Population Biology

In their flippant reply to Amadon's criticism (I) of their article on "Patterns and populations" (2), Ehrlich and Holm have shown themselves adept at gamesmanship without, however, deigning to encounter the issue. It is often sound strategy to deflect criticism by charging the critic with emotionality. However, in view of the peremptory manner in which Ehrlich and Holm have presented some rather startling notions, it seems desirable to scrutinize their contentions in greater detail.

The particular framework in which Ehrlich and Holm attempt to develop their ideas on population biology appears to be strongly influenced by the operationalism introduced into physics by Bridgman (3). This notion, which is a kind of ultimate development of logical empiricism, has apparently proved of some use in physics in bridging the gap between "paper-and-pencil" theoretical work and laboratory manipulation. However, as Bridgman himself observed (4), operationalism is scarcely more than a point of view, not a developed philosophy. Furthermore, not all physicists are in sympathy with the operationalist attitude [for example, Lindsay (5)].

At any rate, Ehrlich and Holm seem to be suggesting that the new field of population biology be organized along strictly operationalist lines. One can certainly sympathize with them in their distress at the prevalent misuse of systematic and ecological concepts. Most biologists would not go along with them, however, in summarily dismissing concepts such as "competition," "community," and "species" as having "low information content and little or no operational meaning." In answer, it may be pointed out (i) that words at the level of abstraction of "community" are not necessarily intended to convey specific, detailed information and (ii) that, at least in the opinion of many investigators, the term species does have

236

Letters

a clear and well-defined operational meaning. As shown in the discussions at a AAAS symposium by Mayr and others (6), systematists are not unaware of the difficulties encountered in application of the species concept to certain critical cases.

The species concept seems to be one of the main targets for operationalist criticism, and Ehrlich and Holm go to considerable lengths to suggest a parallel (unjustified, in my opinion) between the species and the Newtonian concept of absolute time. Here, however, as in several other places, they are setting up a straw man by imputing to presentday systematics philosophical concepts (in particular, Platonism) that have been discarded by virtually all leading systematists. As Simpson (7) has pointed out, it is in the taxonomic procedures of the operationalists themselves that we find typologically oriented practices!

The operationalist argument against the biological species concept may seem convincing to those who assume an engineering point of view in attacking biological problems. But when the principles of numerical taxonomy [as enumerated by Sneath and Sokal (8), for example] are examined critically, most practicing systematists will have numerous reservations about the possibilities of the method. The great advantage of numerical taxonomy (better called computer taxonomy) is that it does achieve the desirable goals of increased objectivity and repeatability. Unfortunately, the delimitation of "phenons" with great mathematical precision is achieved at the price of a high degree of arbitrariness. Phenons may be "rigged" at the proper percentage level to make them approximate natural taxonomic groups, but then, it must be asked, what has been gained in return for all the time and expense of data programming and computer analysis. There would appear to be a real use for computer taxonomy in classifying intractable groups such as the bacteria and in comparing higher categories (genera and above), but I fail to see that it is the panacea for all systematic problems.

The most striking defect in computer taxonomic studies thus far is the priority they give description over experiment. On the basis of Ehrlich's analysis of 13 male butterflies, we are informed that the species concept is of doubtful applicability in animals! Edwards (9), who has given this proposition the appraisal it deserves, suggests (facetiously, no doubt) that Ehrlich is attempting to lead students from biology back into museumology. It is extraordinary, in fact, how little regard computer taxonomists seem to have for genetic evidence. They generously permit the use of genetic relationships as characters, but would, for example, presumably allow the degree of chromosome pairing in an interspecific hybrid the same weight as a trivial morphological feature (for example, degree of hairiness). Since virtually no attempt has been made in these computer studies to account for the environmentally affected component of variation, this disregard for genetic evidence seems the more incomprehensible. One would think that Turesson, Clausen, Stebbins, Dobzhansky, and other evolutionists had labored in vain! In my opinion, this Adansonian insistence on equal weighting of all characters (contrary to the experience of most competent systematists) is clung to more out of expedience-that is, for ease of programming data for the digital computer-than from any consideration of sound theoretical basis.

