References

1. J. C. McDonald, M. R. Becklake, G. W. Gibbs, A. D. McDonald, C. E. Rossiter, *Arch. Environ. Health* **28**, 61 (1974); J. C. McDonald and M. R. Becklake, *Hefte Unfallheilkd.* **126**, 521 (1976).

!Kung Ecology

In an otherwise knowledgeable review (13 May, p. 761) of our book *Kalahari Hunter-Gatherers: Studies of the !Kung San and Their Neighbors* (*1*), B. J. Williams makes a serious error of fact. In the book we argued that !Kung San (Bushmen), in spite of their desert environment and simple technology, have a more than adequate food supply. In taking issue with that view, Williams cites a piece of evidence that he says has not been published and that he calls "the real clincher." He writes, "Lee noted in his Ph.D. dissertation of 1965 that two-thirds of the San population in the Dobe region had been removed from there in a resettlement program only 2 to 3 years prior to his fieldwork. That there were superabundant gathered foods after two-thirds of the population had been removed is not surprising, nor is the superabundance relevant to general hypotheses concerning hunter-gather adaptations."

No such statement appears in Lee's dissertation, nor did such an exodus occur. What Lee did say was that in 1960 the South African government had settled the !Kung of Nyae Nyae but that the Dobe area !Kung from the Bechuanaland side of the border did not join the settlement scheme in any numbers. Lee went on to state that fewer than 50 Dobe !Kung went to the settlement while over 350 continued to hunt and gather in the Dobe area (*2*, p. 67). In other words, the maximum out-migration indicated was 12.5 percent, not 66.7 percent as Williams says. The settlement of the !Kung of Nyae Nyae, a different population, did not add a single square mile of foraging area to the space available to the Dobe !Kung.

The data available, far from showing a rapidly declining population for the Dobe area, indicate a stable or rising one during the period in question. Lorna Marshall estimated 432 !Kung in the Dobe area in 1952 (*3*). In 1964 (*2*, p.45) Lee counted 433, a figure later revised to 466 after a more thorough census taken in 1967 (*4*). None of us found any evidence to support a two-thirds drop in population prior to the study period (*5*). In our research project the findings of each investigator were checked against the work of several others; a discrepancy of such magnitude could not have gone unnoticed. Williams's assertion leaves the impression that members of the research group somehow suppressed information about massive out-migration in their published work.

This is not the place to go into the complex issues of !Kung ecology and history. Let us just say that, whatever the source of the !Kungs' ample food supply, Williams is certainly in error in attributing it to depopulation.

RICHARD B. LEE
Department of Anthropology, University of Toronto, Toronto, Ontario, Canada M55 1A1
NANCY HOWELL
Division of Social Sciences, Scarborough College, University of Toronto
HENRY HARPENDING
Department of Anthropology, University of New Mexico, Albuquerque 87131

References

1. *Kalahari Hunter-Gatherers*, R. Lee and I. DeVore, Eds. (Harvard Univ. Press, Cambridge, Mass., 1976).
2. R. Lee, "Subsistence ecology of !Kung Bushmen," doctoral dissertation, University of California, Berkeley (1965).
3. L. Marshall, *The !Kung of Nyae Nyae* (Harvard Univ. Press, Cambridge, Mass., 1976), p. 159.
4. R. Lee, in *Hunters and Gatherers Today*, M. G. Bicchieri, Ed. (Holt, Rinehart and Winston, New York, 1972), p. 333.
5. N. Howell, in (*1*), pp. 137–151; H. Harpending, in *ibid.*, pp. 152–165.

American Ice Cream

Nicholas Wade states in his article on the current ice cream controversy (News and Comment, 27 Aug., p. 844) that American ice cream is "made from dairy products of one sort or another." Actually, most American ice cream contains approximately 18 percent sweeteners and flavorings and about 0.5 percent stabilizers and emulsifiers. A commonly used stabilizer is carrageenin (extracted from seaweed), and cereal proteins (gluten) are used as emulsifiers. Federal law does not require container listing of ingredients in ice cream, and ice cream manufacturers seem reluctant to divulge this information. As a result, people who cannot tolerate gluten are unable to eat ice cream.

The Food and Drug Administration would do consumers a service if it insisted upon container listing of the exact ingredients in ice cream.

L. T. RUTLEDGE
Department of Physiology, University of Michigan Medical School, Ann Arbor 48109