceanography) and 79-21815 (Massachusetts Institute of Technolo-gy) This is PEOUOD contribution 21. Addition gy). This is PEQUOD contribution 21. Addition al funds (for keypunching) were supplied under the Equatorial Pacific Ocean Climate Studies program of the National Oceanic and Atmo-This is PEQUOD contribution 21. Additionspheric Administration.

5 July 1983; revised 22 August 1983

# Fluoride Directly Stimulates Proliferation and Alkaline **Phosphatase Activity of Bone-Forming Cells**

Abstract. Fluoride is one of the most potent but least well understood stimulators of bone formation in vivo. Bone formation was shown to arise from direct effects on bone cells. Treatment with sodium fluoride increased proliferation and alkaline phosphatase activity of bone cells in vitro and increased bone formation in embryonic calvaria at concentrations that stimulate bone formation in vivo.

Fluoride is essential in the diet and is thought to be required for normal dental and skeletal growth (1). The recommended allowance of fluoride is 1 to 4 mg per day. Doses of 20 to 100 mg per day, or more, usually cause abnormal increases in skeletal mass, even to the point of sclerosis (2). This may represent an exaggerated physiological response or a new and unrelated action, but because the effect of excess fluoride is selective for bone, it has therapeutic applications. Clinical studies have shown that NaF is the most potent agent for increasing bone volume in patients with osteoporosis (3, 4). Although the mechanism is unknown, the skeletal response to supplemental NaF is characterized by increases in (i) the rate of bone formation (4, 5); (ii) the number of osteoblasts, or bone-forming cells (4, 6); and (iii) the



Fig. 1. Dose-response curve for fluoride. Calvarial cell proliferation estimated as [3H]thymidine incorporation, shown as percent of control (no fluoride), versus NaF concentration. Values represent the mean  $\pm$  S.E.M. of six replicates. Dashed line indicates the mean of the control values. A single asterisk indicates a significant difference from controls at P < 0.05; a double asterisk indicates P < 0.005.

serum activity of skeletal alkaline phosphatase (ALP) (7-9), an osteoblastic isoenzyme.

To discover the mechanism whereby fluoride stimulates bone formation, we sought (i) to determine whether any of the characteristic skeletal responses to NaF could be attributed to direct effects on cells in the osteoblast line and (ii) to examine the interactions between NaF and two other bone cell mitogens-parathyroid hormone (PTH) and human skeletal growth factor (hSGF) (10-13). To these ends we have examined the effects of NaF on embryonic chick bone cells in vitro and on embryonic chick bone in organ culture (14, 15).

Bone cells for these studies were prepared from the calvaria of 15-day embryonic chicks by sequential collagenase digestion and were cultured in serumfree Fitton-Jackson modified BGJ<sub>b</sub> medium (16). Histological analysis of the calvaria before digestion has shown that essentially all of the cells available for release were members of the osteoblast cell line. Even in monolayer culture these cells maintained the following characteristics of osteoblasts and osteoblast progenitors: expression of a skeletal-type ALP activity; response to PTH with an increased adenosine 3',5'-monophosphate (cyclic AMP) production (11); conversion of 25-hydroxyvitamin D<sub>3</sub> to more polar metabolites (17); and response to a bone-derived mitogen (hSGF) that is specific for skeletal tissues (12, 13).

To estimate cell proliferation we incubated the calvarial cells overnight and then exposed them to effectors (such as NaF and hSGF) for an additional 18 to 24 hours [this corresponds to the cell cycle