The fact is that Ehrlich and Holm are the most radical contemporary representatives of what we may call the reactionary party in systematics. As pointed out by Gilmour (10), who presents a more balanced exposition of this school of thought, there has been, throughout the past century, an undercurrent of objection to Darwinian and neo-Darwinian ideas among biologists with a temperamental antagonism to theoretical and deductive ideas. Philosophically, the numerical taxonomists of the 1960's are very close to the conservative late-Victorian systematists who preferred typological to phylogenetic methods. The proponents of strictly empirical approaches to biology have sometimes played a very useful role in restraining excesses of phylogenetic speculation by those in the Darwinian camp. But the extreme operationalist point of view not only carries with it the dangers of shallow-



Try UNITRON'S new



Model V-2000 R Just ONE of a COMPLETE LINE of PORTABLE SYSTEMS from PENN-CHEM. For catalog and prices contact your laboratory supply dealer or write Dept. D-I **Penn-Chem Corporation**

ness and superficiality but is fundamentally anti-evolutionist in emphasis, despite assertions to the contrary. I agree with Ehrlich and Holm that "perpetuation of today's theory as dogma will not encourage progress toward more satisfactory explanations of observed phenomena." Unfortunately, in view of their methodological bias and paucity of theoretical principles, it is difficult to see how they are going to be more successful than other biologists in studying the "pattern in which organisms are related in space and time." To judge from the magnitude of operationalist achievements so far, it would seem premature to knell the demise of the biological species concept and to proclaim the approach of a "non-Euclidean" theory of classification. In the words of Rothstein, a hard-boiled operationalist (11): "we believe that lack of progress in non-physical disciplines where attempts have been made to introduce operational definitions results from the lack of well-defined laws. . . Operational definitions . . . are necessary rather than sufficient conditions for progress." **GRADY L. WEBSTER**

Department of Biological Sciences, Purdue University, Lafayette, Indiana

References

- D. Amadon, Science 138, 733 (1962).
 P. R. Ehrlich and R. W. Holm, *ibid.* 137, 652 (1962).
 P. W. Bridgman, The Logic of Modern Physics (Macmillan, New York, 1927).
 ..., Sci. Monthly 79, 224 (1954).
 R. B. Lindsay, *ibid.* 79, 221 (1954).
 E. Mayr, Ed., "The Species Problem", Publ. Am. Assoc. Advan. Sci. No. 50 (1957).
 G. G. Simpson, Principles of Animal Taxonomy (Columbia Univ. Press, New York, 1961).
- 1961). 8. P. H. A. Sneath and R. R. Sokal, Nature
- **193, 855** (1962). J. G. Edwards, Systematic Zool. 11, 142 9. J.
- (1962).
- (1962). 10. J. S. L. Gilmour, Nature 168, 400 (1951). 11. J. Rothstein, Phil. Sci. 29, 406 (1962).

We admit that our thinking, like that of virtually all present-day scientists, has been influenced by the writings of Bridgman. This does not mean that we embrace operationalism as a philosophy of science, for it does not represent a philosophy and was not proposed as such. Our attitude is well summed up by Rothstein: operational definitions are necessary but not sufficient conditions for progress. Much useful theoretical structure in biology (for example, various ideas about the origin of life, the general theory of evolution) is not amenable to direct operational analysis. However, valid concepts which are formally integrated into such a theo-

SCIENCE, VOL. 139

INSTRUMENT VALUE NEWS!

take a look at viscosity measurement from this pennies instead of dollars point of view...

Here are some cost-to-value ratio facts that present welcome relief from today's spiraling cost crush. Look at the value that backs Brookfield Synchro-Lectric Viscometers. From this point of view, here's what you find:

• Initial cost: From \$370 for the 4 speed models to \$425 for the 8 speed models, including spindles and carrying case. More important, the instrument is so versatile you can measure any fluid material—in centipoises, in seconds, in the plant, the lab or the field. This versatility means you're spending pennies, not dollars per determination.

