IN CHROMATOGRAPH ANALYSES . . . Virtually eliminate all labor and errors with the



INFOTRONICS **Digital Integrator-Recorder-Controller**

This CRS-1 (Control Recording Sys-tem) accepts the output signal of any common gas chromatograph and converts it to digital values of both occurrence time and relative area. Accurate digital values of peak times and areas are then recorded simultaneously in any of the common formats: digital printer or typewriter, punched IBM cards, punched paper tape, or magnetic tape using the INFOTRONICS R-1 digital magnetic recorder.

FEATURES AND SPECIFICATIONS

- Integration depends on curve slope, not amplitude, therefore even "side-1. lobes" are measured separately. 2. High speed integration response
- will process peaks spaced as closely as two seconds.
- 3. Peak time and peak area are recorded simultaneously. 4. High resolution — 5,000 counts per
- second give maximum area accuracy.
 Automatic area totalizing feature is
- available.
- 6. Works equally well with either fast or slow chromatographs. Input: Full scale ranges—1 mv, 10 mv,

100 mv, 1 volt. Integrator: Six digits standard, addi-

tional capacity available. Accuracy: 0.1% of full scale maximum error in integration conversion. No errors

in counting per se. Transistorized control circuit: Maximum

sensitivity to rate of change of detector signal is better than 0.1% of full scale range per second.

Output: Linear to 200% overload on input.



into being we would not only see these "shelters," we would undoubtedly before long be forced, under threat of imprisonment, to enter and remain in them during public participation drills. In a word, then, this would bring nuclear war home; way home. H.M., in a lesser point, argues that this may be good; perhaps it will alert people to the horror. Strange then, is it not, that precisely those newspapers and politicians undistinguished in their advocacy of peace are pushing "shelters" with something akin to panic.

Speaking of distinguished advocacy and of the arms race in general, which appears to be what H.M. wants to do, as a latter-day romantic I am easily stirred to passion, yet I find in all the issues of Science I have read in the past several years no clarion calls on any particular facet of the arms race. I do find bemoaning aplenty and cynical denigration of the efforts of some frequent (as in the editorial on the Report of the Committee on Science in the Promotion of Human Welfare).

As for the analogy H.M. presents in his final paragraph, I too, along with other irrational folk, would be vastly disheartened if, in addition to seeing the extensive lifeboat preparations, I knew that for some time this ship had been steering a course, with increasing speed, that would lead it to collision with another ship and that the "rational" passengers on both liners were doing nothing to force their captains to change course.

EUGENE KAELLIS

775 Avenue Z. Brooklyn, New York

General-Purpose Computer

The issue between Reitman and those he represents and certain statements in Computers and Common Sense which he says "are simply untrue" [Science 135, 718 (2 Mar. 1962)] can be summed up in Reitman's reiteration that "it [the General Problem Solver machine] does in fact exist, even as you and I." Since "you and I" certainly exist as something other than a program in a general-purpose computer (or the mind of God), the question, "Whose statements are untrue?" resolves itself.

To bring this point home, let me say that we are prepared to buy a general problem solving machine and are most anxious to secure the franchise for



• WIDE RANGE Visibility bath with BOTH mechanical refrigeration and heating! Provides constant temperature from minus 10°C to plus 65° C using 10" of liquid in a 16" uninsulated Pyrex jar. Using less liquid minus 20°C is obtainable.

• SENSITIVITY Mercury thermoregulator and a WACO Thyratrontube Relay controls operation of the compressor and heating until within plus or minus .01°C.

ALREADY USED FOR --- Viscosity vapor pressure and other physical data determination, organic syntheses, ASTM petroleum tests, etc. Also as COOLANT CIRCULATING SYS-TEM for spectrophotometers, refractometers, distillation condensers.

NO. E882 WACO LO-TEMP **REFRIGERATED BATH** with Pyrex jar 12" diameter: For 115 volt 50/50 cycle AC. \$390.00

• Other sizes and many accessories available to fit your needs. Please write for WACO BATH BULLETIN N-5 for complete information.