time and allows for an optimal response to hSGF (13).] Cell proliferation was assessed by the incorporation of [<sup>3</sup>H]thymidine into DNA during the final 2 hours of the incubation (16). [<sup>3</sup>H]Thymidine incorporation was increased by exposure to NaF (Fig. 1). The pool size of  $[^{3}H]$ thymidine was not affected by fluoride (18, 19). Cell number was increased to  $162 \pm 7$  percent of control values after 36 hours of exposure to 10  $\mu M$  NaF (P < 0.005) (20). The increase in cell number, which was also observed after exposure to 2.5  $\mu M$  and 25  $\mu M$  NaF (data not shown), and the absence of effect of NaF on the pool size of [<sup>3</sup>H]thymidine strongly suggest that the observed increase in [<sup>3</sup>H]thymidine incorporation reflects, at least in part, an increased rate of cell proliferation. The effect of NaF on [3H]thymidine incorporation was confined to a narrow concentration range (2 to 50  $\mu$ M), which corresponds closely to the serum levels of NaF recommended for increased bone formation in vivo (21). Half-maximal stimulation of [<sup>3</sup>H]thymidine incorporation was seen with 3 to 4  $\mu M$  NaF. The mitogenic effect was specific for bone cells. Incorporation of [<sup>3</sup>H]thymidine was not affected by NaF in identically treated cultures of embryonic chick skin, muscle, kidney, liver, or intestinal cells (22). The effect of NaF on calvarial cells, which was not observed with other halogens (NaBr or NaI), was apparently inductive. Cells exposed to 2.5  $\mu M$  NaF for the first 4 hours of an 18-hour incubation (they were rinsed twice and changed to NaF-free medium after a 4-hour exposure) showed an increase in [<sup>3</sup>H]thymidine incorporation after 18 hours [162  $\pm$  9.5 percent of control (P < 0.005)].



Fig. 2. Interaction of fluoride and PTH. Calvarial cell proliferation ([<sup>3</sup>H]thymidine incorporation), shown as percent of control (no fluoride, no PTH), versus NaF concentration for cells incubated with ( $\bullet$ ) or without ( $\blacktriangle$ ) 0.1 nM PTH. Values represent the mean  $\pm$  S.E.M. of six replicates. A single asterisk indicates a significant difference from controls at P < 0.05; a double asterisk indicates P < 0.005. Values for 1, 2.5, and 10  $\mu$ M NaF with added PTH are significantly different from values without added PTH (P < 0.05).

Table 1. Effects of NaF in vitro. Effects are shown as mean percent of control  $\pm$  S.E.M., with N = 6 for calvarial cells and N = 9 to 16 for calvaria. Absolute values (mean  $\pm$  S.E.M.) for control activities were as follows. Cells: [<sup>3</sup>H]thymidine incorporation, 1223  $\pm$  44 count/min per well; cell number, 7064  $\pm$  351 per well; ALP activity, 0.107  $\pm$  0.005 U per milligram of protein. Bones: <sup>45</sup>Ca deposition, 93,322  $\pm$  5238 count/min per milligram of dry weight; [<sup>3</sup>H]hydroxyproline incorporation, 1240  $\pm$  103 count/min per milligram of dry weight. References for methodologies are given in the text.

NaF		Effect	
Concen- tration (µM)	Expo- sure (hours)	(percent of control)	Р
Cells			
10	18	$163 \pm 14$	< 0.005
10	36	$162 \pm 17$	< 0.005
10	144	$435 \pm 33$	< 0.001
Bones			
25	72	$146 \pm 10$	< 0.01
2.5	144	$156 \pm 14$	< 0.01
2.5	144	$131 \pm 6$	< 0.002
2.5	144	152 ± 14	< 0.01
	$\begin{tabular}{ c c c c c } \hline Na \\ \hline Concentration \\ (\mu M) \\ \hline Cells \\ 10 \\ 10 \\ 10 \\ 10 \\ Bones \\ 25 \\ 2.5 \\ 2$	$\begin{tabular}{ c c c c } \hline NaF \\ \hline \hline Concentration & Sure \\ (\mu M) & (hours) \\ \hline \hline Cells & & \\ 10 & 18 \\ 10 & 36 \\ 10 & 144 \\ Bones & & \\ 25 & 72 \\ 2.5 & 144 \\ 2.5 & 144 \\ 2.5 & 144 \\ \hline \end{array}$	$\begin{tabular}{ c c c c c c } \hline \hline NaF & Effect & (percent of control) \\ \hline \hline \hline Concentration & sure & of control) \\ \hline \hline \hline (\mu M) & (hours) & \hline \hline \\ \hline \hline \\ \hline \hline \\ \hline Cells & & & & & & \\ \hline 10 & 18 & 163 \pm 14 & & \\ 10 & 36 & 162 \pm 17 & & \\ 10 & 144 & 435 \pm 33 & & \\ \hline \\ Bones & & & & & & \\ \hline \\ 25 & 72 & 146 \pm 10 & & \\ 2.5 & 144 & 156 \pm 14 & & \\ 2.5 & 144 & 131 \pm 6 & & \\ 2.5 & 144 & 152 \pm 14 & & \\ \hline \end{array}$