• Operation, so simple any non-technically trained person can use a Brookfield viscometer with absolute precision. Flip a switch, read the dial...that's all there is to it. You're spending pennies, not dollars, in personnel time.

• Maintenance is a breeze, because for all practical purposes, there isn't any! Just a quick rinse for the spindles, that's all. Brookfield design and construction has proven its reliability the world over. There are thousands still in use that are over 15 years old! With Brookfield you spend pennies, not dollars for maintenance!

Want More Facts? They are available upon request.

Brookfield Engineering laboratories incorporated stoughton 24, mass. BROOKFIELD VISCOMETERS

18 JANUARY 1963

retical framework must be verifiable empirically. Such empirical verification requires operational definition. The interesting assessment of operationalism by Lindsay does not seem germane to this discussion. Concepts such as "species," "niche," and "community" have not been used by biologists as abstruse theoretical constructs linkable only indirectly (or perhaps not at all) with observations. It would be entirely fair to say that many biologists are under the impression that species, niches, and communities are things observed. If these concepts are to be useful to biologists, their operational definition is a sine qua non.

It is obvious to anyone that words such as *community* are acceptable and useful in many contexts (as we discussed with reference to tundra). It is when they are used, as they almost inevitably seem to be, as labels for presumptive general units that operational definitions must be formulated. That this is a problem should be clear in view of the prevalent discussions of community "migration" or biome "phylogeny." The problem is no less difficult with respect to "species." There are numerous definitions of biological species in the literature, but none is operational, since they all include the idea of "potential interbreeding" and this cannot, by definition, be tested. Indeed, theoreticians have been unable to establish a satisfactory measure of actual interbreeding, although one might hope such a standard may eventually be devised. Many modern taxonomists "feel" that biological species exist (at least in diploid out-crossing organisms); they take the point of view that the principal difficulty is in finding or delimiting them (although virtually every well-studied case turns out to be "borderline" or "a problem"). The attempt to force all organisms (including apomictic and allopolyploid plants) into the "biological species" is as common as it is indefensible.

The problem of typology has been dealt with in great detail by Sokal (1), who points out that it is improper "to attach automatic derogatory implications to the adjective 'typological,' since it is only those aspects of typological procedure which cannot be defended or maintained today that would merit such a connotation." Daly (2), in another analysis of the problem, states, "It is now clear that the phyletic approach has perpetuated the most undesirable attributes of classical typology: the need for a fundamental char-



The brand-new Honeywell 8100 Recorder described on the preceding page has many interesting and exclusive features. An unusual feature in a recorder of such instrumentation quality as the 8100 is its portability. One man can carry it. It weighs only 75 pounds!

IS TRULY

PORTABLE

The 8100 will open up new opportunities for your instrument acquisition program, as its great electronics versatility, built-in calibration, and portability make it an easy instrument to use.

Call your nearest Honeywell Branch, or write for brochure to Honeywell, Electronic Medical Systems, Denver 10, Colo.



GREINER PERISTALTIC PUMPS

with VARIABLE FEED capability assure safe, smooth, continuous transfer of liquids and gases. Newly designed throttle adjusts delivery rate from 4.7 liters per min. to a few drops per min. Pump never gets wet...never touches fluid circulated through it. For quick, convenient change-over from one liquid to another, just change tubing! No cleaning problems, no danger of contamination. Handles acids, bases, toxic and sterile liquids and gases with equal facility.

Peristaltic Pump with air motor offers all advantages of standard model—but adds new element of versatility. Explosion proof air motor can operate where no electrical facilities exist. Has needle valve for precise control.

