An Intellectual Migration

The Muses Flee Hitler. Cultural Transfer and Adaptation, 1930–1945. Papers from colloquia, Washington, D.C., Feb. and Dec. 1980. JARRELL C. JACKMAN and CARLA M. BORDEN, Eds. Smithsonian Institution Press, Washington, D.C., 1983. 348 pp., illus. Cloth, $17.50; paper, $8.95.

In 1968, the historians Bernard Bailyn and Donald Fleming edited what was immediately recognized as an exciting and important collection of memoirs and monographic articles entitled *The Intellectual Migration: Europe and America, 1930–1960*. Amid the enthusiastic reception of that volume, it was hard to imagine that 15 years later one would still be able to complain that "no overall analysis" of the émigré intellectuals and of their "intellectual or social place . . . in American life or academic history, or in the intellectual history of other countries, has ever been attempted." This all-too-accurate observation is now made by Herbert A. Strauss in a new volume of 20 scholarly articles, *The Muses Flee Hitler: Cultural Transfer and Adaptation, 1930–1945*. Yet slow as historians of American thought and culture have been to recognize the intellectual migration in its entirety as a major subject in their field, specific aspects of this migration have been studied in limited contexts by a number of scholars, including the contributors to *The Muses Flee Hitler*. Since many of these contributors summarize studies published elsewhere, the volume itself serves less to break new ground than to make the findings of recent scholarship more available and to dramatize the need for the more ambitious, integrative work called for by Strauss.

The research harvested by *The Muses Flee Hitler* deals with the migration not only to the United States but to Great Britain, Canada, China, and several nations in Latin America. Though this breadth gives the volume a welcome comparative dimension, what we learn about other destinations of the refugees confirms the singular importance of the United States. Argentina did receive more émigrés per capita than any other nation outside Palestine, but the impact of émigrés there was slight and was led by no distinctive group of scientists and artists. Among the several "host" countries, only Great Britain is even remotely comparable to the United States as a permanent home for culturally creative émigrés.

Since the quality of response to Hitler's victims on the part of the non-Axis world has been a matter of intense concern and debate in recent years, a real contribution of *The Muses Flee Hitler* is to bring together the findings of recent scholarship on this issue. Irving Abella and Harold Troper point out, for example, that Canada might have been an ideal and commodious destination for the refugees, but its doors were bolted by government officials acting chiefly on the basis of a pronounced antipathy toward Jews. Anti-Semitism was also a factor in limiting the hospitality of Great Britain to Hitler's victims, but some 56,000 refugees (90 percent of them Jewish) were admitted between 1933 and 1939. The rescue efforts made by private, voluntary groups tolerated if not encouraged by the British government is assessed by Bernard Wasserstein, who supports the conclusion reached a decade ago by A. J. Sherman to the effect that British refugee policy was less vicious than inept. Roger Daniels reminds us that the now-notorious refusal of the United States to welcome more of Hitler's victims was expressed, in part, through a failure to develop a refugee policy as opposed to an immigration policy. The government of Franklin D. Roosevelt dealt with the novel conditions created by Hitler by means of the anachronistic, "restrictionist" immigration policy enacted in 1924. Fewer than 200,000 refugees from Hitler were admitted to the United States between 1933 and 1945.

Among these 200,000 were the much smaller number of scientists, scholars, and artists whose destiny in America is the chief subject of *The Muses Flee Hitler*. It is odd that the editors allow Gerald Holton to tell again the familiar story of the émigré physicists—to our understanding of whom Holton does not pretend to contribute anything new—while managing not to include essays on the historians (Felix Gilbert, Hans Baron, Hajo Holborn, Hans Rosenberg, *et al.*), the economists (Joseph Schumpeter, Ludwig von Mises, Fritz Redlich, Fritz Machlup, *et al.*), or the philosophers (Rudolf Carnap, Hans Reichenbach, Ernst Cassirer, Herbert Feigl, *et al.*), all of whom await appropriately detailed treatment. The UCLA philosophers Carnap and Reichenbach are not mentioned even in the essay on Southern California by co-editor Jarrell C. Jackman, whose chatty, "human interest" approach to his topic (and what *did* Thomas Mann and Bertolt Brecht feel while strolling on the Pacific Palisades terrace of Lion Feuchtwanger?) would be more suitable for the Sunday edition of the *Los Angeles Times*. Jackman's essay serves primarily as a reminder of the diversity of émigré experience in Southern California. He is properly fascinated, for example, by the adaptive capability of émigré Frederick Kohner, who wrote the mindless surfer novel *Gidget*.

