

from those made destitute by childlessness or other causes. Incidentally, this point has been frequently made in anthropological studies of Indian villages, a literature of which the authors of this report seem unaware. *The Khanna Study* gives no attention to the dynamics of villagers' economic and social situation over time.

In castigating the Khanna study for ignoring economic factors, Mamdani is led rather far along the path of a monocausal economic determinism. He neglects other factors operating to increase family size. For example the status system gives high prestige to the parents of large families. The religions of India place a high value on the production of children. Kinship values stress the need for an heir. Children provide security, both in economic and in social terms, for the old and the ill in a country where old-age pensions, sickness benefits, and unemployment insurance are inadequate or nonexistent. The effects of the wider political structure on villagers are almost totally ignored, but that is what enables education and migration, and can bring development projects to the village, as indeed happened in the study area. Finally there are the pleasures of having children. Over all this hangs a still high infant mortality rate and the expectation of the death of infants and children which Indians have experienced over the centuries. All these factors militate against birth control. Whether or not people use birth control depends not on the availability of contraceptives but on the availability of incentives to have fewer children. After all, coitus interruptus and abortion were the major population control methods in Europe until very recent times; yet family size was limited when other elements in the social structure enabled people to see improvement in their own life chances from having fewer children (for example, upward economic and social mobility correlated with industrialization and urbanization).

In fact the villagers of the Punjab were controlling their population—by migrating to the towns. Wyon and Gordon dismiss this as merely transferring the population problem from one area to another. This again illustrates their bias. They are looking at population problems in global or at least all-India terms, not through the eyes of a villager. Taken together these two books show that birth control depends on many more factors than the

availability of easily used contraceptives (the technological view). Birth control succeeds or fails insofar as people see their own individual life chances in terms of more or fewer children (the motivational view). These estimates depend not only on the intimate relations between men and women but on the political, economic, and social relations within the whole community. They vary between groups and individuals and can change for a given individual over the course of his life.

BURTON BENEDICT

*Department of Anthropology,  
University of California,  
Berkeley*

## Communes in Israel

**Family and Community in the Kibbutz.** YONINA TALMON. Harvard University Press, Cambridge, Mass., 1972. xviii, 266 pp., illus. \$12.

If the social sciences are concerned with a single, central problem it is that of the interrelations between ideology, norms, value-attitudes, and social action. This is the late Yonina Talmon's phrasing. Others might phrase it as culture, norms, and social action. But whatever the form, and the form reflects theoretical differences of more or less importance, this is the central problem of the social sciences and the central theoretical problem of this book.

In 1955 Talmon, an Israeli sociologist, undertook a major study of the kibbutzim. She worked on it until her death in 1966. This volume collects her published papers on this study (by no means all the papers she published). Some appeared in English in American journals, but many were published in Hebrew in Israeli journals and are translated into English especially for this volume. The book is therefore in a sense her final report on that major study of the kibbutz.

An appendix contains a clear, brief statement not only of the objectives of the study, but of its methodology as well. Most notable is the way in which sociological as well as anthropological field techniques are synchronized into an extraordinarily sharp instrument of research, guided always by the central theoretical problem of the research.

The basic features of the kibbutz are common ownership of property, except for a few personal belongings, and communal organization of production

and consumption. The kibbutz starts in what Talmon calls a "bund" stage, where there is dedication to an all-pervasive "revolutionary" mission, intensive collective identification, spontaneous and direct primary relations among all members, informal social controls, and social homogeneity, that is, no formal social differentiation. The kibbutzim are started by young, unattached individuals who share a comparatively long period of social, ideological, and vocational training. In the bund stage there is almost no functional differentiation. But the process which brings about the emergence of the next, the "commune," stage is the development of functional differentiation and the attenuation and accommodation or adjustment of the revolutionary ideology to the changing facts of life, a decline in the intensity of collective identification, and a standardization of norms of behavior and formalization of social controls.

There are two central elements in the ideology at both the bund and the commune stages. The first is the primacy of the community over other values; this is of course part and parcel of the whole "revolutionary ideology" in that the kibbutz is seen both as a pioneering enterprise in a new way of life and as performing a vital function in the building of the new nation of Israel. The second element, equally important in the definition of the kibbutz as a revolutionary organization, is its commitment to an egalitarian set of principles, whether with regard to individual prestige or to sex roles.

Given this definition of the ideological situation, two particular elements are defined as antithetical to the commune. The first is the family, the second the individual. In the bund stage the family is seen as an institution that tends to usurp the individual's commitment to communal aims and goals, and the situation is defined in almost classical economic terms: any degree to which the individual holds to family goals diminishes by just that degree his loyalty and commitment to the commune. And by the same token, any degree to which the individual takes himself, his own needs, interests, or concerns into account by precisely that degree compromises his total commitment to the commune and the community (and ultimately the nation). Hence the virtual elimination of the family, the development of the communal facilities for child care and child

rearing, communal dining, the spartan existence, and the rejection of material values of personal significance, and so forth, which characterize the commune particularly during the bund stage.