4525 W. DIVISION ST., CHICAGO 51 ILLINOIS

LABORATORY SUPPLIES AND CHEMICAL WILKENS-ANDERSON CO. Washington, which we think needs such machines very much. I hope Reitman can quote us a price and delivery date.

The definition of learning to which Reitman objects is based on Sherrington's physiological distinction between habit and reflex, a matter which has lately been discussed in the pages of *Science* [132, 555 (1960)].

I plead guilty to having missed the important scientific journal *En Passant*, published by the Pittsburgh Chess Club; but Reitman should also plead guilty to having missed or disregarded Richard Bellman's charge in *Operations Research* (May-June 1958) that his colleagues, Simon and Newell, have made claims which are both unscientific and irresponsible.

Finally, since Simon is dean of the Graduate School of Industrial Administration at which Reitman is employed, I question the scientific objectivity of the review. An attorney or judge in similar circumstances would disqualify himself, but I seem to have heard recently that American scientists are growing more and more insensitive to the problem of conflict-of-interest.

MORTIMER TAUBE

4827 Rugby Avenue, Bethesda, Maryland

Since Taube's letter provides four quite representative illustrations of the techniques he uses in his book to support his theses, it will be helpful to consider his comments in some detail.

On the face of it, one might suppose it sufficient to reply to his first two paragraphs by noting that the sense in which the General Problem Solving Program (GPS) exists is exactly the same as the sense in which the production scheduling, inventory control, and data processing programs of the business world exist—as sets of instructions for general-purpose digital computers. If Taube wants his own GPS, he has only to request the program from Newell, Shaw, or Simon, rent time on an IBM 7090, and run to his heart's content.

Actually, Taube's little discussion of the varieties of existence is something of a red herring, which he waves before us while he beats a quick retreat from the position he took in his book. There (pp. 59–60), far from admitting that GPS and the Chess Player exist as programs for a general-purpose computer (which is all Newell, Shaw, and Simon claim for them), Taube asked his readers to believe that "all the great



with the new NRC CRYSTAL GROWING FURNACE

The new NRC Model 2804 is a "Czochralski method" crystal furnace primarily designed for making single crystal ingots of silicon for semiconductor devices. However, it is easily adaptable for use with germanium and intermetallic compounds with reliability and consistently high quality.

Because the Czochralski method of growing single crystals is a critical process, it needs quality equipment with proven mechanical, thermodynamic and control features. Only from NRC can you buy a quality crystal growing unit with a proven record for high production and more profit. Buy the NRC Model 2804 with complete assurance that you can increase your production rate 100% and own the best equipment of its type available today.

UNIQUE FEATURES OF THE MODEL 2804

- Proven design for performance and reliability
- Inert gas or vacuum operation
- Precise temperature control
- Versatility of use
- Vibrationless mechanical motion-control
- Greater productivity and higher efficiency

Write today for a data sheet on the NRC Model 2804 Crystal Growing Furnace.



A Subsidiary of National Research Corp. 160 Charlemont Street, Dept. 25-E Newton 61, Massachusetts



This light, fully enclosing mantle is completely flexible. Flat or round bottomed flasks and flasks of wide tolerance can be efficiently heated with the same sized mantle.

Model MJ is particularly suitable for multiple necked flasks and gives the greatest, most intimate coverage for efficient heating and protection against heat loss. Model MJ is ideal where modifications are required for bottom or side outlets.

Element temperatures up to 842° F (450° C) can be easily attained. Vessels made of metal, porcelain, silica and other materials can be heated efficiently and safely with these flexible mantles.