The strongest and freshest of the discipline-oriented studies in *The Muses Flee Hitler* is Nathan Reingold's "Refugee mathematicians in the United States, 1933–1941: reception and reaction." This article, a slightly longer version of which entered the literature of historians of science in 1981, shows how individual leaders of the mathematics profession in the United States overcame the anti-Semitism and professional conservatism of their colleagues in order to find places for the refugee mathematicians in the United States. A second strong contribution is Christian F. Otto's, in which he insists that the predominance in America of the "Miesian skyscraper" resulted not simply from the impact of the émigré architect Ludwig Mies van der Rohe but from Mies's interaction with a distinctive set of native architectual conditions.

To specify the conditions that either frustrated the work of the émigrés or enabled them to pursue their chosen callings with success and recognition in a new country is a concern of many of the contributors. In the most sustained and general discussion of this sort, H. Stuart Hughes identifies four conditions that greatly influenced the destiny of the social theorists he has studied. Hughes's subjects were most likely to find a comfortable role in America if they (i) made a concerted effort, instead of waiting for Americans in their field to flock to them; (ii) were geographically located outside the domain of the most entrenched of American academic establishments, especially Boston-Cambridge; (iii) found themselves in an institutional setting that was relatively new, be it a new federal agency, a university on the make, or a subdisciplinary community undergoing a period of rapid growth or of revolution; and (iv) were numerous enough in a given proximity to support one another

yet not so numerous as to be able to thrive without interacting with local native-born Americans. When Hughes comes to characterize the influence of the émigrés on social theory in the United States, he is strangely elliptical and indecisive. Since Hughes is the author of the major book on the migration of the social theorists, his inability to speak with clarity and conviction about his subject is another indicator of how resistant to historical analysis is the problem of the intellectual migration.

If our historians seem slow to get the intellectual migration into satisfactory focus, our moralists, however, may be ready to assure us that we are now too sophisticated to learn much from the émigrés. This is the remarkable upshot of Alfred Kazin's essay on Thomas Mann and Hannah Arendt. "How much we owe them," Kazin concludes, but what he most appreciates about Arendt, and to a lesser extent Mann, is their *negative* moral and intellectual example. "No Jewish writer coming out of the terrible years" of Nazism could describe the Hebrew God as mischievously as Mann did in *Joseph and His Brothers*; and to treat the Jewish people as abstractly as Arendt often did "is positively unthinkable among American intellectuals today." Some readers may be interested in assessing the truth or falsity of these claims, but others will wish that Kazin had done something more than to report on his own current opinions and to imply that these opinions are shared by the *cognoscenti*.

Kazin's obiter dicta contrast with the fact-gathering, the anecdote-telling, and the particularized analysis of individuals and small groups that continue to dominate the study of the intellectual migration to America, but his adamantly ahistorical contribution is yet another reminder of how elusive as a historical subject this migration remains. Some of the contributors correctly identify "deprovincialization" as a central theme in experience of the émigrés and in their impact on American life, but studies of what actually replaced the varieties of "provincialism" are slow to accumulate and to find a convincing relationship to one another. What may be needed is more attention to the system of values, however loosely constituted and variously formulated, that seems to have been shared by the diverse émigrés and those American intellectuals who responded to them. Strauss, in the essay that is now the best brief introduction to the entire problem of the intellectual migration, refers to this value system as a "new internationalism . . . as yet inadequately conceptualized and explored." It is perhaps to this cosmopolitanism of the intelligentsia of the 1930's, 1940's, and 1950's that we must turn if we are to consolidate and deepen scholarship on "the intellectual migration."