 T33050 Peristaltic Pump complete with 115volt 60-cycle A.C. motor. Dimensions: 9" x 10%" x 8" high......Ea. \$120

 T33050-1 Peristaltic Pump complete with air motor and 4 ft. hose......Ea. \$139

 T33055 Silicone Tubing-½ inch O.D. x ½ inch wall. Can withstand 1,000 hours of continuous pump operation. Per ft.....\$1.05

 G21690 Tygon Tubing-½ inch O.D. x ½ inch wall. Per ft......40c

 Write for descriptive bulletin on either or both models.

and Palo Laboratory Supplies Inc. 22 N. MOORE STREET, DEPT. 524, NEW YORK 13, N. Y.

GREINER

CORPORATION

SCIENT

N INTIMATE-FITTING HEATING MANTLE WITH ELASTIC NECK ENTRY!

This light, fully enclosing mantle is completely flexible. Flat or round bottomed flasks and flasks of wide tolerance can be efficiently heated with the same sized mantle.

Model MJ is particularly suitable for multiple necked flasks and gives the greatest, most intimate coverage for efficient heating and protection against heat loss. Model MJ is ideal where modifications are required for bottom or side outlets.

Element temperatures up to 842° F (450° C) can be easily attained. Vessels made of metal, porcelain, silica and other materials can be heated efficiently and safely with these flexible mantles.

Ordering Information (Please Specify Capacity) Catalog No. S 195-62 Electrothermal Model MJ Heating Mantle:			
For Flask Capacity (ml)	No. of Circuits	Watts at 115 v.	Price, Each
50	1	60	\$10.00
100	1	60	15.25
250	1	150	18.00
500	1	200	22.25
1,000	1	300	25.00
2,000	1	500	31.00
3,000	1	500	36.00
5,000	2	800	48.00
12,000	2	1,000	71.00





MANUFACTURERS & DISTRIBUTORS OF LABOPATORY SUPPLIES + EQUIPMENT + REAGENT & INDUSTRIAL CHEMICALS

6001 SOUTH KNOX AVE., CHICAGO 29, ILLINOIS, U.S.A. • Area Code 312, REliance 5-4700 IN THE EAST: SOUTH BUCKHOUT ST., IRVINGTON, NEW YORK • Area Code 914, LYric 1:8900 IN THE WEST: 2229 McGEE AVE., BERKELEY 3, CALIFORNIA • Area Code 415, Thornwall 5:3614

-A

acter and the intervention of personal judgment in the event none can be discovered." The typological approach has been employed in biology in many different ways. It is clear that when it forms the basis of a philosophical system seeking to establish the existence of nonmaterial "types" it would have little appeal for the modern biologist. However, a statistical average is a type, but this does not limit its usefulness, make its use old-fashioned, or align the statistician philosophically with Plato.

We must agree with Webster that increased objectivity and repeatability are great advantages of numerical taxonomy. Indeed, a discipline which does not achieve such goals to a reasonable degree does not merit the appellation "science." This, in part, is "what has been gained . . . for all the time and expense of data programming and computer analysis." (We might point out that numerical taxonomic computer programs are available at no charge, and that many major universities make computer time available to faculty members without charge if no funds are available. For many studies the cost of computer time would be much less than \$100.)

We must also point out that the techniques of numerical taxonomy hold promise of doing much more. For instance, it seems that developmental questions such as whether or not the system of phenetic relationships among larval beetles is congruent with that among adult beetles will finally be settled. As another example, the study of relationships of individuals (as in the much-maligned pilot study mentioned later) may permit the creation of a "population phenetics" which will add new dimensions to the study of microevolution. Perhaps the most fortunate aspect of numerical taxonomy is that it may open the door to a general taxonomy-one not restricted to classification of organisms but applicable to such diverse things as soils, automobiles, stellar systems, or any other collection of objects one desires to classify on the basis of any set of characteristics.