Ordering Information (Please Specify Capacity) Catalog No. \$ 195-62 Electrothermal Model MJ Heating Mantles			
For Flask Capacity (ml)	No. of Circuits	Watts at 115 v.	Price, Each
50	1	60	\$10.00
100	1	60	15.25
250	1	150	18.00
500	1	200	22.25
1,000	1	300	25.00
2,000	1	500	31.00
3,000	1	500	36.00
5,000	2	800	48.00
12.000	2	1.000	71.00

LAPINE SCIENTIFIC COMPANY MANUFACTURERS & DISTRIBUTORS OF LABORATORY SUPPLIES + EQUIPMENT + REAGENT & INDUSTRIAL CHEMICALS 6001 SOUTH KNOX AVENUE, CHICAGO 29, ILLINOIS, U.S.A. • REliance 5-4700 IN THE EAST: SOUTH BUCKHOUT STREET, IRVINGTON-ON-HUDSON, NEW YORK • LYRic 1-8900 IN THE WEST: 2229 McGEE AVENUE, BERKELEY 3, CALIFORNIA • THornwall 5-3614 An Intelligence Amplifier TWISTCOCK CONNECTOR ... for Research Scientists **PRECISION ENGINEERED** for CHEMICAL LABORATORIES For the busy scientist, enginer, teacher, business man or student who has to keep basic information on file for use in a variety of categories, the Geniac PMI (Portable Memory Y-tent) is specially designed. Information retrieval system is personal use or small card files (from 1900-10,000) with abstracts, original articles or information are usually cumbersome, expensive and tot of the question for small budgets. But our PMI is a low cost information retrieval system that is a fast or faster than much more expensive units.
 Low initial case on the cost of the cost of the system that is a fast or faster than much more expensive on the system of the system of the system of the system of the system in the system of the system in the system of the system The all-polyethylene Pioneer Twistcock is both a STOPCOCK and quick DISCONNECT for flexible tubing. Twist 90° and it's on ... twist 90° and it's off. Seals against 30 pounds of pressure when applied to male end. Tubing connections taper 3%" to 1/4". Made of unbreakable, corrosion-resistant, easily - cleaned polyethylene. Functions best where fast, sure cutoffs are required. \$32.40 case (72) Pioneer Plastics, Inc. is the manufacturing leader in plastic laboratory apparatus. Pioneer products have proven their economy and practicability in chemical laboratories through the world for more than 7 vers WRITE FOR FREE CATALOG TODAY ENGINEERED PLASTIC ER A S T I **C**S

Electrothermal

Send check or money order to Dept. SC-52B or telephone OR-4-3720

OLIVER GARFIELD CO., INC.

York 3, N. Y.

17 St. Marks Place

mechanical brains, translating machines, learning-machines, chess-playing machines, perceiving machines, etc., accounts of which fill our press, owe their 'reality' to a failure to use the subjunctive mood. The game is played as follows: First, it is asserted that except for trivial engineering details, a program for a machine is equivalent to a machine. The flow chart for a program is equated to a program. And finally, the statement that a flow chart could be written for a nonexistent program for a nonexistent machine establishes the existence of the machine. In just this way . . . Simon, Shaw, and Newell's 'General Problem Solver,' and many other nonexistent devices have been named in the literature and are referred to as though they existed."

In my review I noted that Taube simply denied the existence of these and many other running programs which disproved his charges. The citation given above demonstrates this. Since Taube now apparently admits the existence of these programs, it seems reasonable to suggest that he might reexamine his previous conclusions about the status of research on artificial intelligence.

Taube's third paragraph—a good example, incidentally, of the "Emperor's new clothes" technique he outlines in his book (p. 120)-is perhaps the most disingenuous of the five. The reader should consult the reference Taube cites to substantiate the acceptance he claims for his definition of learning. It consists of exactly one paragraph in, of all things, still another letter to the editor of Science from Taube. Better yet, even this one paragraph contains no reference to learning as a "change from conscious to unconscious (habitual) activity to attain a desired goal," or to anything remotely related to this definition. The word conscious, the heart of Taube's definitional distinction between human and computer learning, is nowhere to be found in the letter.

The key to Taube's fourth paragraph, as is the case with the third, again is to be found in what he neglects to say. Bellman is protesting four predictions by Simon and Newell of developments they anticipate over a 10-year period. Nowhere in his note does he suggest, as Taube does, that GPS or the chessplaying program "owe their 'reality' to a failure to use the subjunctive mood," or that Newell, Shaw, and Simon are in any way claiming to have done more than they actually have. This distinction between what Bellman charges and

SCIENCE, VOL. 136

Dept. B, Box 8066 JACKSONVILLE 11, FLORIDA

what Taube implies he charges is fundamental. It is only by ignoring such distinctions that Taube can ask his readers to believe that the whole field of artificial intelligence resembles nothing so much as a 19th-century hoax.