DAVID A. HOLLINGER
Department of History, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor 48109

Anoxic Strata

Nature and Origin of Cretaceous Carbon-Rich Facies. S. O. SCHLANGER and M. B. CITA, Eds. Academic Press, New York, 1982. x, 230 pp., illus., $39.

One of the most intriguing discoveries over the past few years in the study of earth history has been the recognition that sedimentary rocks of Cretaceous age (135 to 65 million years old) are characterized by an unusual abundance of strata deposited under anoxic marine conditions. Because anoxic conditions limit organic reworking of sediment during deposition, the rock that forms from this sediment is generally carbon-rich. Development of anoxic sedimentary environments is usually attributed to variations in local environmental parameters. An exciting possibility that has been raised for Cretaceous "anoxic" strata is that they are related to a general tendency of Cretaceous oceans to develop widespread anoxia in certain portions of the water column, the so-called Cretaceous "oceanic anoxic events." Because strata deposited in anoxic environments are thought to be important source beds for petroleum, the study of these rocks has unusual economic importance; the Mesozoic, in particular the Cretaceous, contains the bulk of known petroleum source beds.

Nature and Origin of Cretaceous Carbon-Rich Facies provides a wide-ranging sample of studies and viewpoints on Cretaceous as well as other strata deposited under conditions of reduced oxygen content. The first three papers combine sedimentological, geochemical, and paleontological data in studies of primarily Cretaceous marine strata. Arthur and Premoli Silva relate carbon-rich strata now exposed in Alpine Mountain belts to periodic upwelling. Dean and Gardner interpret cyclic interbeds of carbon-rich strata off the continental margin of northwest Africa as primarily due to cyclic variations in sediment redox conditions. Such cyclicity may have been caused by variable amounts of organic detritus transported to these deep-water environments from shallow water by turbidity currents. Thiede, Dean, and Claypool interpret "anoxic" strata from the central Pacific Ocean as originating in anoxic environments caused by local coincidence of oceanographic and tectonic factors.

The following four papers examine specific sedimentological, geochemical, or paleontological data in detail from particular Cretaceous carbon-rich strata. In an examination of clay mineralogy of black shales from the Atlantic Basins, Chamley and Robert interpret these sediments as having originated in badly drained terrestrial source areas of tectonic stability and low relief. Habib has studied organic matter from black shales in the North Atlantic and concludes that anoxia was controlled by high sedimentary supply of organic matter and that such high supply rates could have led to deposition of "anoxic" strata regardless of the oxygen content of overlying waters. De Boer's isotopic studies of cyclic carbon-rich facies in the Apennines lead to the conclusion that such cyclicity was caused by shifts of the caloric equator and hence the tropical upwelling zone. Simoneit and Stuermer use organic geochemical indicators to show that Cretaceous "anoxic" strata from around the world vary in terrestrial and marine input of organic material.

The final three papers, although not specifically on Cretaceous carbon-rich strata, provide useful comparative information on "anoxic" strata of other ages. Cita and Grignani's study of Late Neogene Mediterranean cyclically deposited sapropels shows that organic material from these beds has a marine origin and that deposition may have been controlled by a number of processes leading to euxinic conditions. McKenzie's investigation of the carbon-13 content of "anoxic" sediments from a Recent lake in Switzerland is used as a model for examination of some cyclic Cretaceous carbon-rich facies and leads to the postulate that cycles in circulation and productivity were a major reason for the development of these Cretaceous strata. Wilde and Berry, in a comparison of Paleozoic and Mesozoic oceanic ventilation, present a physical oceanographic model to account for the development of oceanic anoxia in the Cretaceous.

The study of "anoxic" strata has reached a vigorous development only in the past ten years. The discovery and study of widespread Cretaceous carbon-rich facies on continents and in the ocean basins have considerably spurred this research. As is demonstrated in this volume, there clearly are a wide variety of