Exposure to NaF during the final 4 hours of the 18-hour incubation had no such effect. These results indicate that NaF can have direct effects on cells in the osteoblast line.

Exposure to NaF also increased ALP activity in the cultured calvarial cells and in the surrounding serum-free medium [see (23) for assay methodology]. After 144 hours of exposure to 10  $\mu M$  NaF, ALP activity in the medium was increased to  $262 \pm 11$  percent of control (P < 0.001) and the ALP activity in the cells was increased to  $435 \pm 33$  percent of control (P < 0.005). (All ALP values are adjusted for variation in protein concentration.) Since ALP activity is more abundant in populations of differentiated osteoblasts than in populations of osteoblast precursors, our results suggest that NaF stimulates both the proliferation and the differentiation of embryonic chick cells in the osteoblast cell line, and this occurs at doses that stimulate bone formation in vivo. We have not yet determined whether the number of ALPpositive cells or the amount of ALP per positive cell is increased by exposure to NaF.

The NaF-induced increase in [<sup>3</sup>H]thymidine incorporation in calvarial cells in vitro was enhanced by coincubation with PTH or with partially purified hSGF. With an 18-hour incubation, 0.1 nM PTH did not affect [<sup>3</sup>H]thymidine incorporation, but it did increase the stimulation seen with 2  $\mu M$  NaF, from 125 to 155 percent of control (P < 0.01 for the difference). A NaF dose-response curve obtained in the presence of 0.1 nM PTH (Fig. 2) confirmed an increased response at lower concentrations of NaF, but showed no increase in the maximum response (that is, the concentration of NaF required for half-maximal stimulation was decreased, but the maximum effect was unchanged). The fact that PTH also reduced the response to  $10 \,\mu M$ NaF suggests that PTH may amplify the activity of NaF, effectively shifting the biphasic dose-response curve to lower NaF concentration (compare Fig. 1 with the curve in Fig. 2 for NaF plus PTH.) There was also a positive interaction of hSGF with NaF. The maximal response of the calvarial cells to NaF was increased by hSGF (Fig. 3). The concentration of NaF required for half-maximal stimulation was not affected by hSGF. These data show that the mechanisms of NaF- and hSGF-stimulated cell proliferation do not share a common ratedetermining step. Our results will not



Fig. 3. Interaction of fluoride and hSGF. Calvarial cell proliferation ([<sup>3</sup>H]thymidine incorporation), shown as percent of control (no fluoride, no hSGF), versus fluoride concentration for cells with ( $\blacktriangle$ , upper curve) or without ( $\bigcirc$ ) added hSGF (2 µg/ml). (Bovine serum albumin has no effect at concentrations less than 20 µg/ml.) Values represent the mean  $\pm$  S.E.M. of six replicates. Dashed line indicates the mean of the control values. A single asterisk indicates a significant difference from controls without fluoride at P < 0.05; a double asterisk indicates P < 0.005.

permit a similar distinction between the mechanism of NaF- and PTH-stimulated cell proliferation, since the effects of these agents were not additive.