All in all, the first four paragraphs of his letter provide a fair sample of the ways in which Taube constructs arguments out of the appearances of evidence. They are worth some reflection when the reader of Computers and Common Sense encounters (p. 127) Taube's statement that "this book is soundly based on the maxim that 'Ye shall know the truth, and the truth shall make you free'; and on an abiding faith that the process of rational inquiry and the increase and diffusion of knowledge are the noblest ends of man." As for the fifth paragraph, in view of the foregoing discussion, I find it difficult to be moved by Taube's lament at the corrosion of my virtue by the conditions of my employment. For, despite his concern with the scientific objectivity of everyone else in this area, it seems rather evident that somehow or other he has pretty much lost sight of his own.

WALTER R. REITMAN Carnegie Institute of Technology, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania

Financing of Medical Care

for the Aged

I have just finished reading the news item entitled "Medical care: changes in the political terrain" [Science 135, 90 (12 Jan. 1962)].

At the bottom of column 2 is a sentence which states, "Last week, the Hospital Association's House of Delegates voted to approve the Social Security financing of care for the elderly, provided that the program would be administered through Blue Cross."

This statement is not accurate. In a statement of "Actions Taken-January 4, 1962-in Chicago, Illinois" by the American Hospital Association House of Delegates and by Blue Cross Association Member Plans, point 3 under the heading "American Hospital Association House of Delegates" reads as follows: "We recognize that government assistance is necessary to effectively implement this national Blue Cross proposal in order to enable many retired aged persons to purchase this health protection through the voluntary



New OPTICAL PROJECTION BALANCE Offers All These Features

OPTICAL PROJECTION

OF WEIGHT Easy reading: Sharp image with high deof illumination produced by high gree quality optics with coated first surface mirrors.

TRUE WEIGHT

Even when moved out of level . . . without being rezeroed.

WEIGHT LOADING

Weight loading knobs on both sides for easy right or left-hand operation. Weighing by substitution to 1000 grams. Fast weight reading achieved by turning of knob, which removes weights in 100 gram increments up to 1 kilogram.

UNLIMITED TARE RANGE

Taring through a 125 gram range with built-in knob. By adding weights to the second pan the balance can be made to tare throughout its 2 kilogram capacity.

NO KNIFE EDGES TO BECOME DULL

Practically one-piece construction operates even in severely corrosive or dust-laden SPECIFICATIONS:

atmospheres where maintenance costs would be prohibitive for ordinary "knifeedge" balances.

OIL DAMPER SPEEDS WEIGHING

With no friction to overcome or build up, the silicone fluid dash pot is adjusted to attain the rest point at once, and to prevent undue oscillations.

PROVEN ACCURACY

Using a testing device, continuous weighings were made 24 hours daily for 6 months. After 1,750,000 operations, the Torsion mechanism still had its original sensitivity and accuracy.

RUGGED DESIGN

Air currents and temperature changes in normal plant and laboratory atmospheres have little or no effect on accuracy. Polypropylene top cover is inert to most chemicals. Epoxy enamel finish, extremely resistant to corrosion and abrasion. Quick, convenient interchange with many

different styles of commodity pans and containers with tared weights.

Division of Optical Scale a. .0.1 q. ...0-900 g. TareConveniently located tare knob.Stainless Steel, 9" diameter commodity pan. Pans

 Damper
 Silicone fluid dash pot for fast damping.

 Voltage
 110-115V. A. C. (other voltages on special order).

 Dimensions
 12%" wide x 16½" long x 7½" high.

TORSION OPTICAL PROJECTION BALANCE-Model PL-2 \$425.00 (including special 1 Kg weight) Cat. No. \$18172 SHTIF STANDARD SCIE LABORATORY

Supply Corp. NEW YORK 3, N.Y

REAGENTS

AND