As the bund stage shifts to the commune stage, familistic values gain not only in legitimacy but in salience in the value hierarchy of each individual. Talmon provides nice measures of these shifts. Her analysis of this process over time is superb. Indeed, the step-by-step analysis of the role of ideology in reforming norms, the role of norms in reforming value-attitudes, and the role of social action both as cause and consequence, but by no means simply one or the other, is one of the most valuable features of this book.

Of particularly timely interest is Talmon's finding on the part women play in undermining the revolutionary orientation and especially that part of it that affirms the equality of the sexes. As the kibbutz changes from bund to commune, the number of persons showing more and more concern with familistic and individualistic goals increases, and it continues to increase. But it is the women who take the lead in reaffirming the values of family, in undermining the communal child care and rearing centers, and in affirming the rights of the individual to creature comforts and to special forms of personal gratification, at the same time themselves slipping back to the inferior position of women within the whole system. Not only are women more willing to take on menial jobs for the sake of the family and the children, but in Israel they have ample support from the religious system in this, and are correspondingly more willing to accept a subordinate position in the family itself. In its own special way, the evidence here supports those in the women's liberation movement who see the family as one, if not the major, source of sex role inequality.

One of the most illuminating analyses in the book concerns the interesting finding that those who have been reared in the same peer group in the same commune almost never intermarry, although exogamy is not normatively enjoined. Is this an incest taboo in the making? Not at all, says Talmon, and she shows why in a chapter on mate selection. Similarly interesting is the finding that there is no formation of elites despite the increasingly high degree of functional differentiation as time goes on.

It goes without saying that the ideology of the kibbutz is very close to that of a host of other such communal organizations whether in contemporary America, earlier periods of American history, or in certain European variants. Hence the relevance of this study of the Israeli phenomenon goes far beyond that small country.

DAVID M. SCHNEIDER

*Department of Anthropology,  
University of Chicago,  
Chicago, Illinois*

## Coastland

**Ecology of Salt Marshes and Sand Dunes.** D. S. RANWELL. Chapman and Hall, London, 1973 (U.S. distributor, Halsted [Wiley], New York). xiv, 258 pp., illus. \$14.50.

Public awareness of the value of salt marshes has coincided with increased contamination of coastal waters, heightened development of marshlands, and generally increased human activities of sorts in coastal areas.

This not only applies to the United States but seems to embrace much of the world. D. S. Ranwell writes in a highly readable way about salt marshes and dunes which he studied extensively in Britain, though the book is not restricted to that coast.

"Salt marshes are the product of land erosion and therefore an expanding resource. It is no accident that the greater part of the world's population derives its food from the great deltas, largely in the form of fish and rice." This quotation is taken from section 4, devoted to the management of salt marsh and sand dune wildlife resources. That Ranwell sees as a major management problem the creation of marshes on previously open flats is a comment on the ability of the hybrid *Spartina anglica* to spread into suitable habitats. Although marshes expand on our coast as well, we are destroying them faster and would think of marsh management from this aspect. Both aspects are discussed by Ranwell.

The book was written to be read, not only referred to occasionally for needed facts. Despite occasional truisms and use of unnecessary ecological jargon, such as "therophyte" for "annual species," Ranwell has succeeded in his aim to make the book easily understandable to students, research workers, and even the general public.

The book is designed more along the lines of a textbook than of a trade volume, but it is clear and concise and passes the barrier between the two.

Ranwell has included a good summary of the literature from both sides of the Atlantic on most aspects of dunes and marshes. A few omissions, such as the lack of an adequate explanation for the function of air spaces in marsh plants, mentioned several times, are notable. A report of work on the effects of management on the beach and dune systems of the barrier islands around Cape Hatteras would have added to the section on management, but the work may well have been too recent for inclusion. These, however, are minor criticisms against a basically sound book.

The volume covers the plant ecology and geology of marshes and dunes with some completeness. Not a great deal is written about the animals of these environments, but, as the author points out in relation to the dunes, what the animals do and where they do it has not been well worked out.

Probably the effects of most animals on the marsh and dune systems are not very great. The important animals are man, domestic cattle and sheep, and rabbits, whose abundance is also greatly influenced by man. The effects of these animals are discussed in the balanced section on management, which should also serve as a useful summary of practices and their effects for people who have to make the actual decisions about the future of these limited resources.

JOHN TEAL

*Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution,  
Woods Hole, Massachusetts*

## Environmental Physiology

**Physiological Adaptations.** Desert and Mountain. A symposium, Las Vegas, Nev., April 1971. MOHAMED K. YOUSEF, STEVEN M. HORVATH, and ROBERT W. BULLARD, Eds. Academic Press, New York, 1972. xiv, 258 pp., illus. \$14.50. Environmental Sciences.

This volume, dedicated to David Bruce Dill on his 80th birthday, is a tribute to that early pioneer, who has been a continuous contributor to environmental and exercise physiology for more than four decades. Appropriately, this collection of papers includes contributions from some of