To ensure that these apparently direct effects of NaF on embryonic chick calvarial cells were not peculiar to monolayer culture, we examined the responses of embryonic chick bone to NaF in an organ culture system. Half-calvaria (frontal and parietal bones) were dissected from 13-day embryonic chicks and cultured in serum-free BGJ<sub>b</sub> medium as described (24). After overnight incubation the medium was changed and NaF was added. After an additional 18 hours, either [<sup>3</sup>H]proline or <sup>45</sup>Ca was also added. The medium was changed at 36- to 48-hour intervals, but the exposure to NaF and the radioisotopes was continuous. After incubation, the bones were individually extracted with butanol to release membrane-bound ALP activity (23), and the ALP activity and protein concentration were measured in each extract. The extracted bones were dried, weighed, and hydrolyzed in acid (24), and radioactivity was determined in portions of the hydrolyzates. For bone labeled with [<sup>3</sup>H]proline, [<sup>3</sup>H]hydroxyproline (in counts per minute per milligram of dry weight) was determined as an index of collagen synthesis (24). Collagen production, Ca deposition, and ALP activity were all increased in the calvaria by exposure to NaF (Table 1). These results were consistent with our earlier results with calvarial cells. Additional studies revealed that the incorporation of [<sup>3</sup>H]thymidine into DNA (25) was also increased in half-calvaria cultured for 72 hours in the presence of 25  $\mu M$  NaF  $(146 \pm 13 \text{ percent of control}; P < 0.01);$ this is consistent with the interpretation that the increased bone formation was mediated, at least in part, by an increase in osteoblast number.

The effect of NaF on the ALP content of the bones was dose-dependent and saturable. Exposure to  $10 \mu M$  NaF for 72 hours increased ALP activity to a maximum of 215 percent of control (P < 0.001), and half of this maximal effect was seen with 2 to 3  $\mu M$  NaF. This dose of fluoride agrees with that required from half-maximal stimulation of calvarial cell proliferation (3 to 4  $\mu M$ ). Because, in other systems, most of the biochemical effects of NaF require millimolar concentrations (26), bone cells would appear to be unusually sensitive to this agent. Furthermore, our observations on cell specificity suggest that NaF is affecting activities that are unique to bone cells or are particularly sensitive in bone cells (27).

In summary, we have shown for the first time in vitro that NaF can (i) increase the proliferation rate of bone cells, as assessed by [<sup>3</sup>H]thymidine incorporation, both in monolayer culture and in organ culture; (ii) increase the ALP content of bone cells and of embryonic bone; and (iii) enhance the growth and mineralization of embryonic bone. Furthermore, we have shown that the effects of NaF on [3H]thymidine incorporation can be modulated by PTH and by hSGF. Since NaF increases osteoblast number and ALP activity in vivo, these data suggest that the increased bone formation seen with NaF results, at least in part, from direct effects on bone cells in the osteoblast cell line.

> JOHN R. FARLEY JON E. WERGEDAL DAVID J. BAYLINK

Loma Linda University and Pettis Veterans Hospital, Research Service (151), Loma, Linda, California 92357