Webster's statement that phenons "may be 'rigged' at the proper percentage level to make them *approximate natural taxonomic* groups" (our italics) is very revealing. It is only possible to "rig" something when one has a preconceived idea of what it should be rigged to fit. Numerical taxonomists urge that groups be constructed with-



ANNOUNCES the 1963 PRICE LIST of HIGHLY PURIFIED

5'-RIBONUCLEOTIDES 5'-DEOXYNUCLEOTIDES COENZYMES DPN-ANALOGS NUCLEIC ACID and HYDROLYSIS PRODUCTS

Each year we take pride in adding new products to the growing list of Pabst fine biochemicals and lowering the cost of others. This year is no exception and many of our established products are now available at greatly reduced prices. Increased demand for our products have made these savings possible.

This new price list is another example of our continuing policy to prepare research biochemicals of the highest quality and offer them at uniform moderate prices.

If you would like a copy of our 1963 price list, please circle 241-1 on the *Science* Readers' Service Card or write direct to:

PABST LABORATORIES Division of Pabst Brewing Company 1037 W. McKinley Avenue MILWAUKEE 5, WISCONSIN

WORLD LEADER IN COENZYME-A

18 JANUARY 1963

out the use of intuition or of preconceived notions of phylogeny. Once groups are established they may be scrutinized in an attempt to discover the biological reasons for their existence. The basic data of the taxonomist are the similarities of the entities with which he deals. Preconceptions should not be permitted to bias the gathering of these data. At any rate, the phenon concept in numerical taxonomy is a device for avoiding long, meaningless discussions revolving around what status should be given to a group (is it a genus, subgenus, subfamily, and so on?). Phenon level, therefore, has nothing at all to do with the "naturalness" of groups, and the phenon level may be "rigged" as convenience dictates. Indeed, phenons could be established in a classification based on the frequency with which various letters appear in the scientific name of the organism-a system which almost all biologists would consider "unnatural" because of the extreme paucity of biological information that it would contain.

The contention by Webster (and Edwards) that Ehrlich judges the biological species concept on the basis of an analysis of 13 specimens is very difficult to understand. In the paper in question (3) all 94 genera of North American butterflies are discussed, as well as information from other animals and plants. The section dealing with the 13 specimens is introduced with the statement, "In order to test the hypothesis that numerical analysis will not cluster individuals by population, a pilot study was undertaken in which the similarities of an array of individual butterflies were evaluated." In other words, this pilot study was undertaken merely to discover whether individuals within a local population were all more similar to each other than they were to any individual from outside that population. As soon as an individual is discovered to be more similar to an individual from another population than to one from its own population the question is answered. Thirteen individuals were ample for a pilot test of this hypothesis, as the addition of more individuals to the study would merely have expanded the Omatrix, not altered any of the values in the original matrix. These individuals were not considered samples from a larger set of items, they were the units being compared.

Weighting of characters has been dealt with extensively in the literature



NEW HONEYWELL RECORDER MATCHES YOUR PRESENT INSTRUMENTATION

Our ads on the preceding two pages describe the use of the new Honeywell 8100 for medical data acquisition. We show you the instrument in its rack mount simply to emphasize that, in addition to its portability and handsome appearance in its metal case, the 8100 is just the right size (and weight) to fit conveniently into any standard instrumentation rack (size, $18" \ge 23" \ge 10"$; weight, 75 lbs.).

Write for brochure to Honeywell, Electronic Medical Systems, Denver 10, Colo.



(for example, 1, 4), and no logically defensible system of weighting has yet been advanced by the proponents of the idea that some characters are a priori "more important" or "more basic" than others. There is no reason why information from the genetic system cannot be used in numerical comparisons. However, at this stage it must be asked, In what way is degree of chromosome pairing "more important" than degree of hairiness? It is known that, in diverse organisms, the first may be controlled by a single gene (5), as may the latter. But inasmuch as single genes, as well as balanced polygenic systems, may affect gross morphological characters we find it hard to see how such evidence may be employed in a system of weighting. Are we to imply from Webster's letter that the "sound theoretical basis" for weighting of characters is the "experience of most competent systematics"?

