SCIENCE

AMERICAN ASSOCIATION FOR THE ADVANCEMENT OF SCIENCE

Science serves its readers as a forum for the presentation and discussion of important issues related to the advancement of science, including the presentation of minority or conflicting points of view, rather than by publishing only material on which a consensus has been reached. Accordingly, all articles published in Science—including editorials, news and comment, and book reviews—are signed and reflect the individual views of the authors and not official points of view adopted by the AAAS or the institutions with which the authors are affiliated.

Editorial Board

1974

ALFRED BROWN JAMES F. CROW SEYMOUR S. KETY FRANK PRESS FRANK W. PUTNAM MAXINE F. SINGER GORDON WOLMAN

1975

HERBERT S. GUTOWSKY
N. BRUCE HANNAY
DONALD KENNEDY
DANIEL E. KOSHLAND, JR.

DONALD LINDSLEY
RUTH PATRICK
RAYMOND H. THOMPSON

Editorial Staff

Editor: PHILIP H. ABELSON

Business Manager: HANS NUSSBAUM

Managing Editor: ROBERT V. ORMES

Assistant Editors: ELLEN E. MURPHY, JOHN E. RINGLE

Assistant to the Editors: PATRICIA ROWE

News and Comment: JOHN WALSH, LUTHER J. CARTER, DEBORAH SHAPLEY, ROBERT GILLETTE, NICHOLAS WADE, CONSTANCE HOLDEN, BARBARA J. CULLITON, SCHERRAINE MACK

Research News: Allen L. Hammond, William D. Metz, Thomas H. Maugh II, Jean L. Marx, Arthur L. Robinson, Gina Bari Kolata, Fannie Groom

Book Reviews: KATHERINE LIVINGSTON, LYNN MANFIELD, JANET KEGG

Cover Editor: GRAYCE FINGER

Editorial Assistants: Margaret Allen, Isabella Bouldin, Eleanore Butz, Mary Dorfman, Sylvia Eberhart, Judith Givelber, Corrine Harris, Nancy Hartnagel, Oliver Heatwole, Christine Karlik, Margaret Lloyd, Eric Poggenpohl, Jean Rockwood, Leah Ryan, Lois Schmitt, Richard Semiklose, Ya Li Swigart. Eleanor Warner

Guide to Scientific Instruments: RICHARD SOMMER

Membership Recruitment: Gwendolyn Huddle; Subscription Records and Member Records: Ann Ragland

Advertising Staff

Director EARL J. SCHERAGO Production Manager
Margaret Sterling

Advertising Sales Manager: RICHARD L. CHARLES

Sales: New York, N.Y. 10036: Herbert L. Burklund, 11 W. 42 St. (212-PE-6-1858); SCOTCH PLAINS, N.J. 07076: C. Richard Callis, 12 Unami Lane (201-889-4873), CHICAGO, ILL. 60611: Jack Ryan, Room 2107, 919 N. Michigan Ave. (312-DE-7-4973); BEVERLY HILLS, CALIF. 90211: Winn Nance, 111 N. La Cienega Blvd. (213-657-2772); DONSET, VT. 05251: Fred W. Dieffenbach, Kent Hill Rd. (802-867-5581)

EDITORIAL CORRESPONDENCE: 1515 Massachusetts Ave., NW, Washington, D.C. 20005. Phones: (Area code 202) Central Office: 467-4350; Book Reviews: 467-4367; Business Office: 467-4411; Circulation: 467-4417; Guide to Scientific Instruments: 467-4480; News and Comment: 467-4430; Reprints and Permissions: 467-4448; Research News: 467-4321; Reviewing: 467-4440. Cable: Advancesci. Washington. Copies of "Instructions for Contributors" can be obtained from the editorial office. See also page xv. Science, 28 June 1974. ADVERTISING CORRESPONDENCE: Room 1740, 11 W. 42 St., New York, N.Y. 10036. Phone: 212-PE-6-1858.

The Decline of Merit

The present list of dire predictions is long enough: loss of confidence in representative government, depression, collapse of the world monetary system, nuclear terrorism, or Manhattan Island bought by an Arab oil potentate. To these we must add one more: the end of merit as the primary means by which professionals are recruited, selected, rewarded, promoted, and judged. This could be the last straw. Merit is the principle that selection, promotion, and reward for individuals should be based on the quality of their individual performance. If this principle is lost, mediocrity becomes inevitable.

The evidence is all around us that adherence to the merit principle is on the decline. Seniority, job rights, and tenure dominate most civil service systems in the country. Effective merit compensation and performance evaluation systems are rare in state and local governments and in public school systems, and proposals for their adoption are under strong attack. Our daughter comes home from the sixth grade with a glowing report card and a marvelous social experience, but tells us candidly that she hasn't been required to learn very much. In the foreign service of the United States, the "up or out" principle is under serious fire. While many unions and employee organizations genuinely support merit and have often promoted the adoption of merit systems, the union hiring hall may not be far off for most professionals and public servants.

In the academy itself, tenure is on its way to becoming a job rights system for the protection of mediocrity rather than the right of free inquiry. And, except for the first tenure decision made too early in the professor's professional career, academe has little stomach for the hard choices.

Racial and sexual discrimination in personnel systems, the professions, and labor unions has turned a spotlight on the personnel process much as did widespread corruption and political patronage in an earlier time. The attention which the urgent need for aggressive affirmative action for employment of women and minorities has focused on the justice of personnel decisions is long overdue. Good affirmative action programs honor the merit principle because the goal of equal employment opportunity is a merit system and the means of its attainment must be consistent with that goal. Affirmative action advocates who are working zealously to correct the dreadful effects of racial and sexual discrimination know they must adhere strongly to the merit principle lest they hand the remaining racists and sexists, and also some serious liberal doubters, a crowbar-reverse discrimination and lowered standards. Merit system advocates know that a merit personnel system is a hollow mockery if the work force thus selected is not both determined by merit and representative of the society it serves. Those who believe in merit and those who believe in affirmative action must hold together or lose both. Merit, equal employment opportunity, and affirmative action are all soldiers in the same cause—a just, whole, fair, productive, and representative society.

Brains and sound quality performance will be the basis of whatever success our society has in dealing with the seemingly intractable problems of our times. American society must quite literally live by its wits in a time when its resources, its oceans, its lands, and its special political institutions won't carry the weight they once did, and when military strength cannot and should not. Strengthening the principle of merit in our society thus becomes a matter of survival.—Brewster C. Denny, Graduate School of Public Affairs, University of Washington, Seattle 98105