## **References and Notes**

- 1. W. Mertz, Science 213, 1332 (1981). W. Mellz, Science 213, 1552 (1961).
   T. L. Vischer, C. Bernheim, C. Guerdijikoff, P. Wettstein, R. Lagier, in *Fluoride in Medicine*, T. L. Vischer, Ed. (Huber, Bern, 1970), p. 96. 2. T
- 3. B. L. Riggs et al., J. Am. Med. Assoc. 243, 446
- 4. D. Briancon and P. J. Meunier, in The Orthopedic Clinics of North America, H. M. Frost, Ed. (Saunders, Philadelphia, 1981), vol. 12,
- Ed. (Saunders, Finaderpina, 1997), 1997
- ibid., p. 143.
- A. Dambecher, Th. Lauffenburger, B. 8. M. Lammle, H. G. Hass, in Fluoride and Bone, B. Courvoisier, A. Donath, C. A. Baud, Eds. (Huber, Bern, 1978), p. 232.
  J. R. Farley, C. H. Chesnut, D. J. Baylink, *Clin. Chem.* 27, 2002 (1981).
  D. PTH is known to effect be an effective to effective to effect be an effective to effective to effect be an effective to effective to effect be an effective to effective
- 10. PTH is known to affect bone formation in vitro.
- and we have shown that PTH can directly stimulate the proliferation of osteoblast progenitors in vitro (11). The purification and character-istics of hSGF, a bone-derived mitogen that is specific for skeletal tissues and that increases bone formation in vitro, are as described (12, 13). For these studies hSGF was partially purified by heat and acid precipitations to about 70
- J. R. Farley, A. K. Taylor, D. J. Baylink, *Calcif. Tissue Int.* 34, (Suppl.), S38 (1982).
   J. R. Farley and D. J. Baylink, *Biochemistry* 21, 2007
- K. Parley and D. J. Baylink, *Biochemistry* 21, 3502 (1982).
   J. R. Farley, T. Masuda, J. E. Wergedal, D. J. Baylink, *ibid.*, p. 3508.
   The study of bone cells in monolayer culture is relaxed to study of hore formation in viso.
- relevant to the study of bone formation in vivo because the rate of bone formation is primarily determined by the number of osteoblasts (15). and this is dependent on the proliferation rate of osteoblast progenitors and their subsequent differentiation. It is particularly relevant to these studies because NaF acts in vivo by increasing osteoblast number.
- H. Gruber, J. Ivey, E. Thompson, C. Chesnut, D. Baylink, *Calcif. Tissue Int.* **34** (Suppl.), S31 15.
- 16. R. H. Drivdahl, J. E. Puzas, G. A. Howard, D Baylink, Proc. Soc. Exp. Biol. Med. 168, 143 (1981)
- (1981). G. A. Howard, R. T. Turner, J. E. Puzas, D. K. Knapp, F. Nichols, in *Vitamin D*, A. W. Nor-man, K. Schaefer, D. v. Herrath, H.-G. Grigo-leit, Eds. (DeGruyter, New York, 1982), p. 13.
- 18. [<sup>3</sup>H]Thymidine pool size in calvarial cells was assayed by the method of Puzas *et al.* (19). Briefly, cultured cells were exposed to  $20 \ \mu M$ NaF for 16 hours and then [<sup>3</sup>H]thymidine uptake was determined by incubation with 55 nM

[<sup>3</sup>H]thymidine at 37°C for periods of 5 to 180 minutes. After incubation the cells were washed twice with phosphate-buffered saline (4°C) and both total cellular  $[^{3}H]$ thymidine and  $[^{3}H]$ thymidine precipitable with trichloroacetic acid (TCA) were determined in NaF-treated and -untreated cells. Although TCA-precipitable [<sup>1</sup>H]thymidine was increased in the NaF-treated cells (122  $\pm$  4 percent of control; P < 0.02), with a 120-minute of free [<sup>3</sup>H]thymidine per cell. The effects of thymidine phosphorylation and DNA synthesis on thymidine transport precluded a kinetic analysis of the thymidine transport process; howev-er, steady-state concentrations of intracellular free [<sup>3</sup>H[thymidine were constant from 120 min-utes to 180 minutes. After 180 minutes, the amount of free [<sup>3</sup>H]thymidine in untreated cells (1071  $\pm$  101 count/min per 10<sup>4</sup> cells) was not different from the value for NaF-treated cells (1051  $\pm$  115 count/min per 10<sup>4</sup> cells), indicating that NaF did not affect the cellular pool size of