Few taxonomists (classical or numerical) have attempted to remove the environmental component and deal only with the genetic variation in their material, for obvious practical reasons. Webster seems to feel that taxonomy ideally would deal only with additive genetic variance, but there is some theoretical question as to whether this would be desirable even if it were practical.

In no place do we suggest a "'non-Euclidean' theory of classification," although the idea may have merit. We have suggested that the present strong interlocking of taxonomy and evolutionary theory may inhibit the development of a "non-Euclidean" theory of evolution. This does not mean that we decry the existence of taxonomy or repudiate the present theory of evolution. We would not, however, wish to be placed in the position of having to affirm a "belief" in evolution.

Today biological evidence seems overwhelmingly in favor of the neo-Darwinist view of evolution. Therefore it is especially important for us continually to re-examine its most fundamental tenets. In our article we wished merely to point out that certain problems might be viewed in different perspective. We had no intention of retroactively supplanting one approach with another, even if that were in some way possible. When it appears that a road is blocked because the cart is before the horse, there are two possible courses of action. One is to blow up the horse and cart. The other is to send an exploring party up a nearby path while the road is being cleared. We wished to suggest the second alternative.

> PAUL EHRLICH RICHARD W. HOLM

Division of Systematic Biology, Stanford University, Stanford, California

References

R. R. Sokal, J. Theoret. Biol. 3, 230 (1962).
 H. V. Daly, Systematic Zool. 10, 176 (1961).
 P. R. Ehrlich, *ibid.* 10, 167 (1961).
 —, *ibid.* 7, 183 (1958); P. H. A. Sneath and R. R. Sokal, Nature 183, 855 (1962).
 H. Gaul, Z. Abst. Vererb. 86, 69 (1954).

A Grain of Skepticism

"What is really needed is more of that healthy skepticism which generates the key idea . . ." [Science 138, 75 (1962)].

Allow me to apply a germ of skepticism to this statement. At just what point did skepticism generate a key idea in the xenon tetrafluoride synthesis case?

I suspect that Neil Bartlett would report that skepticism as such had nothing to do with it. How was the key idea generated? It would be interesting—and surely it is important—to know.

BURNETT CROSS 170 East Hartsdale Avenue, Hartsdale, New York

... one must agree that "the essential ingredient in discovering xenon tetrafluoride was not money or equipment," but one must conclude that an essential ingredient was people—17 of them.

J. W. WETZEL Hotpoint Division, General Electric Company, Chicago, Illinois

... seventeen scientists signed their names to an article that required only "a few hours of effort and a germ of skepticism." I am sure that the salaries for 17 scientists come to a very much greater figure than many elaborate pieces of scientific equipment.

JULIUS H. COMROE, JR. San Francisco Medical Center, University of California

I suppose that I am not alone in feeling that the editorial "The need for skepticism" points a finger at me, along

NEW! Fiberglass "47" **FUME HOOD**



 RUGGED! Special heat-resistant polyester and fiberglass with smooth, porcelain-like exterior. Resistant to chemical attack. Will not support combustion.

HANDSOME! Smooth line design and special finish adds to the general appearance of your laboratory. Thin-wall design adds interior working space.

LIGHT! Superstructure is 47" x 29" x 60" high. Weight with blower only 175 pounds, making it a semiportable unit. Can be mounted on any conventional 47" base cabinet or table, wood or steel.

NON-CLOUDING SASH! Special, clear, resistant coating of $\frac{1}{4}$ " Plexiglass sash prevents clouding. Operates smoothly on fine counter-weight system.

QUIET, HIDDEN BLOWER! Powered by ¼ h.p., 115-volt motor, delivers 515 c.f.m. at ¼" s.p. mounted in boxlike rear recess. All wiring to vapor-tight light and to blower molded into hood body and to panel switches.

READY TO USE! Single 6-foot cord and plug connects all electrical equipment to any convenience outlet. No electrician necessary. Normally your lab handyman can install it.