- <sup>[3</sup>H]thymidine. J. E. Puzas, R. H. Drivdahl, G. A. Howard, D. J. Baylink, *Proc. Soc. Exp. Biol. Med.* **166**, 113 19. (1981)
- 20. All data are given as the mean  $\pm$  standard error of the mean (S.E.M.) for 6 to 12 replicate determinations (except where otherwise noted) and are shown as percentage of control. For statistical comparisons, Student's two-tailed ttest for nonpaired variates was used. Control test for nonpaired variates was used. Control values, omitted for reasons of space, ranged from  $100 \pm 2.5$  percent to  $100 \pm 9$  percent. D. R. Taves, *Fed. Proc. Fed. Am. Soc. Exp. Biol.* **29**, 1185 (1970).
- 21.
- 22. Skin, muscle, kidney, liver, and calvarial cells were prepared from 15-day embryonic chicks and cultured in  $BGJ_b$  medium with 5 percent fetal calf serum. After 48 hours the cells were rinsed, cultured for 24 hours in serum-free medi-um, rinsed again, and assayed for [<sup>3</sup>H]thymidine incorporation after 18 hours of exposure to 10  $\mu M$  NaF. Basal (unstimulated) incorporation was similar in all groups, but only calvarial cells were affected by NaF. The results (for six were affected by NaF. The results (for six replicates) were as follows: kidney, 96  $\pm$  8 per-cent; muscle, 82  $\pm$  5 percent; liver, 88  $\pm$  6.5 percent; skin, 102  $\pm$  7 percent; and calvaria, 143  $\pm$  6 percent (P < 0.001). Our standard as-say protocol of an 18-hour incubation with NaF exposure to [3H]thymidine (2 µCi per 1-ml total volume per well) during the final 2 hours yielded a basal incorporation of  $[^{3}H]$ thymidine that ranged from a low of 929 ± 77 count/min that ranged from a low of  $929 \pm 7/$  count/min per well for liver cells to a high of  $1544 \pm 131$ count/min per well for skin cells. All cells re-sponded to 5 percent fetal calf serum as a positive control.

- positive control.
  23. J. R. Farley, J. E. Puzas, D. J. Baylink, Min. Elect. Metab. 7, 316 (1982).
  24. G. A. Howard, B. L. Bottemiller, D. J. Baylink, Metab. Bone Dis. Rel. Res. 2, 131 (1980).
  25. Half-calvaria from 13-day embryos (N = 16) were exposed to 25 μM NaF for 90 hours, along with untreated controls. [<sup>3</sup>H]Thymidine (0.2 μCi/ml) was present between 18 and 90 hours. The hones were demineratived in TCA. The bones were demineralized in TCA, insoluble [<sup>3</sup>H]thymidine (that is, DNA) and DNA) was
- washed and counts were determined. G. N. Jenkins, P. Venkateswarlo, I. Zipkin, in *Fluoride and Human Health* (World Health Oranization, Geneva, 1970), chapter 6
- In preliminary studies we determined that NaF 27. es not stimulate bone formation by directly this time and the set of the set activity, either in extracts or in situ, at the micromolar concentrations that stimulate bone formation [see (19) for assay methodology]. Similarly, although NaF, at millimolar concenstimilarly, although Nar, at minimular concen-trations, can increase cyclic AMP production (24), and although bone cells have hormone-specific adenylate cyclase systems, NaF did not affect cyclic AMP production in our assay sys-tem at doses that increased hone formation tem at doses that increased bone formation. NaF was incubated with confluent cultures of calvarial cells at doses ranging from 1  $\mu$ M to 1 mM for 15 minutes at 37°C, and cyclic AMP production was determined by a radioreceptor assay (28). PTH was included as a positive control.
- 28. A. Gilman, Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 67, 305 (1970).
- We thank R. Widstrom and A. Taylor for techni-cal assistance and P. Nasabal and P. Duane for secretarial assistance. This work was supported by NIH grants AM31061 and AM31062.

1 November 1982; accepted 19 April 1983